### INTERPRETING SCRIPTURES IN JUDAISM, CHRISTIANITY AND ISLAM

This comparative study traces Jewish, Christian, and Muslim scriptural interpretation from antiquity to modernity, with special emphasis on the pivotal medieval period. It focuses on three areas: responses in the different faith traditions to tensions created by the need to transplant scriptures into new cultural and linguistic contexts; changing conceptions of the literal sense and its importance vis-à-vis non-literal senses, such as the figurative, spiritual, and midrashic; and ways in which classical rhetoric and poetics informed – or were resisted in – interpretation. Concentrating on points of intersection, the authors bring to light previously hidden aspects of methods and approaches in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam. This volume opens new avenues for interdisciplinary analysis and will benefit scholars and students of biblical studies, religious studies, medieval studies, Islamic studies, Jewish studies, comparative religions, and theory of interpretation.

MORDECHAI Z. COHEN is Professor of Bible and Associate Dean of the Bernard Revel Graduate School of Jewish Studies at Yeshiva University. His publications include *Three Approaches to Biblical Metaphor: From Abraham Ibn Ezra and Maimonides to David Kimhi* and *Opening the Gates of Interpretation: Maimonides' Biblical Hermeneutics in Light of His Geonic-Andalusian Heritage and Muslim Milieu.* 

ADELE BERLIN is Robert H. Smith Professor of Hebrew Bible Emerita in the Department of English and the Jewish Studies Program at the University of Maryland. She is the author of seven books, including *Poetics and Interpretation of Biblical Narrative, The Dynamics of Biblical Parallelism*, and commentaries on Zephaniah, Esther, and Lamentations.

# INTERPRETING SCRIPTURES IN JUDAISM, CHRISTIANITY AND ISLAM

**Overlapping** Inquiries

EDITED BY

MORDECHAI Z. COHEN AND ADELE BERLIN

with the assistance of

MEIR M. BAR-ASHER, RITA COPELAND, AND JON WHITMAN







University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781107065680

© Cambridge University Press 2016

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2016

Printed in the United Kingdom by Clays, St Ives plc

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library

Library of Congress Cataloguing in Publication data

Interpreting scriptures in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam : overlapping inquiries / edited by

Mordechai Z. Cohen and Adele Berlin ; with the assistance of Meir M. Bar-Asher, Rita Copeland, and Jon Whitman.

pages cm

Includes bibliographical references and index.

18вн 978-1-107-06568-0 (Hardback)

I. Sacred books-History and criticism. 2. Judaism. 3. Christianity. 4. Islam. I. Cohen,

Mordechai Z., editor.

BL71.159 2015

208′.2–dc23 2015032421

ISBN 978-I-107-06568-0 Hardback

Additional resources for this publication at www.yu.edu/revel/interpreting-scriptures

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication, and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain,

accurate or appropriate.

### Contents

	550	<i>page</i> vii
	otes on contributors	ix
	knowledgments	xiii
Lis	st of abbreviations	XV
	<i>troduction</i> : Intersecting encounters with scriptures in three faiths	S I
РА	RT I SCRIPTURAL TEXTS IN CHANGING CONTEXTS	23
I	The emergence of biblical interpretation in antiquity <i>James L. Kugel</i>	25
2	Disclosing the mystery: the hermeneutics of typology in Syriac exegesis <i>Sidney H. Griffith</i>	46
3	"We have made it an Arabic Qur'an": the permissibility of translating scripture in Islam in contrast with Judaism and Christianity <i>Meir M. Bar-Asher</i>	65
4	The unmoved mover begins to move: literary and artistic renderings of the Christian Bible <i>Piero Boitani</i>	84
5	Deconstructing the dual Torah: a Jewish response to the Muslim model of scripture <i>Meira Polliack</i>	113

v

vi	Contents	
РА	RT II CONCEPTIONS OF THE LITERAL SENSE	131
6	The literal sense of Christian scripture: redefinition and revolution <i>Jon Whitman</i>	133
7	Figuring the letter: making sense of <i>sensus litteralis</i> in late-medieval Christian exegesis <i>Alastair J. Minnis</i>	159
8	Conceptions of the literal sense ( <i>ẓāhir, ḥaqīqa</i> ) in Muslim interpretive thought <i>Robert M. Gleave</i>	183
9	Emergence of the rule of <i>peshat</i> in medieval Jewish Bible exegesise Mordechai Z. Cohen	5 204
РА	RT III RHETORIC AND THE POETICS OF READING	225
ю	Poetry and commentary in the medieval school of Rheims: reading Virgil, reading David <i>A. B. Kraebel</i>	227
II	On the figurative ( <i>majāz</i> ) in Muslim interpretation and legal hermeneutics <i>Wolfhart P. Heinrichs</i>	249
12	Words of eloquence: rhetoric and poetics in Jewish <i>Bible</i> exegesis in its Muslim and Christian contexts <i>Mordechai Z. Cohen</i>	266
13	Classical rhetoric and medieval scriptural interpretation in the Latin West <i>Rita Copeland</i>	285
14	Robert Lowth's biblical poetics and romantic theory <i>Stephen Prickett</i>	309
15	From scripture to literature: modern ways of reading the Bible <i>Adele Berlin</i>	326
	bliography	336
	meral index	371
Scr	riptural index	379

# Figures

4 <b>.</b> I	Tapiz de la Creación (Creation Tapestry), Girona	
	Cathedral, c. 1100.	bage 89
4.2	Tapiz de la Creación, restored by el Centro de Restauración	
	de Bienes Muebles, 2012.	90
4.3	Monreale Cathedral, nave, south wall, Creation mosaics,	
	late 12 <sup>th</sup> century, detail of Light and Angels.	93
4.4	Monreale Cathedral, nave, south wall, Creation mosaics,	
	late 12 <sup>th</sup> century, the Beginning.	94
4.5	San Clemente, Rome, apse of upper church, mosaic, c. 1130.	96
4.6	San Clemente, Rome, apse of upper church, mosaic, detail	
	of the Hand of God.	97
4.7	San Marco, Venice, narthex, mosaic, 1215–35, dome with	
	Genesis scenes.	98
4.8	Chartres Cathedral, north transept, portal sculpture,	
	1194–1230, first day of Creation.	100
4.9	Chartres Cathedral, north transept, rose window, stained glass	s,
	1230–35, Christ creates the cosmos.	IOI
4.10		m
	Paradise, tempera and gold on wood, 1445, Metropolitan	
	Museum of Art, New York (Robert Lehman Collection, 1975	). 106
4 <b>.</b> II	0	
	Stanza dell'Incendio di Borgo, Vatican.	107
4.12	Raphael, The Prime Mover, fresco, 1509–11, ceiling of the	
	Stanza della Segnatura, Vatican.	108
4.13	Michelangelo, Separation of Light and Darkness, fresco,	
	1512, ceiling of the Sistine Chapel, Vatican.	109
4 <b>.</b> 14	Michelangelo, Separation of Water and Dry Land, fresco,	
	1512, ceiling of the Sistine Chapel, Vatican.	IIO
4.15	Michelangelo, Creation of Sun, Moon, and Planets, fresco,	
	1512, ceiling of the Sistine Chapel, Vatican.	III

viii

List of figures

#### Plate in Chapter 10

Rheims, Bibliothèque municipale, MS 133, f. 4v, gloss on Psalms 2:13–3:4.

The figures appearing in this volume in black and white can be viewed in full color at www.yu.edu/revel/interpreting-scriptures

Figure 4.1 also appears in full color on the back jacket cover.

236

### Notes on contributors

- Meir M. Bar-Asher is Max Schloessinger Professor of Islamic Studies and the Chair of the Department of Arabic Language and Literature at The Hebrew University of Jerusalem. His research interests include the Qur'an and its exegesis, Muslim sectarianism, and the interaction between Judaism and Islam. Among his published works are *Scripture and Exegesis in Early Imāmī-Shiism* (1999) and *The Nuṣayrī-ʿAlawī religion: an enquiry into its theology and liturgy* (2002, with Aryeh Kofsky).
- Adele Berlin is Robert H. Smith Professor of Hebrew Bible Emerita in the Department of English and the Jewish Studies Program at University of Maryland. Her research interests include literary study of the Bible, inner-biblical and ancient Jewish interpretation, and modern interpretive strategies. Among her publications are *Poetics and Interpretation of Biblical Narrative* (1983), *The Dynamics of Biblical Parallelism* (1985), and *The JPS Bible Commentary: Esther* (2001).
- Piero Boitani is Professor of Comparative Literature and Head of the Department of Modern Languages, Literatures and Cultures at the University of Rome, "La Sapienza." His research interests include the Bible and its rewritings in European literature and art; Dante, Boccaccio, and Chaucer; and thirteenth- and fourteenth-century English narrative. Among his published works are *The Bible and Its Rewritings* (1999), *The Cambridge Chaucer Companion* (1986, edited with Jill Mann), and *English medieval narrative in the thirteenth and fourteenth centuries* (1982).
- Mordechai Z. Cohen is Professor of Bible and Associate Dean of the Bernard Revel Graduate School of Jewish Studies, Yeshiva University. His research interests include medieval Jewish Bible interpretation in Christian and Muslim cultural contexts; connections with Arabic

х

Notes on contributors

poetics and Hebrew poetry; medieval Jewish legal hermeneutics and Muslim jurisprudence; and modern literary approaches to the Bible. Among his published works are *Three Approaches to Biblical Metaphor: From Abraham Ibn Ezra and Maimonides to David Kimhi* (2003) and *Opening the Gates of Interpretation: Maimonides' Biblical Hermeneutics in Light of His Geonic-Andalusian Heritage and Muslim Milieu* (2011).

- Rita Copeland is Sheli Z. and Burton X. Rosenberg Professor of Humanities at the University of Pennsylvania, and a member of the departments of Classical Studies and English. Her research interests include medieval literary history, rhetoric, and hermeneutics as applied to Bible and literary culture, Latin receptions of Greek and Arabic learning, and scriptural interpretation among heretical groups (Wycliffites / Lollards). Among her publications are *Rhetoric*, *Hermeneutics, and Translation in the Middle Ages* (1991), *The Cambridge Companion to Allegory* (2010, edited with Peter T. Struck), and *Medieval Grammar and Rhetoric: Language Arts and Literary Theory, AD 300–1475* (2009, with Ineke Sluiter).
- Robert M. Gleave is Professor of Islamic and Arabic Studies at the University of Exeter. His research interests include Islamic Law and legal theory (*usūl al-fiqh*); Muslim theories of interpretation; Shi'ite legal, political, and hermeneutical theory; medieval Arabic literature and literary theory. Among his published books are *Scripturalist Islam: The History and Doctrines of the Akhbari School of Shii Thought* (2007) and *Islam and Literalism: Literal Meaning and Interpretation in Islamic Legal Theory* (2012).
- Sidney H. Griffith is Ordinary Professor Emeritus of Semitic Languages at The Catholic University of America. His research interests include Syriac Christian Bible interpretation, early Arabic Bible translations, and their influences on the Qur'an and its interpretation. Among his publications are *Faith Adoring the Mystery Reading the Bible with St. Ephraem the Syrian* (1997), *The Church in the Shadow of the Mosque: Christians and Muslims in the World of Islam* (2008), and *The Bible in Arabic: The Scriptures of the "People of the Book" in the Language of Islam* (2013).
- <sup>†</sup>Wolfhart P. Heinrichs was James Richard Jewett Professor of Arabic at Harvard University. His research interests were medieval Arabic literary theory, Islamic legal hermeneutics, the notion of *majâz* ("figurative speech") in Arabic poetics and qur'anic hermeneutics, and Neo-

Notes on contributors

xi

Aramaic. Among his books are *Arabische Dichtung und griechische Poetik: Hāzim al-Qartāğannīs Grundlegung d. Poetik mit Hilfe aristotel Begriffe* (1969), *The Hand of the Northwind: Opinions on Metaphor and the Early Meaning of Istiʿāra in Arabic Poetics* (1977), and *Studies in Neo-Aramaic* (1990).

- A. B. Kraebel is Assistant Professor of English at Trinity University. His research focuses on medieval interpretation of the Bible and classical Latin literature, as well as book history and manuscript studies. He has published an edition of *The Sermons of William of Newburgh* (2010), and he is currently preparing a monograph, tentatively entitled *The Appeal of the Academic: Biblical Commentary and Translation in Late Medieval England*.
- James L. Kugel is Professor of Bible at Bar-Ilan University and Director of the Institute for the History of the Jewish Bible at Bar-Ilan University. His research interests include the "interpreted" Bible, as reflected in the Dead Sea Scrolls, rabbinic literature, New Testament, and Qur'an; liturgical uses of Scripture; biblical poetry and the notion of parallelism as interpreted from ancient to modern times. Among his publications are *The Idea of Biblical Poetry: Parallelism and Its History* (1981); *The Bible as It Was* (1997), and *How to Read the Bible: A Guide to Scripture, Then and Now* (2007).
- Alastair J. Minnis is Douglas Tracy Smith Professor of English at Yale University. His research interests include medieval literary theory and notions of authorship; medieval study of the Bible and classical literature; conceptions of Scripture's multiple senses; scholasticism and its vernacular intersections. Among his published writings are *Medieval Holy Women in the Christian Tradition C. 1100-C. 1500* (2010; edited with Rosalynn Voaden); *Translations of Authority in Medieval English Literature: Valuing the Vernacular* (2009); and *Medieval Theory of Authorship: Scholastic Literary Attitudes in the Later Middle Ages* (1984).
- Meira Polliack is Associate Professor of Biblical Studies at Tel-Aviv University. Her research interests include medieval Bible exegesis and translation, Karaism, Judaeo-Arabic Literature, and Judaeo-Arabic sources in the Cairo Genizah; reception history and interpretation of the Bible as a central feature of the cultural history of the Jews of the medieval Islamic world. She has written *The Karaite Tradition of Arabic Bible Translation: A Linguistic and Exegetical Study of Karaite Translations of the Pentateuch from the Tenth and Eleventh Centuries*

xii

Notes on contributors

C.E. (1997) and edited Karaite Judaism: A Guide to Its History and Literary Sources (2003).

- Stephen Prickett is Regius Professor Emeritus of English Language and Literature, University of Glasgow, and Honorary Professor of the University of Kent at Canterbury. His research interests include literature, theology, and history of biblical interpretation in the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries; and romantic appropriations of scripture. Among his publications are *Words and the Word: Language, Poetics, and Biblical Interpretation* (1986); *Origins of Narrative: The Romantic Appropriation of the Bible* (1996); and *Modernity and the Reinvention of Tradition: Backing into the Future* (2009).
- Jon Whitman is Associate Professor in the Department of English of The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, where for many years he also served as Director of The Center for Literary Studies. His research interests include interpretive and literary allegory; diverse conceptions of the "literal" sense; changing approaches to relations between Scripture and literature; the development of medieval romance; imaginative structures of history and time; and critical theory from antiquity to the modern period. He is the author of *Allegory: The Dynamics of an Ancient and Medieval Technique* (1987) and the editor of *Interpretation and Allegory: Antiquity to the Modern Period* (2000) and *Romance and History: Imagining Time from the Medieval to the Early Modern Period* (2015).

# Acknowledgments

This volume is the result of the collaborative research of a fourteenmember team of scholars - each represented within its pages - in a project entitled "Encountering Scripture in Overlapping Cultures: Early Jewish, Christian and Muslim Strategies of Reading and Their Contemporary Implications." First conceived in 2007, the project was designed initially by Mordechai Cohen and Jon Whitman, soon joined by Adele Berlin and Meir Bar-Asher. Eventually, the full team crystallized and convened as a research group directed by Mordechai Cohen and Meir Bar-Asher at the Israel Institute for Advanced Studies (IIAS) in Jerusalem from September 2010 until February 2011. We wish to acknowledge the IIAS, its then director Eliezer Rabinovici, associate director Lea Prawer, and the entire IIAS staff for supporting the research group, providing the uniquely suited setting for its collaborative inter-disciplinary scholarly activity. Special thanks to Netta Hazan, our dedicated research assistant, who ably and cheerfully facilitated the work of our group members during their stay in Ierusalem.

The editors wish to acknowledge each of the authors who contributed the chapters that make up this volume. In addition to their own studies, as members of the research group they offered valuable new perspectives on the work of their colleagues. These additional perspectives are represented in the general introduction and prefaces to each chapter appearing in the volume.

A special follow-up conference hosted by the IIAS in Jerusalem in July 2012, attended by a large part of the group, enabled us to integrate the chapters of this volume into a cohesive study that demonstrates the importance of investigating the interpretation of scriptures in Judaism, Christianity, and Islam comparatively. We are particularly grateful to Rita Copeland for the central role she played in planning and shaping the sessions of the conference, which contributed to its success.

xiv

#### Acknowledgments

In the course of editing this volume, we benefited from the generous guidance of Meir Bar-Asher, Rita Copeland, and Jon Whitman, who are listed as assisting editors. Professor Whitman's scholarly vision is reflected in key formulations of the introduction, and he made important suggestions about the arrangement of the volume and the logical flow of its chapters. Professor Bar-Asher offered his expertise in reviewing all of the material dealing with Arabic and Muslim interpretation. Professor Copeland advised on subjects relating to the Latin Christian tradition as well as rhetoric and poetics.

We note with sadness the passing of Wolfhart Heinrichs in January 2014. Despite his final illness, he made every effort to submit his chapter for the volume, which we hope will be a fitting memorial to this great scholar of Islam. We are most grateful to Robert Gleave, who drew upon his expert knowledge of Muslim legal hermeneutics to supply the primary references for Professor Heinrichs' chapter.

The editors acknowledge the dedicated work of Shifra Schapiro who proofread the entire manuscript, offering valuable suggestions to enhance its accuracy, readability, and stylistic consistency. Shifra also worked assiduously to insure the completeness, usefulness, and consistency of the bibliography and references, and assisted in preparing the indices.

Permissions to publish the sixteen figures (illustrations) in this volume were acquired thanks to the generous support provided by Michal Linial, current director of the IIAS. The website featuring them in full color together with further background on the collaborative research project from which this book emerged was designed by Malka Lebovic-Alweis, with graphics provided by visual marketing consultant Judah S. Harris. See http://yu.edu/revel/cohen-berlin-interpreting-scriptures/

We also express our gratitude to Laura Morris of Cambridge University Press who invited us to publish this volume, and to Alexandra Poreda, Helen Francis, and Isabella Vitti, who guided us through the publication process.

#### Mordechai Cohen and Adele Berlin

Jerusalem, August 2014

# Abbreviations

1–2 Chr	= I–2 Chronicles
1–2 Cor	= I–2 Corinthians
1–2 Kgs	= 1–2 Kings
1–2 Sam	= I–2 Samuel
Aen.	= Aeneid
Ar.	= Arabic
Ь.	= Babylonian Talmud
с.	= circa
CSEL	= Corpus scriptorum ecclesiasticorum latinorum. Ed. Iosephi
	Zycha, et. al. Vienna: F. Tempsky, 1866–
Dan	= Daniel
Deut	= Deuteronomy
DSD	= Dead Sea Discoveries
EI	= <i>Encyclopaedia of Islam: New Edition.</i> Ed. H. A. R. Gibb et al. Leiden: Brill, 1960.
Exod	= Exodus
Gal	= Galatians
Gan	= Galatians = Genesis
HBOT	
IIDOI	= Hebrew Bible / Old Testament: The History of its
	Interpretation. Volume I/I: Antiquity. Ed. Magne Sæbø,
	Menahem Haran and Chris Brekelmans. Göttingen:
	Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 1996. Vol. I/2, <i>The Middle</i>
	Ages. Ed. Magne Sæbø, Menahem Haran, and Chris Brakalmans, Cöttingen: Vandenbaeck and Ruprecht
	Brekelmans. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 2000. Vol. II: <i>From the Renaissance to the Enlightenment</i> .
	Ed. Magne Sæbø, Michael A. Fishbane, and Jean-Louis
	Ska. Göttingen: Vandenhoeck and Ruprecht, 2008.
Heb.	= Hebrew
Hos	= Hosea
Isa	= Isaiah
154	- 15a1a11

xvi	List of abbreviations
j.	= Jerusalem Talmud
JAOS	= Journal of the American Oriental Society
Jer	= Jeremiah
JQR	= Jewish Quarterly Review
Jub.	= Jubilees
Judg	= Judges
Lev	= Leviticus
m.	= Mishnah
Matt	= Matthew
MT	= Masoretic Text
Num	= Numbers
PEPP	= Greene, Roland, and Stephen Cushman, eds. The
	Princeton Encyclopedia of Poetry and Poetics. 4th ed.
	Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2012.
PL	= Patrologia Latina (Patrologia Cursus Completus: Series
	Latina). 221 vols. Ed. Jaques Paul Migne. Paris: Migne,
	1844–1864. (References are given by volume and numbered
	columns.)
Prov	= Proverbs
Ps	= Psalms
Q.	= Qur'an
Rom	= Romans
Song	= Song of Songs
S.V.	= sub verbo
t.	= Tosefta
TDOT	<i>= Theological Dictionary of the Old Testament</i> . Ed. G. J.
	Botterweck and H. Ringgren, rev. edn. Grand Rapids, MI,
	Eerdmans, 1974.
TDNT	= Theological Dictionary of the New Testament. Ed. Gerhard
	Kittel, Grand Rapids, MI, Eerdmans, 1964.
Zech	= Zechariah