

The Great Ideas

Mortimer Adler

958 Pages including Index

Bullets preceded by JNC are comments by Infonomics

Foreward

- Some think the 20th century is superior to its predecessors in all the efforts of the human mind. But the contributions of the 20th century cannot be understood without seeing it in the light of the greater contribution made in earlier epochs.
- The essays have been reproduced from two volumes entitled *The Syntopicon*, An Index to the Great Ideas, two volumes in a set entitled *Great Books of the Western World*.
- These ideas were derived from an extreme close analysis of 434 works by 73 authors from Homer to the 20th century. The works analyzed were later published as Great Books of the Western World.
- Appearances of the Greats in the 102 Great Ideas:

Homer	51	Aquinas	102
Herodotus	71	Dante	84
Plato	100	Shakespeare	79
Aristotle	102	Montaigne	90
Plutarch	79	Bacon	97
Gibbon	88	Locke	98
Hegel	97	Tolstoy	96
Darwin	71	Marx	71
Freud	71		
Augustine	97	Spinoza	79

- Twentieth century writers are cited in fewer than half of the 102 great ideas.

AAA What is an Idea?

- In common speech, idea connotes the subjective contents of our own minds.
- In order for a discussion between two or more persons to occur, they must discuss something that is a common object of their conjoined apprehension. They do not have a common object to discuss if each of them is speaking only of his own ideas in the subjective sense.
- Idea = object of thought.
- The great ideas are the most reducible elements. All others lead into them or subordinate to them. The 102 ideas are great because of their basic or fundamental character.
- Though 50 years have elapsed since the 102 great ideas were chosen, nothing that has happened in the last half-century, with the exception of “Equality”, that necessitates a single addition or change to the list. Equality, appears in the Inventory of Terms; it there refers to many topics under other ideas. New topics were added but not a single new idea.

- The Greek roots of Syntopicon mean “collection of topics.” It consists of 102 chapters, one for each chapter. It has the following five parts:
 1. An introductory essay, which is the book *The Great Ideas*
 2. An outline of topics
 3. A section entitled “References”, where passages are referenced to the Great Ideas
 4. A section entitled “Cross-References”, where passages are cross-referenced to relevant other passages
 5. A section entitled “Additional Readings”, good books but not great books
- The essays are arranged in alphabetical order purposely to avoid any notion of ranking.
- On reading the 102 essays one will find the ideas intellectually enlightening and practically useful.
- Syntopicon, first edition, published in 1952, written in 1946-1947
- Syntopicon, second edition, to accompany the second edition of the Great Books, written in 1988 and 1989, published in 1990.
- The actual writing of the essays (the first edition) took 26 months with no time off – seven days a week, no vacation or recesses. “I think it was the most arduous and demanding stint of writing that I have ever undertaken.

Why 102 Great Ideas?

- Why not more or less? The number is somewhat arbitrary. “At no time in all the eight years of work on the production of the Syntopicon was there an outcry on the part of the editorial staff that some idea other than the 102 we had chosen was needed to accommodate a large and significant body of Western thought that could not be subsumed under the various topics of the 102 ideas that we selected.”

How did Adler arrive at the Great Ideas?

- He re-read books by Plato, Machiavelli, Hobbes, Locke, Kant, Hegel, Tolstoy, etc. He discovered that he overlooked key concepts on his first readings.
- Resources used in compiling the great ideas:
 - 35 readers were trained
 - five years
 - 400,000 man-hours of reading
- A list of ideas was reduced to 500. Then, to 102, which represented the thoughts of 2,500 years. These 102 ideas are great because of their basic or fundamental character.
- Though 50 years have elapsed since the 102 great ideas were chosen, nothing that has happened in last half-century, with the exception of EQUALITY, necessitates a single addition or change to the list. “Equality” appears in the inventory of terms; it there refers to many topics under other ideas. New topics were added but not a single new idea.

My Comments

- Writing style of the ancients could not be opined as lucid.
- Clear amount of rambling; pedantic.
- Mostly quoting philosophers or expressing their thought.
- Many intriguing questions have been omitted.
- Remind the reader of inherit bias.

Angel

-

Animal

- The use, or even the exploitation of animals by man seems to be justified by the inferiority of the brute to the rational nature of man.
- Aristotle thinks animals exist for the sake of man: the tame for use and food; the wild for food, clothing, and various instruments.
- Plutarch: “we may extend our goodness and charity even to irrational creatures.”
- Marcus Aurelius: “As to animals which have no reason, and generally all things and objects, do thou, since thou hast reason and they have none, make use of them with a generous and liberal spirit.”
- JNC: Can we presume superiority over animals when our only vantage point is that of a human? That is, when you attempt to communicate with your pet and your pet does not respond, where does the fault lie? If man is so intelligent, why does he not know pet language?

Relation between instinct and intelligence in animals:

- Does instinct function in animals, as reason does in man, to meet the exigencies of life; or whether in both, though varying in degree, intelligence cooperates with instinct to solve the problems of adjustment to environment. Aquinas thinks animal behavior to be “predetermined by elaborate instinctive endowments.” Instinctive behavior, such as an animal’s flight from danger or its pursuit of food or a mate, involves sense perception of the objects of these actions, as well as feelings or emotions about them. To Aquinas, instinctive behavior is the exact opposite of action based upon free will. Such freedom, Aquinas holds, depends on reason’s ability to contemplate alternatives, to none of which is the human will bound by natural necessity. To Aquinas, reason serves man as instinct serves animal.
- Darwin, James, Freud attribute instinct to men as well as to animals and instinct behavior is influenced by intelligence and affected by memory and imagination, in animals as well as in men.
- JNC: To James, man has a greater variety of impulses than any lower animal but owing to his memory and power of reflection and inference, man learns from them.
- Like Montaigne, James cites anecdotes to show that animals learn from their experience.

- To James and similarly Darwin, the single greatest difference between man and animal is the deficiency of the animal to associate ideas by similarity. Consequently, human instincts are much more modified by learning and experience.
- Animals seemed to have intelligence in some proportion to the development of their sensitive powers, esp. their memory and imagination. But if we attribute the extraordinary performances of animals to their intelligence alone, rather than primarily to their instinct, then we are led to conclude with Montaigne that they possess not merely a sensitive intelligence, but a reasoning intellect. Montaigne asks, “Why does the spider thicken her web in one place and slacken it in another ... unless she has the power of reflection, and thought, and inference?”

Aristocracy

- Whereas in the past, the principles of Aristocracy always entered into the definition of the political ideal, now it is a mere subject of interest. Formerly it signified a form of govt, now it is used to name a special social class, that is one who deserves special political status or preeminence.

Nietzsche

- It is essential that aristocracy accept with good conscience the sacrifice of innumerable men who for its sake have to be suppressed and reduced to imperfect men, to slaves and instruments. Society should not exist for society but only as a foundation upon a select species is able to raise itself to higher task and to higher existence—that of superman.

Plato

- “the best thing of all is not that the law should rule, but that a man rule...”

Plato and Aristocracy

- Rank aristocracy and monarchy as the best form of govt.
- The govt of few or one is more efficient; synonymous with few is wealth, ability, virtue (the masses are poor, unqualified, nonvirtuous).

Tocqueville

- An aristocracy is infinitely more skillful in the science of legislation than democracy can ever be. Being master of itself, it is not subject to transitory impulses... It knows how to make the collective force of all its laws converge on one point at one time. A democracy is not like that; its laws are almost always defective or untimely. Therefore, the measures of democracy are more imperfect than those of an aristocracy.. but its aim is more beneficial.
- Machiavelli assumes it to be a generally accepted fact that the nobles wish to rule and oppress the people...and give vent to their ambitions. Montesquieu also recognizes its tendency to profit at the expense of the people.

- The strongest attack comes from J.S. Mill. He admits the merits of aristocracy but he claims that, whatever their abilities, such governments were essentially bureaucracies and the dignity and estimation of their ruling members were quite different things from the prosperity or happiness of the general body of their citizens, and were often wholly incompatible with it. Their actions were frequently sinister. They assume an endless variety of unjust privileges, sometimes benefitting their pockets at the expense of the people, sometimes merely tending to exalt them above others, or, what is the same thing as to degrade others below themselves. Orwell, in *Animal Farm*, sums it up: “All animals are equal, but some animals are more equal than others.”
- Aristocracy seems to be unrealized in practice because of the reluctance of the best to assume the burdens of public office.

Writers of The Federalist

- Frequently appeal to principles that are aristocratic in nature. Seem to think as Montesquieu, “most citizens have sufficient ability to choose, though unqualified to be chosen [to administer]...”

Mill

- The representative knows better than his constituents what is for their good.

Thucydides

- Ordinary men usually manage public affairs better than the gifted because the latter are always wanting to appear wiser than the laws.

Herodotus

- It seems easier to deceive the multitude than one man.

Aristotle

- A multitude is a better judge of more things than any individual yet he prefers gov't. by the one or the few who are eminent in wisdom or virtue.

Jefferson

- There is a natural aristocracy among men. Natural because of virtue and talents. There is also an artificial aristocracy founded on wealth and birth. The artificial aristocracy is a mischievous ingredient in gov't and provision should be made to prevent its ascendancy.

Art

- The current disposition is to use the word in a narrow sense: with beauty; yet its historical connections with utility and knowledge is more pervasive.
- Adam Smith refers to the craftsman as artist. Art includes “arts and crafts”, the production of useful things; liberal arts, skills of mind; Rousseau spoke of metallurgy and agriculture were the two arts which produced the advance from primitive to civilized form.
- The fine arts and the speculative sciences complete human life. They are not necessary ... They are the dedication of human leisure ... The leisure without which they neither could come into being nor prosper ...

- Art is a transformation produced not merely by the hand of man, but by his thought or knowledge
- The more generic meaning of art seems to be that of art as cause rather than as effect. ... art seems to be primarily in the mind and work of the cobbler or sculptor and only derivatively in the objects produced.
- Art is the knowledge of **how** to make something or to obtain a desired effect.
- Science is knowledge that something **is** the case.
- Seeing it also as the root of “artifice” and “artificial” we realize that art is distinguished from and sometimes even opposed to nature.
- Socrates refers to the cobbler, the weaver, the physician as artist. Utility, not just beauty, was essential then.
- Adler: they are not necessary except perhaps for the good life. They would not exist without leisure.
- Art is knowledge of how to do something.
- Science is knowledge that something is.
- An art can be learned by practice; skill can be formed by repeated acts. But the teacher cannot direct the learning without setting rules for his pupils to follow; and if the truth or intelligibility of the rules is questioned, the answers will come from the science underlying the art. [by rule it is meant a standard, by which others will judge their art].
- The scientific method is the art of getting scientific knowledge. [the argument is that science needs art].
- According to theologians, God’s making is absolutely creative.

Censorship or political regulation

- Plato: all poetry should be banned from the state except hymns to the gods and praises of good men. Plato presupposes that poetry has an influence on the citizen; concluding the rights of the artist should be directed for the greater good of the community.

Bacon

- If science is the indispensable of art and consists in a knowledge of causes, art in Bacon’s view is the whole fruit of science, for it applies THAT knowledge to the production of effects. Art is the necessary consequence of science.

Tolstoy

- The arts serve primarily as a medium of spirited communication, helping to create the ties of human brotherhood.

Freud

- It is emotion or subconscious expression, rather than imitation or communication, which is the deepest spring of art; the poet or artist forces us to become aware of our inner selves in which the same impulses are still extant even though they are suppressed.
- JNC: for the most part, this subject was boring, tiresome, petty

Astronomy and Cosmology

Beauty

Being

- Whatever is said not to be in one sense of being, can always be said to be in another of its senses.
- Even things which do not really exist have being insofar as they are objects of thought — things remembered which once existed, things conceivable which have the possibility of being, things imaginary which have being at least in the mind that thinks them.
- Paradox: even nothing is something, for before we can say “nonbeing is not” we must be able to say “nonbeing is.” Nothing is at least an object of thought.
- When every other trait peculiar to a thing is removed, its being remains — the fact that it is in some sense. To Hegel, it is the emptiest of terms precisely because it is the most common. It signifies the very least that can be thought of anything.
- It is a historical accident that this inquiry concerning being came to be called metaphysics. That is the name which, according to legend, the ancient editors gave to a collection of writings in which Aristotle pursued this inquiry. Since they came after the books on physics, they were called metaphysics on the supposition that Aristotle intended the discussion of being to follow his treatise on change and motion. If one were to invent a word to describe the science of being, it would be ontology, not metaphysics or even theology. Yet metaphysics has remained the traditionally accepted name for the inquiry or science which goes beyond physics — or all of natural science — in that it asks about the very existence of things, and their modes of being.

Heidegger

- Nothing is neither an object nor anything that is at all. Nothing occurs neither by itself nor apart from what-is, as a sort of adjunct. Nothing is that which makes the revelation of what-is as such possible for our human existence. Quoting Hegel, “pure Being and pure Nothing are ... are one and the same.”

James

- “in the strictest and ultimate sense of the word ‘existence’, everything which can be thought of at all exists as some sort of object, whether mythical object, individual thinker’s object, or object in outer space and for intelligence at large.”

Cause

- Explanation is an inveterate human tendency.
- Tolstoy: “The impulse to seek causes is innate in the soul of man.”
- The question “Why?” remains after all other questions are answered. It is sometimes the only unanswerable question — unanswerable either in the very nature of the case or because there are secrets men cannot fathom. Sometimes, Dante says, man must be content with the knowledge that something is without knowing why. “Why?” is the one question which it has been deemed the better part of wisdom not to ask; yet it has also been thought the one question which holds the key to wisdom. As Virgil writes, in one of his most famous lines: “Happy is the man who has been able to know the causes of things.”
- “How do you know?” is often a concealed form of the “Why” question. To answer it we may have to give our reasons for thinking that something or other is the case; or perhaps give the genesis of our opinion. Things as different as a logical demonstration and a piece of autobiography seem to be relevant in accounting for our convictions.
- A posterior reasoning is the argument from effect to cause.
- A priori reasoning is reasoning from cause to effect. Aristotle and Aquinas conclude this mode of reasoning only demonstrates the nature of a thing, not its existence.
- According to Planck, “the law of causality is neither true nor false. It is rather a heuristic principle, a signpost ... to help us find our bearings in a bewildering maze of occurrences, and to show us the direction in which scientific research must advance in order to achieve fertile results.
- The principle of causality — that nothing happens without a cause or sufficient reason, or, as Spinoza puts it, “nothing exists from whose nature an effect does not follow” — has been made the basis for denials of human freedom as well as of chance or contingency in the order of nature.
- Since the realm of nature includes human nature, must not human acts be caused as are all other natural events?

Theology

- If God’s will is the cause of everything which happens, if nothing can happen contrary to His will or escape the foresight of His providence, then how is man free from God’s foreordination when he chooses between good and evil? If, as the theologians say, “the very act of free choice is traced to God as to a cause,” in what sense can the act be called “free”? Is it not necessarily determined to conform to God’s will and to his plan? But, on the other hand, if “everything happening from the exercise of free choice must be subject to divine providence,” must not the evil that men do be attributed to God as cause?
- That God governs and cares for all things may be supposed to reduce nature to a puppet show in which every action takes place in obedience to the divine will alone. Natural causes would thus cease to be causes or to have any genuine efficacy in the production of their own effects.

Aristotle

- Four ways of saying why something is the case:

Material cause

- That out of which a thing comes to be and which persists; that which undergoes change

Formal cause

- The form or the archetype

Efficient cause

- The primary; source of the change or coming to rest.

Final cause

- The end or that for the sake of which a thing is done.
- Example: Reasons for making a shoe
- Material cause: the leather
- Efficient cause: shoemaker's acts
- Formal cause: the pattern which directs his work
- Final cause: protection of the foot

Spinoza

- Nature has set no end before herself; all final causes are nothing but human fictions.
- He deplors those who "will not cease asking the causes of causes, until at last you fly to the will of God, the refuge of ignorance."

Descartes

- On final causes: they should be referred to the efficient cause. When we behold the uses of the various parts in plants and animals, we may be led to admire the God who brings these into existence but that does not imply that we can divine the purpose for which He made each thing. And although in Ethics, where it is often allowable to employ conjecture, it is at times pious to consider the end which we may conjecture God set before Himself in ruling the universe, certainly in Physics, where everything should rest upon the surest arguments, it is futile to do so.
- Points out that you cannot prove that the regress to infinity is absurd, unless you at the same time show that the world has a definite beginning in time.

Aristotle and Aquinas

- Father > Son > Grandson
- Essential cause is the son
One which, by its operation, immediately brings the effect into existence.
- Accidental cause is the father
Indispensable, but it is not by itself sufficient to produce the effect.

Aristotle

- Principal and instrumental causes
 6. Man sawing wood.
 7. Principal cause: Man
 8. Instrumental cause: Saw

James

- “we have no definite idea of what we mean by cause, or of what causality consists in.”

Dogma of Creation

- Aquinas explains that “as long as a thing has being, so long must God be present to it” as the cause of its being.

Modern Discussion of Cause

- Skeptic’s doubts concerning our ability to know the causes of things
- Tendency of physical science to limit or even to abandon the investigation of causes: for example, acceleration of motion: not to investigate the cause of the acceleration but rather to investigate and to demonstrate the properties of accelerated motion

Hume

- All causes are hidden; we never can discover anything but one event following another ...
- We cannot penetrate beyond experience to the operation of real causes...
- He denies that anything happens by chance or that any natural occurrence can be caused. Chance as a cause results from our ignorance.
- Man’s ignorance of real causes and the mere probability of his opinions about customary sequences of cause and effect, indicate human limitation, not limits to causal determination in the order of nature itself.
- Hume’s determinism affirms the existence of chance or real contingency in the happenings of nature. [contradiction?]

Nietzsche

- Causes are fictions we invent.

Descartes and Aquinas

- There must be a first cause or principal cause.

Descartes, unlike Aquinas

- Doesn’t prefer the cause method of proving God’s existence, rather he prefers the ontological argument in which the conception of God as a necessary being implies his existence.

Aquinas

- The ontological argument is not a form of reasoning but rather as the assertion that God's existence is self-evident to us, which he denies.

-

Chance

Three meanings:

a caused event

- chance is unpredictable or less predictable because of our ignorance of its causes

absolutely spontaneous

indeterminism in its most extreme form; excludes causes

- The basic feature of Darwinist thought is its reliance on chance

Lucretius

- The swerve of the atoms accounts for the origin of the world...the free will of man. But nothing accounts for the swerve of the atom. It is uncaused, spontaneous, fortuitous.
- Spinoza believed that chance was a consequence of man's limited knowledge
- A compelling question: How does man reconcile chance and therefore man's free will with divine providence?
- For the ancients probability is subjective: degrees of probability measure the inadequacy of man's knowledge

Tolstoy

- Man resorts to the explanation of chance only because he lacks a complete understanding of the small events.
 - Either necessity or freedom rules the affairs of men
 - Chance does not denote any really existing thing but only a certain stage of understanding of phenomena
- Once we succeed in calculating the composition of forces involved in the mass movements of men "we shall not be obliged to have recourse to chance for an explanation of those small events which made these people what they were, but it will be clear that all those small events were inevitable.

Chance identified with coincidence or contingency

- Here it is a product of causes
- Two lines of action coincide and produce a single result
- Each action has its cause but there is not a cause for their coinciding

Biologist C.H. Waddington

- The basic feature of Darwinist thought ... is its reliance on chance rather on a simple determinists type of causation.

Aristotle

- Chance is an incidental (also contingent, accidental) cause and the causes are infinite
 - Does not by itself produce the given effect; it does so only through the conjunction of other causes
- What happens by nature happens regularly through causal necessity. This necessity results from the operation of essential causes, causes in the very nature of the moving things. When the regularity fails, it is due to the intervention of some accidental cause (which is chance).

Spinoza

- Nothing is contingent in nature
- All things are determined from the the necessity of the divine nature to exist
- Chance does not exist
- Chance or contingency is illusory: a projection of the mind's ignorance or of its inadequate knowledge.

Augustine

- No fortuitous causes; only latent ones

Aquinas

- Seems to waffle: in some writings he refutes randomness; in others, he states God wills some things to be done contingently
- Groups together wealth, honor, fame, and power as goods of the same sort because they are "due to external causes and in most cases to fortune."

Change

Heracleitus

- Reality is mobility... only changing states exist; rest is never more than apparent, or, rather, relative.

Heisenberg

- Modern physics is close to the doctrine of Heracleitus.
- Energy may be called the fundamental cause for all change in the world.

Aristotle's Three Kinds of Motions (every motion is a kind of change)

1. Local motion — bodies change from place to place
2. Alteration or qualitative motion — body attribute change (color, texture)
3. Quantitative motion — bodies change in size

- The above changes are known as “accidental changes”, the changing thing does not come to be or pass away absolutely, but only in certain respects.

- One kind of change which is not motion is generation and corruption:

Consists in the coming to be or passing away. When change takes place, matter itself is changed (substantial change): the eating of bread or corn becomes the flesh and blood of man.

Examples:

1. Birth and death
2. Water to ice

Aristotle's Pedantic Definition

- The moving thing must be potential and partly actual. Example: a leaf turning red. Before it began to change, it was actually green, it was potentially red.

Citizen

Constitution

Courage

- Heroes is a fearless, not because nothing turns their blood cold, but because they do not act afraid or fail to act.
- Brave men, mastering fear, will appear to be fearless.
- Reservoir of moral or spiritual strength to sustain action even when flesh and blood can carry on no further.
- Courage also consist in steeling the will, reinforcing its resolutions, and turning the mind relentlessly to seek or face the truth.
- One whose spirit retains in pleasure and in pain the commands of reason about what he ought or ought not to fear.
- By uniting caution and confidence, we avoid the extreme of foolhardiness and cowardice. Without rational direction or, as Aristotle would say, without prudence, one may be fearless but not courageous. (When judging, for example, to flee or flight.)
- Fearless alone is not courage (this is proved by drunks; we do not refer to them courageous).
- Animals, like many people, are not courageous even though they have no fear because they are ignorant of them.

- Courage involves a reasonable, a wise or prudent discrimination between what should be feared and should be undertaken in spite of fear or pain.

Freud

- Freud seems to be skeptical of the rational explanation for heroism which consists in the decision between personal life vis a vis certain abstract general ideals.
- He thinks courage is more instinctive and impulsive heroism.

Plato on Military Courage

- No sound legislator would order peace for the sake of war and not war for the sake of peace.

Machiavelli

- Fortune plays a large part in man's success. Any method requires us to sue fortune to the best advantage. This demands courage and even audacity. Seems to say that courage may improve the chances of success and it is success that counts. The end may be commendable or not.

Plato, Aristotle, Aquinas, Kant, Hegel

- Disagrees with Machiavelli, Hegel writes, "It is the positive aspect, the end and content which gives significance to the spiritedness of courageous actions."

Aristotle

- Courage more praiseworthy than temperance: "it is harder to face what is painful than to abstain from what is pleasant."
- Since death is the most terrible of all things: "he will be called brave who is fearless in the face of a noble death ... " But it must be a noble death.
- Prudence is required to decide what things should be feared, when they should be feared, and how much.

Custom and Convention

Definition

- Definitions evolve to clarify discourse, to achieve precision of thought, to focus issues, and to resolve them.
- Definitions help men come to terms with one another
- Definitions make possible the meeting of minds (in agreement or dispute)
- A word is thus a conventional sound or mark, which can be given any meaning that conventions assigns to it. When that meaning is expressed in other others, we have a verbal definition. Definitions remain merely verbal when the words they define are not actually used to name or to signify things in some way. Whenever a thing is named or signified, the definition must also signify something about the nature of the thing.
- Just as the arbitrary character of verbal definitions seems to be removed by the consideration of the things which words name or signify, so the purely nominal character of definitions

seems to be removed by recourse to meanings which are understood without further verbal explanation.

Dr. Johnson

- Just as nothing can be proved but by something evident without proof, so nothing can be defined but by the use of words too plain to admit of definition. The circularity of the dictionary is thus avoided.

God as a Definition (defined by an atheist)

- Not only is any definition of God considered nominal but also false (i.e. the definition of an impossible being, incapable of existing).

Democracy

- Inseparably connected to constitutional gov't.
- Rule of the people.
- Political power in the hands of many, rather than few.
- The Federalists reason for espousing representation gov't.: controlling the effects of the violence of faction rooted in the nature of man in society. Representation cures this ill.

Hobbes

- He issues sound advice: there is always the danger of the demagogue who has the ability to seduce many where democracy tends to degenerate into gov't. by the most powerful orator.

Hamilton

- The deeper peril for democracy results from the people's attachment to liberty to the point they will resort for repose and security to institutions which have a tendency to destroy their civil and political rights. To be more safe, they at length become more willing to run the risk of being less free.

Desire

- In modern usage, desire signifies a cause of animal and human behavior.
- Desire always involves some lack or privation to be remedied by a change; seeks to enjoy a pleasure or possess a good.
- We desire the things we love but do not possess.
- Natural desires are nonconscious rather unconscious desires.
- Repressed desire, whether instinctual in origin or the result of some acquired fixation of the libido on object or ego, would be a conscious tendency if it were not repressed. Repressed desires remain in the unconscious system. The repressed desire is made to operate unconsciously by being repressed, which does not prevent it from influencing our conduct or thought, but only from intruding its driving force and its goal upon our attention. In contrast, the desire which works habitually and therefore to some extent unconsciously, is not repressed, but merely one which no longer demands our full attention.

- The traditional name for the intellectual appetite or the faculty of rational desire is will.

Freud

- Contrary to a popular misconception, Freud
 - Did not think analytic treatment should consist of advice to ‘live freely’
 - What the world calls its code of morals demands more sacrifice than it is worth
 - We must beware of overestimating the importance of abstinence in effecting neurosis
 - His emotional infantilism resembles to some degree what a moralist like Aristotle calls self-indulgence or incontinence; to give vent to all the promptings of desire, without regard to the demands of society or reality is to revert to infancy, which is a state characterized by the irreconcilability of its wishes with reality

Spinoza

- The effort of desire, when it is related to the mind alone, is called “will”, but when it is related at the same time both to the mind and the body, it is called appetite.

Socrates

- Man not only desires that which he does not have but also that which he wishes to keep.
- Most men desire the future

Dialectic

- Dialectical and dialectician are currently more often used in a derogative than in a descriptive sense. That is, too scholarly, not in touch with experience.
- Other complaints:
 - Plays with words
 - Makes sport of contradiction
 - Hair-splitting
 - Logic chopping
- The dialectician argues rather than observes, who appeals to reason rather than experience, who draws implication from whatever is said or can be said, pushing a premise to its logical conclusion or reducing it to absurdity.
- The dialectical process is a motion in which contrary and defective truths are harmonized. The synthesis of thesis and antithesis results in a more complete truth. If the resulting synthesis is not the whole truth, it too must be defective and require supplementation by a contrary which is defective in an opposite way.
- Nietzsche is contemptuous of all dialecticians.
- James expresses his extreme distaste for Hegel.
- Marx says his dialectic method is the direct opposite of Hegel: whereas Hegel thinks the real world is only the external, Phenomenal form of the Idea, Marx’s view is the ideal is nothing

else than the material world reflected by the human mind, and translated into forms of thought.

Duty

- According to Websters: something that one is expected or required to do by moral or legal obligation.
- Virtue may also direct a man to act for the common welfare and to obey the laws of the state or the commandments of God.
- Another source of tragic conflict in the sphere of duty: Men are torn by competing loyalties, obligations which pull them in opposite directions.
- If man is not a rational animal or if, whatever his nature, reason is not its ruling principle, then the sense of duty would appear to be an imposture that draws its driving force from the emotional energies with which certain man-made rules of conduct are invested. Rather than acting as a counterweight to desire, duty is itself the shape which certain desires take to combat others.
- According to the theory of constitutional government, rights and duties are correlative. The acknowledgment of duties signifies that the holder of rights recognizes their limited or conditional character. To consider oneself entirely exempt from duties or obligations is to regard one's rights as absolute. Can anyone have absolute rights except on condition of being without a superior of any sort? One implied answer to this question is that neither despot nor state, but only God, is autonomous or without duty.

Freud

- Conscience, or the super-ego, according to Freud, is born of the struggle between the ego and the id. Translated into popular language, the ego stands for reason and circumspection, while the id stands for the untamed passions. Not tragedy but neurosis results from an overdeveloped sense of duty. When the ego is forced to acknowledge its weakness, it breaks out into anxiety: reality anxiety in face of the external world, normal anxiety in face of the super-ego, and neurotic anxiety in face of the strength of the passions in the id.

Hobbes

- It is the Sovereign power that obliges men to obey them.
- The tragedy of being both rational and animal seems to consist in having to choose between duty and desire rather than in making any particular choice.

Locke

- It is the honest or just man who acknowledges such obligations (to another individual).

Education

- Political problem of education is whether the education shall be private or public.

Mill

- Holds it to be almost a self-evident axiom that the State should require and compel the education, up to a certain standard, of every human being who is born its citizen. Yet he deprecates the idea of a general state education as a mere contrivance for moulding people to be exactly like one another.
- He believes that the difficulties could be avoided if the govt. would leave it to parents to obtain the education where and how they pleased, and content itself with helping to pay the school fees of the poorer classes of children, and defraying the entire school expenses of those who have no one else to pay for them. Schools completely established and controlled by the state should only exist if they exist at all as one among many competing experience, carried on for the purpose of example and stimulus to keep the others up to a certain standard of excellence.

Element

Emotion

- Like desire, emotion is neither knowledge nor action, but something intermediate.
- Various passions are usually aroused by objects perceived, imagined, or remembered; from this, they in turn originate impulses to act in certain ways. For example, fear arises; lion knows to kill, other flee
- Emotions claim attention:
 - We experience them
 - We analyze them: define them, classify them, study their role in life and society
- The basic emotions are generally thought to be connected with the instinctively determined patterns of behavior by which animals struggle to survive.
- Emotion seems to be the feeling rather than the knowing or the doing. It also involves the felt impulse to react to the object of the passion.
- Emotions are more closely related to the animal aspect of human behavior. (even by writers who do not place so high an estimate on the role of reason).
- Not doubt that emotions are common to man and animal. Darwin presents many instances.

Spinoza

Astonishment	Contempt	Love	Hatred
Inclination	Aversion	Devotion	Derision
Hope	Fear	Confidence	Despair
Gladness	Remorse	Commiseration	Favor
Indignation	Over-estimation	Humility	Envy
Compassion	Self-satisfaction	Repentance	Pride
Despondency	Self-exaltation	Shame	Regret
Emulation	Gratitude	Benevolence	Anger
Vengeance	Ferocity	Audacity	Consternation
Courtesy	Ambition	Luxuriousness	Drunkenness
Avarice	Lust		

- Two important issues:
 - The effect of conflict between diverse emotions.
 - The conflict between the passions and the reason or will.

James

- The action we call instinctive are expressions or manifestations of the emotions.

Eternity

- Two meanings: No beginning or end to time's process
- We conceive by denying time itself and with it—change.
- Interminable time (eternity) implies imperishable.
- The heavenly bodies and the atoms may be thought everlasting, but they are not immutable in all respects, for local motion is of their very nature. Endlessly in motion.
- Eternity as an existence: absolutely immutable; a being which neither comes to be nor passes away, nor changes, nor moves. The Jewish and Christian theologians invoke this definitions.

Locke

- The world's eternity or its infinity is “at least as conceivable as the contrary.”
- “there is nothing more inconceivable to me than duration without succession.”

Aquinas

- Just as the apprehension of time is caused in us by the fact that we apprehend the flow of the now, so the apprehension of eternity is caused in us by our apprehending the now standing still.

Evolution

Adler

- The theory of evolution brings to the fore is the notion of a developmental or genetic relation among the various forms of life.
- Darwin is not concerned with evolution as a grand scheme of biological, or cosmic, history, but the origin of species. He is concerned with establishing the fact that new species do originate in the course of time, against those who suppose the species of living things to be fixed in number and immutable in type throughout the ages. He is concerned with formulating the various factors in the differentiation of species, and with showing, against those who think a new species requires a special act of creation, that the origin of species, like their extinction, is entirely a natural process which requires no factors other than those at work every day in the life, death, and breeding of plants and animals.
- Darwin arbitrarily selected the term species and thus does not attempt any strict definition of it. He used it to signify a set of individuals closely resembling each other—a class of plants and animals having certain common characteristics.

- Why focus on species rather than varieties or genera? Species always generate organisms which can be classified as belonging to the same species, however they vary among themselves as individuals within the group. Subgroups of a species are able to breed with one another but diverse species cannot interbreed. Organisms different in species either cannot mate productively at all, or if crossbred, like the horse and the ass, they produce a sterile hybrid like the mule. Species would seem to be distinguished from all smaller groupings by their stability from generation to generation.
- New species arise when, among the varieties (a subgroup) of an existing species, certain intermediate forms become extinct, and the other circumstances are such that the surviving varieties, now become more sharply separated from one another in type, are able to reproduce their kind, and, in the course of many generations of inbreeding, also tend to breed true. The origin of species thus seems to be identical with the extinction of intermediate varieties, combined with the survival of one or more of the extreme varieties.
- According to Darwin, natural selection works solely by and for the good of each being; all corporeal and mental endowments will tend to progress toward perfection. Thus, from the war of nature, from famine and death...the production of the higher animals directly follows.
- But Dobzhansky states the process is indeed creative, for it gives rise to previously nonexistent coherent entities, new organisms fit to perpetuate themselves in certain habitats. Selection is also opportunistic, favors variation with immediate value, and possesses no foresight. It thus involves risk of failure and miscreation. Organisms which appear to us as monstrosities nevertheless survive and reproduce in nature.
- Advances in genetics since Darwin's day do not alter the main outlines of his theory.

Controversies between Darwin and Others

- According to Aquinas, "the rational soul cannot come to be except by creation." He also insists that the first formation of the human body could not be by the instrumentality of any created power, but was immediately from God.
- According to Darwin, man and the anthropoid apes have descended from a common ancestral form which is now extinct, as are also many of the intermediate varieties in the chain of development.

Kant

- Anticipating Darwin: This analogy of forms, which in all their differences seem to be produced in accordance with a common type, strengthens the suspicion that they have an actual kinship due to descent from a common parent. This we might trace in the gradual approximation of one animal species to another ...

Experience

- Source of knowledge. Containing what is known.
- Sometimes involves sensory perception, memory, activity of imagination
- May connote something which is private (can not be shared with another) or public (something common to all); subjective or objective.
- Might be intuitive or aesthetic, religious, or mystical.
- The primary contribution of the intellect is the translation of experienced particulars into universal notions.
- To the extent that deductive reasoning is a way of learning new truths, the truths thus learned derive from experience only indirectly. Their direct source is truths already known, which must in turn have come from experience by induction.
- A priori judgment is not determined by experience nor does it need empirical verification. A priori is what is experienced before experience, what is independent of experience.

Hume

- Knowledge may go beyond experience only if it is knowledge of the relation of our ideas, as with math, which is performed by mere operation of thought without dependence on what is anywhere existent in the universe.
- But with regards to matters of fact experience is our only guide.

Descartes and Kant

- The mind itself provides the ground for judgments which are therefore a priori.

Bacon and Aristotle

- Investigating and discovering the truth: from senses and particulars to the axioms, then principles and truth. A.k.a a posteriori.

Hobbes, James

- Possession of expertness or sound judgment in practical affairs.

Hobbes, Aristotle

- Much memory, or memory of many things.

Hobbes

- That knowledge which is not attained by reasoning.
- Found in beast as well as man.
- Memory of successions of events in times past.

Experiments used for:

- Testing hypotheses
- Enable scientist to make exact measurements to determine whether one or another mathematical formulation fits the observable facts of nature.
- Functions as the source of inductions. It provides a clear case from which a generalization can be drawn.
- Can be used for discovery, exploration

Family

Why do men and women want offspring?

- In Christendom, the lot of the childless are viewed as grievous frustration.
- For pagan and christian, to be childless is not merely contrary to nature, but constitutes the deprivation of a blessing which should grace the declining years of married life.

Nietzsche

- Womans desire for independence is one of the worst developments in the general uglification of Europe.
- Women have so much reason for shame. In women there is concealed so much pedanticism, superficiality, schoolmarmishness, petty presumption, petty unbridledness and petty immodesty — one needs only to study her behaviour with children! — which has fundamentally been most effectively controlled and repressed hitherto by fear of man ... To blunder over the fundamental problem of man and woman, to deny here the most abysmal antagonism and the necessity of an eternally hostile tension, perhaps to dream here of equal rights, equal education, equal claims and duties: this is a typical sign of shallow-mindedness. Since the French Revolution the influence of wmanan in Europe has grown less in the same proportion as her rights and claims have grown greater; and the emancipation of woman, is so far as it has been demanded and advanced by women themselves, is thus revealed as a noteworthy symptom of the growing enfeeblement and blunting of the most feminine instincts.

Levi-Strauss

- A kinship system does not consist in the objective ties of descent or consanguinity between individuals. It exists only in human consciousness; it is an arbitrary system of representations, not the spontaneous development of a real situation.
- If the procreation and rearing of offspring is the function, or even a function, which the family naturally exists to perform, then a childless family cannot be considered normal.

Kant

- Parents responsibility extends beyond providing nourishment. It also includes the function of forming and developing it practically that it may be able to maintain and advance itself, and also its moral culture and development, the guilt of neglecting it falling upon the parents.

- If a man and woman have the will to enter on reciprocal enjoyment in accordance with their sexual natures, they must necessarily marry each other.

Freud

- That sexual relations are permitted only on the basis of a final, indissoluble bond between a man and a woman are purely a convention of present-day civilization.

Fate

Form

- Connotes figure or shape yet this is limiting, for poems and symphonies have structures.
- When we apprehend things by reason we know the Forms they imitate; when we apprehend them by our senses we know them as imitations or as images of the Ideas. Just as the particular man imitates man, so our idea of man is also an imitation of that idea.

Aristotle

- Challenges Plato's claim that forms are distinct from the things of this earth.
- Substance signifies that which exists in and of itself; or, in other worlds, that which exists separately from other things. Example: making a brass sphere we bring the form into the matter (the brass); there is no sphere apart from the individual spheres. The indwelling forms are not universal.

Russell

- The form of a proposition is that which remains the same in a statement when everything else is changed: B follows A; C accompanies D.

Kant

- Matter is that which corresponds to the senses.
- Form is that which effects the content of the phenomenon can be arranged under certain relations.
- idea (lower case) refers to a notion in the human mind.
- Idea (higher case) signifies the object of knowledge. The Ideas are outside the human mind as forms are separate from their sensible, material imitations.

God

- Two ways of approaching the problem of God's existence:
 - A conception of God as an infinite, perfect, and necessary being whose nonexistence is therefore inconceivable. No one who understands what God is, can conceive that God does not exist. Since the nonexistence is inconceivable, God must exist.
 - Locke: "the invisible things of God are clearly seen from the creation of the world, being understood by the things that are made, even his eternal power and Godhead."

- We have an intuitive knowledge of our own existence.
- We know that a nonentity cannot produce any real being.
- We exist therefore God exist; we did not make ourselves.

Aristotle

- Does not suppose the creation of the world (i.e. the world having a beginning).
- He holds the world, its motion, and the “unmoved mover” to be eternal.

Agnostic

- Denies that man can have any natural knowledge of God, either of his existence or essence.
- Need not be incompatible with religion, unless religion holds, as an article of faith itself, that the existence of God can be proved by reason.
- May be a religious man who accepts divine revelation and regards faith as divinity inspired.
- May be a skeptic about faith as well as reason.
- May look upon faith as superstition,
- May even treat religion as if it were pathological.

Montaigne

- Faith alone embraces vividly and surely the high mysteries of our religion.
- Reason by itself is incapable of proving anything, much less anything by God.

Kierkegaard

- This view of religion precludes reason.
- Faith is the realm of the absurd, a paradox, that says “there is absolute duty toward God.”

Freud

- An illusion to be explained in terms of man’s need to create gods in his own image, to find a surrogate for the father.
- Man looks back to the memory-image of the overrated father, exalts it into a Deity. The emotional strength of this memory image and the lasting nature of man’s need for protection are the two supports of his belief in God.

Voltaire

- If God did not exist, it would be necessary to invent him.

Gnosticism

- Like deism, it dispenses with faith.
- Exceeds traditional deism in the claims it makes for reason’s power to penetrate the divine mysteries.

Aquinas

- God’s existence and attributes belong to “the preamble of faith”.

Descartes

- The idea that I possess of a being more perfect than I must necessary have been placed in me by a being which is really more perfect.

Hume

- God, a unique and unparallel cause, cannot be proved by reasoning from our experience of effects and their causes. (It is only experience which teaches us the nature and bounds of cause and effect). Theology has its best and most solid foundation, not in reason or experience, but in faith and divine revelation.

Pascal

- We are incapable of knowing either that God is or what God is because if there is a God, He is infinitely incomprehensible and has no affinity to us.

Kant

- Makes the affirmatin of God a matter of faith. It is a purely rational faith, since pure reason ... is the sole source from which it springs. He defines a matter of faith as any object which cannot be known through the speculative use of reason, but which must be thought a priori, either as consequences or as grounds, if pure practical reason is to be used as duty commands ...
- Like Hume, he thinks that our notions of cause and effect cannot be applied outside experience or to anything beyond the realm of sensible nature. But he offers an additional reason for denying validity to all a posteriori reasoning concerning God's existence. If something exists, an absolutely necessary being must likewise exist. One premise in the argument, namely, that contingent things exist, has its foundation in experience and therefore Kant admits that the reasoning is nto completely a priori or ontological. To complete the proof, it must be shown that a most perfect being, is the same as an absolutely necessary being, in order for the obtained conclusion (a necessary being exists) to be translated into the conclusion desired (God exists).

Good and Evil

- Since God is good and since everything which happens is within God's power, how can we account for the sin of Satan or the fall of man, with all the evil consequent thereupon, without limiting God's power or absolving the erring creature from responsibility.
- The contemporary discussion of good and evil draws its terminology from economics rather than theology. The word value has almost replaced good and evil.
- Evaluating anything means judging it as good or bad, better or worst.

Montaigne

- The taste of good and evil depends in large part on the opinion we have of them.

Hamlet

- There is nothing either good or bad but thinking makes it so.

Plato

- Good is not a matter of opinion but an object of knowledge.

Spinoza

- Good and evil are nothing but modes of thought apart from society, there is nothing which by universal consent is good or evil, since everyone in a natural state consults only his own profit.
- We do not desire a thing because we judge it good, but, on the contrary, we call it good because we desire it.
- The nature of man and his reason seem to provide an objective standard for determining what is good alike for all men. Nothing can be good except in so far as it agrees with our nature.
- The man who always acts according to the dictates of reason for those desires which are determined by man's power or reason are always good.

Aquinas

- A thing is desirable only in so far as it is perfect.

Socrates

- No man pursues evil or that which he thinks to be evil.

Mill

- All men seek happiness and they determine what is good and evil in particular cases by reference to this end.

Government

Habit

Happiness

History

- Machiavelli, Montesquieu, the Federalists:

Use history to exemplify or confirm their generalizations

- An exact knowledge of the past is an aid to the interpretation of the future, which in the course of human things must resemble if it does not reflect it.

Honor

- Because fame seems to be morally neutral, it replaces honor in the discussions of those who measure men in terms of success instead of virtue, duty, or happiness. Because it is morally neutral, it is the term used by those who wish to judge, not men, by the

impression they make. What counts is the magnitude of that impression, not its correspondence with reality.

- To be famous is to be widely, not necessarily well, spoken of by one's fellowmen, now or thereafter.
- The opposite of fame is anonymity. In Dante's moral universe, only the Trimmers on the rim of Hell are totally anonymous; neither good nor bad, they lack name and fame. Because they "lived without infamy and without praise," Hell will not receive them, "lest the wicked have some glory over them."
- A society of misanthropes, despising each other, is as unthinkable as an economy of misers. The social nature of man requires sympathy and fellow feeling, love and friendship, and all of these involve some measure of approval based on knowledge or understanding.
- Though Pascal regards the pursuit of glory as the greatest baseness of man, he admits that it is also the greatest mark of his excellence; for whatever health and essential comfort, he is not content if he is not also ranked highly in the judgment of men.
- Honor functions like duty, both operate through an inner determination of the will to do what reason judges to be right in the particular case.
- Duty usually involves obligations to others; honor may not.
- A sense of honor presupposes self-consciousness of virtue in the individual.
- With some self-respect, man can have no sense of honor.

Contrasting Honor with Fame

- Fame belongs to the great, the outstanding, the exceptional, without regard to virtue or vice.
- The great scoundrel can be as famous as the great hero.
- Fame exist in a man regardless of character; fame does not tarnish, like honor, when it is unmerited.

Augustine

- Glory found in human praise is a sin. "if the love of glory be greater in the heart than the fear or love of God, that the Lord said, "How can ye believe, who look for glory from one another, and do not seek the glory which is from God alone?"

Machiavelli

- Money, fame, power:
 - Man wants without limit
 - Man wants without relation to justice
 - A man is deemed no less successful if he acquires power by usurping it, or gains it by foul means rather than fair.
 - Let a prince have the credit of conquering and holding a state, the means will always be considered honest, and he will be praised by everybody.

Hobbes

- Honor is not what a man has in himself but what he receives from others. Honor is paid him.
- Virtue and duty do not enter into this conception of honor.
- Another conception of honor: “on my honor”
Says that he needs no external check or sanction.

Montaigne

- Honor protects us from the fear of death, of pain, of shame.
- Honor leads us on to the the hazards of war.

Hypothesis

- Hypothesis = Supposition.
- To make one thing the basis of another in the process of thought
- Today often popularly misapplied to mean a guess or hunch
- When we employ suppositions, then we ask about their truth
- The “if” part of a statement is the supposition (hypothesis); the “then” part of a statement is the consequence.
- The entire “if ... then” is known as a hypothetical proposition.
- A hypothesis is overthrown when its prediction fails, but it is not verified when its prediction comes true. To think that it can be verified in this way is to commit the logical fallacy of arguing from the truth of a conclusion to the truth of its premises.
- How then do empirical scientists prove a hypothesis to be true? There seem to be two possible ways in which a hypothesis can be proved by empirical or experimental research. One way can be used when we know that the consequences implied follow only from the truth of the hypothesis. Should the consequences implied be impossible unless the supposed condition exists, then the confirmation of the prediction verifies the hypothesis.
- The other possible method of verification has come to be called the method of multiple working hypotheses. The validity of this method depends on our knowing that the several hypotheses being entertained exhaust all the relevant possibilities. Each hypothesis generates a prediction, and if upon investigation the observed facts negate every prediction except one, then that one remaining hypothesis is verified. If negative instances have eliminated the false hypotheses, the hypothesis remaining must be true, on the condition, of course, that it is the only possibility which is left. That is why Poincare cautions scientists not to multiply hypotheses indefinitely.
- Axioms or common notions are those propositions which are immediately seen to be true without proof.
- The postulates or assumptions are hypotheses in the sense that their truth is taken for granted without proof.

- Axioms are traditionally regarded as intrinsically indemonstrable, whereas hypotheses (postulates or assumptions) may not be indemonstrable. They are simply asserted without demonstration.
- Axioms, self-evident propositions, what James calls “necessary truths”, have been denied entirely or dismissed as tautologies.
- The best opinions are probabilities, propositions which are not self-evident and which cannot be proved.

Aristotle

- Reasoning which rests either on axioms or on demonstrable principles is scientific, but reasoning, which rests only on hypotheses is dialectical (Aristotle). Dialectical reasoning moves entirely within the sphere of opinion.

Ideas

- They are objects of thought and they are also the conceptions by which we think about things.
- They represent the principal content of our thought.
- They are what we think as well as what we think about.
- It is both the thought and the object of the thought.
- Kant thinks idea has a specific meaning and provides definitions of other related words to make his point:
- Perception is divided into sensation and cognition

Cognition is either an intuition or a conception

An idea is one subdivision of pure conceptions

- Thus, according to Kant, the color red is not an idea.
- Ideas are sometimes regarded both as Objects of knowledge, and Representation of reality.
- Kant:

Perception

 Sensation

 Cognition

 Intuition

 Conception

 9. Empirical

 10. Pure Conception (idea)

 11.

- Pure conception has its origin in the understanding alone, not the conception of a pure sensuous image.
- Although the term idea means different things to each philosopher, there is some commonality: an idea involves a theory of knowledge.
- Ideas are sometimes regarded both as objects of knowledge and as representations of reality.

- An idea is always a mental intention, an awareness or representation, never an independent reality for the mind to know.

Locke, James

- Ideas of sensation and abstract ideas belong to the one faculty of understanding or to the single stream of consciousness.

Descartes, Spinoza

- Ideas belong to the intellect or to the thinking being, separate from matter and from sensations which are only bodily reactions

Plato, Augustine, Descartes

- Regard the intellect as in some way innately endowed with ideas.

Induction

Immortality

- According to the theologians, a preternal condition is the imperishability of the bodily frame. Man dies in the flesh to be reborn in the spirit (Soul). The soul is immortal. The other world is not just an abode for the disembodied soul, it is a place of judgment.
- To the theologians, the joy of the soul united to God in the beatific vision surpasses temporal understanding.
- In Goethe's Faust, the immortal soul is the wager between Faust and Mephistopheles.
- Whether it is to be attained through the perpetuation of the species, through survival in the memory of mankind, through knowledge of God, or through the subsistence of the soul, the desire for immortality seems to express man's dread of disappearance into utter nothingness.

Kant

There can be no valid theoretical argument for immortality precisely because there can be no scientific knowledge of transcendental objects—beings beyond all possible experience. The immortal life is a moral necessity.

Infinity

- Lacks the support of the imagination or of the sense-experience; this leads Hobbes and Berkeley to deny its existence.

On infinite series of reasons and causes:

- Essential causes: coexist with their effects.
- Accidental causes: precede their effects.
- Given infinite time, there could be an infinite series of accidental causes.
- If the truth of a conclusion cannot be known until the truth of its premises is known, then the pursuit of truth may be vitiated by a search ad infinitum.

Pascal

- Numbers can be infinitely increased or decreased.

Kant's infinity argument against a beginning in time

- Suppose there was no beginning.
- Then up to every given moment in time, an eternity must have elapsed and with it, an infinite series of successive conditions or states of things in the world.
- But an infinite series can never be completed.
- Thus an infinite series already elapsed is impossible.
- Thus a beginning of the world is a necessary condition of its existence.

Kant's infinity argument for a beginning in time

- Assume this world had a beginning, which is an existence which is preceded by a time in which the thing does not exist.
- Then there must have been a time in which the world did not exist, that is a void time.
- But in a void time, the origin of a thing is impossible because no part of any such time contains a distinctive condition of being in preference to that of nonbeing.
- Consequently, many series of things may have a beginning in the world but the world itself cannot have a beginning and is therefore, in relations to past time, infinite.

Judgment

- Three principal meaning variants:

A quality of mind

- The sense in which we ordinarily speak of a person as having sound or poor judgment.
- Capacity to deliberate, weigh the advantage and disadvantage.
- Aristotle and Aquinas maintained that prudence or practical wisdom is achieved when one has the following qualities of mind:
 - Deliberation
 - Judgment (as it applies to the renderings of a court; mind as duty and authority)
 - decisiveness

A faculty of the mind

- Locke says the mind has two faculties conversant about truth and falsehood:
 - Faculty of knowing
 - Faculty of judging (i.e. opinion)

An act of the mind

- Aquinas' division of mental acts:
 - Conception
 - The simple apprehension of the essence and properties of a thing.
 - Judgment

- Unites or separates concepts by affirming or denying one or another.
- Reasoning
- Process of going from judgment to judgment.
- Judgment is an act of the mind, asserting or denying.
- Proposition is the subject matter being asserted or denied.
- The remaining discussion of judgment is trifling and pedantic.

Justice

- One mode of thought from the ancient Greeks, “that right is only in question between equals in power, whereas the stronger do whatever they can and the weaker suffer whatever they must.”
- Justice is an argument between those who think that might makes right and justice is expediency and those who think that power can be wrongly as well as rightly exercised, the measure of men and states, cannot be measured by utility.

Knowledge

- The only thing which cannot be an object of knowledge or opinion is “nothing.”
- Just because one does not have knowledge of something does not mean that something is not knowable.
- To know is to possess the truth about something.
- To err is to be deceived by falsity mistaken for truth.
- Nothing goes without scrutiny.
- The cult of ignorance receives little or no attention in the tradition of the great books. Not even Rousseau, who glorifies the innocence of the primitives, or Erasmus, who satirized the folly: so often mixed with human wisdom and the foibles attending the advance of learning, do not seriously question the ancient saying that all men by nature desire to know.

On the criterion of errors; why we err:

Descartes

Once we recognize that there is a God, that all things depend upon him, that he is not a deceiver, we can infer that whatever we perceive clearly and distinctly cannot fail to be true.

Source of error lies in the relation of the will to the intellect. Will is wider in its range than understanding. I do not restrain it within the same bounds as the intellect but extend it also to things which I do not understand. It is not God’s fault if, in the exercise of my freedom, I do not withhold my assent from certain things as to which he has not placed a clear and distinct knowledge in my understanding.

Socrates

False opinions arise when the senses and the mind do not cooperate properly.

Aristotle

It is the imagination which frequently misleads the mind.

Lucretius

It is the mind, not our senses, that is responsible for illusions and hallucinations.

Descartes

The senses are much less trustworthy than the intellect.

Montaigne

Errors are quite natural to all human faculties and they beset sense and reason alike.

Pascal

- Man is full of error. Everything deceives him. The two sources of truth, reason and the senses, both wanting in sincerity, deceive each other in turn.

Labor

- It is even suggested that useful occupations save men from a boredom they fear more than the pain of labor.
- Judea Christian doctrine: labor is an inevitable consequence of man's fall from grace, a punishment for Adam's disobedience, like disease and death.
- Keynes identified unemployment with failure of effective demand to carry off the supply of goods and services being produced or rendered. Since the time of the noted French economist and near contemporary of Smith, Jean-Baptiste Say, it had been an economic axiom that production, in the rent, interest, profit, and wages that it paid out, created an equivalent and wholly adequate demand. This was Say's law. From Keynes came the denial of this proposition; from undue savings there could be a shortfall in demand uncorrected by lower interest rates and a greater flow of investment. Correction would come when production and employment spiraled down, eliminating the excess of saving and establishing a new underemployment or unemployment equilibrium. From this analysis came the great remedy of Keynes. The state could intervene, and through borrowing and spending — offset the deficiency of demand in the private or market economy. So it followed: deliberate deficit spending to increase employment. From this came the yet larger conclusion: the state would now assume responsibility for the level of economic activity in the economy and for its rate of expansion.

Aristotle

- Rest is for the sake of work. Work is for the sake of leisure.

Adam Smith

- Disintegration between productive and nonproductive work. "The labor of some of the most respectable orders in society is ... unproductive of any value." The sovereign, for example, with all the officers both of justice and war who serve under him, the whole and nvey, are unproductive."

- “Like the declamation of the actor, the harangue of the orator, or the time of the musician, the work of all of them perishes in the very instant of its production.”

Marx

- “Nothing can have value without being an object of utility. If the thing is useless, so is the labor contained in it.”

Smith

- The man whose whole life is spent in performing a few simple operations ... becomes as stupid and ignorant as it is possible for a human creature to become.
- Labor determines the intrinsic value of a commodity and thus its exchange value.

Veblen

- The Theory of the Leisure Class
- Writes as much to infuriate as to instruct; thus it is the rich, not the workers, that attract his attention
- JNC: The Great Depression proved that economic conditions can be concluded as broken; thus, they needed fixing.

-

Language

- Grammar, rhetoric, logic are all concerned with language.
- The mood of the ancients and philosophers & theologians of the middle ages, for the most part, express a certain tolerance of the imperfections of the language.
- Men are duped or tricked by the tendency of words to counterfeit a reality which does not exist. This is particularly true of general or universal names (or words that signify nothing which can be perceived or imagined).
- The standards by which one man criticizes the language of another seem to depend upon what he holds to be true.
- The praise of mathematical symbolism indicates that one feature of the ideal is an exact correspondence between words and ideas.
- If there were a perfect one-to-one correspondence between physical symbols and mental concepts, there would never be any failures of communication. Men would be able to understand each other as well as if they could see directly into each other's minds.
- Though they still used external signs as a medium of communication, they would approx. the immediate communication which the theologians attribute to angels. In addition, the process of thinking itself, quite apart from communication, could be perfectly regulated by the rules of grammar—the rules for manipulating symbols.

Lavoisier

- “The word ought to produce the idea, and the ideas to be a picture of the fact.”

Hobbes

- Charges his opponents with the use of metaphors that conceal the insignificance of their speech.

Locke

- Concerning Human Understanding:
- Vague and insignificant forms of speech have been mistaken for deep learning; in reality they cover ignorance and hinder true knowledge.

The Great Ideas

Law

Nature law (not man made).

- Aquinas implanted in the very nature of things at their creation by God.

Human law (positive law, written law, civil law):

- Not innate as natural law.
- Something posited, something originated by man.

Locke

- The rules of positive law must be conformable to the law of nature (i.e. to the will of God).
- The municipal laws of any particular state are only so far right as they are founded on the law of nature, by which they are to be regulated and interpreted.
- So long as due process of law is available to remedy unjust ordinances or illegal acts, the individual is not justified in disobedience, for such action would unhinge and overturn, leave nothing but anarchy confusion. Nor is it effective for the individual to act alone in using force to resist tyranny or injustice. But if these illegal acts have extended to the majority of the people and they are persuaded in their consequences, that their laws, and with them their estates, liberties, and lives are in danger, and perhaps, their religion too, how they will be hindered from resisting illegal force used against them, I cannot tell. This is an inconvenience, I confess, that attends all governments. There is no alternative then but rebellion — “properly a state of war wherein the appeal lies only to heaven.”

Hobbes

- “Nothing the sovereign representative can do to a subject, on what pretense so ever, can properly be called injustice, or injury.”

Thoreau, Gandhi, ML King Jr

- Unjust laws, or laws which violate a man’s conscience exert no authority over them. Man is obliged in conscience not to await help from others or to be patient in the use of gradual means. He is obliged to act alone and at once.

Aquinas

- Unless what the law commands involves a transgression of God's commandments, an unjust law may be obeyed in order to avoid scandal or disturbance.

Liberty

Hobbes

- The natural freedom of man is not free will since every act of man's will proceeds from some cause.
- Liberty is not of the will but the freedom in doing what he has the will, desire, or inclination to do.
- The natural right of man is the liberty each man has to use his own power ... for the preservation of his own life. This liberty or natural right belongs to man only in a state of nature. When men leave the state of nature and enter the commonwealth, they surrender this natural liberty in exchange for a civil liberty which consists in nothing more than their freedom to do what the law of the state does not prohibit, or to omit doing what the law does not command.

Locke

- Agrees that man's natural liberty is not the freedom of his will in choosing but the freedom to do what he wills without constraint or impediment.

Adler

- Man does not lose their innate freedom when they live a civil society. Govts. May interfere with a man's actions, it cannot coerce his will.

Montesquieu

- Liberty can consist only in the power of doing what we ought to will and in not being constrained to do what we ought not to will.

Kant

- Freedom is independent of the compulsory will of another; and in so far as it can co-exist with the freedom of all according to a universal law, it is the sole, original inborn right belonging to every man in virtue of his humanity. There is, indeed, an innate equality belonging to every man which consists in his right to be independent of being bound by others to anything more than that to which he may also reciprocally bind them. The fundamental equality of men thus appears to be founded in their equal right to freedom; and that rests on the freedom of will which all men are born. The criterion of the good society is the realization of freedom.

Mill

- Freedom from government or social coercion is freedom for the max. development of individuality — freedom to be as different from all others as one's personal inclinations, talents, and tastes dispose one and enable one to be.
- It is desirable that in things which do not primarily concern others, individuality should assert itself. Liberty is undervalued as long as the free development of individuality is not

regarded as one of the principal ingredients of human happiness and indispensable to the welfare of society. The only freedom which deserves the name is that of pursuing our own good in our own way, so long as we do not attempt to deprive others of theirs, or impede their efforts to obtain it; for in proportion to the development of his individuality, each person becomes more valuable to himself, and is therefore capable of being more valuable to others.

Life and Death

Logic

Love

- Facts about love
 - There are many kinds, different in object, tendency, expression
 - Love frequently turns into its opposite: hate. Sometimes there is love and hate of the same object; sometimes love inspires hate.
 - There seems to be no happiness more perfect than that which love confirms. But there is also no misery more profound than that into which others are plunged when they are bereft, disunited. Is it better to have loved and suffered than never to have loved at all?

Observations about love

- Freud places the origin of love in the sexual instincts. The many varieties of love are simply the forms which love takes as the libido fixes upon various objects.
- Darwin maintains that associated animals have a feeling of love for each other, which is not felt by non-social adult animals.
- Dante maintains that hell is made by the absence of God's love--the punishment of those who on earth loved other things more than God.
- The author states that love retains some honor when it defies morality, at least according to the poets. Other transgressions, like greed and gluttony, do not.
- One thing seems to be clear: that both love and desire belong to the appetitive faculty, to the sphere of the emotions and the will rather than to the sphere of perception and knowledge.

Love vs. Desire

- Whereas nothing short of physical possession satisfies desire, love can be satisfied in the contemplation of its object's beauty or goodness.

Man

Mathematics

- Bacon: math should serve physics, not seek to dominate it.
- Hume: When mixed with physics, math remains subordinate.
- Galileo, Descartes, Newton seem to think as the structure of the world is math, so, too, must the science of nature be math.

- Newton's aim is to subject all the phenomena of nature to the laws of mathematics and to cultivate math as far as it relates to natural philosophy.

Russell on modern math:

- Math is the science in which we never know what we are talking about, nor whether what we are saying is true.
- Aristotle, Aquinas, Locke, and William James think of the objects of math as universals formed by abstraction from the particulars of sense and imagination.
- Aquinas: the mathematical do not subsist as separate beings. Apart from numbered things and physical configurations, numbers and figures have a separate existence only in the reason, in so far as they are abstracted from motion and matter.
- Hobbes, Berkeley, Hume: deny abstract ideas or universal concepts. Hume: let any man try to conceive a triangle in general, which is neither isosceles ... nor has any particular length or proportion of sides and he will soon perceive the absurdity of all the scholastic notions with regard to abstraction and general ideas.
- Kant and James think of math as a priori, not a posteriori.
- For James, Locke, Hume math is strictly a science of the relations between ideas, not of real existence.

Hardy

If useful knowledge is ... Knowledge which is likely to contribute to the material comfort of mankind ... then the great bulk of higher math is useless. As for the great modern mathematicians, "the world would have been as happy a place without them."

- The notion that all math truths can be strictly and formally deduced as stated by Russell and Whitehead, was widely accepted by mathematicians until the work of Godel in the early 1930s. Godel posed the problem of whether arithmetic was a consistent, logical system. Could one prove that it was impossible to deduce at the same time two incompatible arithmetical propositions? Godel's answer was no, it was not impossible. In other words, Godel showed that within the formal structure of arithmetic itself, there was no way of proving that arithmetic was internally consistent. Many mathematicians now accept the fact that there are math truths that cannot be proved formally. Godel's contributions was to deflate their exaggerated claim for logical rigor in math.

Matter

- Boswell in his "Life of Samuel Johnson" on Berkeley's ingenious sophistry to prove the non-existence of matter and that everything is ideal: I observed that though we are satisfied his doctrine is not true, it is impossible to refute it.

- Sometimes it is said that the essence of matter itself is extensions; sometimes that bodies—not matter itself—have the property of tridimensionality. But in either case that which is or has matter in it necessarily occupies space.
- The manner of that occupation is also generally agreed upon. Two bodies or two distinct quantities of matter cannot occupy the same place at the same time. A body may not be impenetrable in the sense of being indivisible, but so long as it remains the whole that it is, it offers resistance to other bodies tending to move into the place it occupies.
- Universal = intelligible
- Particular = sensible
- Atoms = insensible particle of matter; this may be due to our inability to sense them.
- Aristotle, Plotinus, Augustine, Aquinas all have different names for matter but they agree that matter can not have existence by itself or be an object of knowledge.

Berkely

- I do not argue against the existence of any one thing that we can apprehend either by sense or reflexion. Rather he denies that which philosophers call matter or corporeal substance.
- The rest of mankind does need to be instructed, however, that when they use the word “matter”, they speak of nothing. They may from careless habit suppose they referring to the most obvious something there is in the world—the solid, massy, concrete stuff of which tangible, visible, movable, and moving things are made. Of them, how do you know they exist. It is not itself perceptible. We perceive a variety of qualities—color, shape, etc.—but these have their being in being perceived. These qualities are not matter, but only properties. Matter itself is not sensible. Those who assert its existence postulate it as a substratum or support for the sensible qualities they perceive.
- Berkeley’s argument first denies Locke’s distinction between primary and secondary qualities. Colors, sounds, odors have no actual existence except in the perceiving mind. Secondly, Berkeley argues that matter is not needed as a substratum or support for the qualities we perceive.

Descartes and Locke

- Matter gives actuality to sensible bodies.

Aristotle and Plotinus

- Bodies would not exist at all if they were composed only of matter, for matter is no more than a capacity for being, not something which by itself actually is.

Lucretius, Hobbes

- Complete materialist: only body exist.

Descartes, Spinoza, Locke

- Bodies do not comprise the whole of existence, but matter is the whole substance of bodies.

Aristotle

- Matter (to Aristotle) – the capacity of being and not being (i.e. it has the capacity for change); think of the potentiality of wood to a craftsman.

Locke

- He may not insist upon the absolute indivisibility of the particles, or upon the eternity of the uncreated atoms of matter; but he, like Hobbes and Newton, carries the division of the familiar bodies of sense-experience down to parts which cannot be perceived and yet have, in a way, a more ultimate reality as units of matter than the complex bodies they constitute.

Mechanics

- Two points constitute the essence of mechanical theory:
 - Exclusive emphasis upon efficient causes (i.e. the exclusion of other type of causes, esp. final and formal causes from mechanical explanation). Efficient causality consists in one thing acting on another. An efficient cause is mechanical only if it consists in a moving body acting on another by impact.
 - Exclusive emphasis upon quantity, not qualities.

Newton

- In Mathematical Principles, he disavows once more any knowledge of gravity. It is enough that gravity does really exist, and acts according to the laws which we have explained, and abundantly serves to account for all the motions of the celestial bodies, and of our seas.
- Every particle of matter attracts every other particle of matter with a force proportional to the mass of each and to the inverse square of the distance between them.

Huygens' Wave Theory

- Light comes from the luminous body to our eyes by some movement impressed on the matter which is between the two.
- It resembles waves created when a stone is thrown into water.
- The matter between is called ethereal matter.

20th Century

- The true revolution in mechanics begins with the discovery of the quantum theory.
- No material object can move faster than the speed of light. This means that no influence of one object upon another that is caused by the propagation of a field can take place instantaneously. In this sense, there is no such action-at-a-distance in which objects influence each other instantaneously. Influences on the present that propagate to us from the past always take a finite amount of time in the process. That these influences can propagate in a vacuum is not regarded as a paradox, but rather as a fact.
- The so-called old quantum theory, began with Bohr, who attempted to account for the spectral light emitted by atoms when they are excited by such forces as electrical discharges. He argued that light was emitted when an electron made a quantum jump to the nucleus.
- The old quantum theory was replaced by quantum mechanics, the work of Heisenberg, Schrodinger, Pauli, and Dirac. In quantum mechanics, strictly speaking, there are no orbits. The fundamental quantity in the theory is the so-called wave function. Using this function,

one can compute the probability of finding, say, an electron at some point in space at a given time. The classical orbits of Newton and Einstein are positions in space where, on the average, electrons are most likely to be found.

- Most physicists now accept the fact that the objective reality of classical mechanics does not apply to subatomic phenomena.

Medicine

- The subordination of the medical art to nature seems to be the keystone of the whole structure of Hippocratic medicine. It is implied in the emphasis which Hippocrates places on the control of the patient's regimen, especially the elements of his diet, the exercise of his body, and the general circumstances of his life. Even in the treatment of acute diseases, Hippocrates looks to the regimen first, prescribing changes or special articles of diet.
- Medicines or drugs perform an auxiliary function. Surgery is always a last resort, to be used primarily in the treatment of injuries, and not to be employed in diseases which will yield to a course of regimen and medication. There is an element of violence in surgery which puts it last among the means of an art which should work by cooperating with nature rather than by operating on it. And among medicines, those are preferable which, like ptisan, a special preparation of barley water, derive their efficacy from properties similar to those of normal nutriment.
- According to Hippocrates, the control of regimen is not only the primary factor in therapy, but also the original principle of medicine. In the treatise *On Ancient Medicine*, he points out that "the art of medicine would not have been invented at first, nor would it have been made the subject of investigation (for there would have been no need for it), if when men are indisposed, the same food and other articles of regimen which they eat and drink when in good health were proper for them, and if no other were preferable to these ... The diet and food which people in health now use would not have been discovered, provided it suited man to eat and drink in like manner as the ox, the horse, and all other animals ... What other object, then, has he in view who is called a physician, and is admitted to be a practitioner of the art, who found out the regimen and diet befitting the sick, than he who originally found out and prepared for all mankind that kind of food which we all now use, in place of the former savage and brutish mode of living?"
- THE SAME CONCEPTION of medicine's relation to nature seems to be fundamental in Galen's thought. He attributes to Hippocrates his own reformulation of the insight that the art of healing consists in imitating the health-giving and healing powers of nature itself. The medical doctrines which he criticizes were based on the atomism of Epicurus. They regarded the body as a complex piece of machinery. When it gets out of order, it needs a mechanic and mechanical remedies to fix it. On the contrary, it seems to him, the living body is an organic unity, not an aggregation of atoms, or a system of interlocking parts.
- "Nature is not posterior to the corpuscles, but a long way prior to them," Galen writes. "Therefore it is nature which puts together the bodies both of plants and animals; and this she does by virtue of certain faculties which she possesses-these being, on the one hand,

attractive and assimilative of what is appropriate, and, on the other, expulsive of what is foreign.

Hippocratic Oath

- Implies intellectual as well as moral conditions to be fulfilled by health service providers.

Montaigne

- The patient's ignorance permits the physicians to claim credit for his successes and to blame fortune for his failures.

Moliere

- A doctor means no ill in anything that he does: "it's with the best faith in the world that he will finish you off, and in killing you he will do just what he has done to his wife and children, and what, if the occasion should arise, he will do to himself."

Memory and Imagination

- It is understood that memory and imagination depend upon sense perception or upon previous experience.
- Even when imagination outruns perception, it draws upon experience for the material it uses in its construction.
- Our mind reproduces sensory material; the image does not differ from the original sense impression.
- Russell regards Berkeley's argument as fallacious but admits that many philosophers, perhaps a majority, have held that there is nothing real except minds and their ideas.
- Experiments of Hermann Ebbinghaus that James reports:
 - Retention is affected by the strength of the original associations
 - Retention is also affected by the interval between the time of learning and the time of revival

Freud

- The things put out of mind are hindered from becoming conscious and forced to remain in the unconscious by a force (repression).

Freud's Theory of Dream Symbolism

- Holds that the dream as remembered is not the real thing at all, but a distortion substitute. Beneath what he calls the manifest dream-content, the actual moving images which occupy the dreaming consciousness, lie the latent dream-thoughts which are distorted in the actual dream. This distortion is due to the activities of censorship, directed against the unacceptable unconscious wish-impulses ... invariably of an objectionable nature, offensive from the ethical, aesthetic, or social point of view, things about which we do not dare to think at all, or

think of only with abhorrence. The repressed desires or wishes, the loves or fears, which the dreamer refuses to acknowledge consciously must, therefore, appear in dreams in a disguised form. The imagery of dreams seems to Freud to be a kind of language in which the repressed materials of thought and feeling employ a special symbolism to express what the moral censor will not permit us to express in the ordinary language of our conscious thought or social conversation.

- Repression occurred when a wish had been aroused, which was in sharp opposition to the other desires of the individual and was not capable of being reconciled with the ethical, aesthetic and personal pretensions of the patient's personality. The results of this struggle was repression.
- An overwhelming majority of symbols in dreams are sex symbols.
- Freud points out why it would be a mistake to treat dream symbols like the words of an ordinary language. Their object is not to tell anyone anything; they are not a means of communication; on the contrary, it is important to them not to be understood.

Metaphysics

- After physics.
- Some argue it is not a science because the objects investigated are not susceptible to scientific inquiry.

Kant

- Does not exclude it from science because it consists merely of synthetic propositions a priori.
- Metaphysics has for the proper object of its inquiries only three grand ideas: God, freedom, and immortality.

Planck

- "... the world of sensation is not the only world which may conceivably exist, but that there is still another world. To be sure this other world is not directly accessible to us, but its existence is indicated, time and again, with compelling clarity ... by the labors of science."
- "... scientists have learned that the starting point of their investigations does not lie solely in the perceptions of the senses, and that science cannot exist without some small portion of metaphysics."

Russell

- "Most of the great ambitious arguments of metaphysicians have proceeded by the attempt to prove that such and such apparent features of the actual world were self-contradictory, and therefore could not be real. The whole tendency of modern thought, however, is more and more in the direction of showing that the supposed contradictions were illusory, and that very little can be proved a priori from considerations of what must be."

Hume and Kant

- Deny metaphysics (so far as it is identified with what is traditionally natural theology) the status of a valid theoretical science.

Mind

- Most agree that thinking involves more than impressions from without.
- Most of the discussion focused on the argument for or against dualism.

Aristotle, Plato

- The human intellect or reason is a part of power of the soul, distinct from the senses, imagination, desire, passions

Aquinas

- The human intellect is like a clean tablet on which nothing is written.

Monarchy

- Govt. by one man.

Plato

- In *Statesman*, concludes that monarchy is better than aristocracy and democracy simply because gov't by one seems to be more efficient than gov't by a few or many.

Rousseau and Mill

- Identify the freedom of citizenship with republican or representative gov't.

Rousseau

- Every legitimate gov't is republican; monarchial always ranks below republican gov't.
-

Nature

- Nature = natural.
- Most of the terms which stand in opposition to nature represent the activity or being of man or God.
- Why is the whole world which man creates not as natural as the materials which man finds to work with?
- The making of a beehive by bees is natural; it is repeated the same each time.
- The making of city included variability (implies choice).
- Much discussion about what should be nature:

Those who believe Creationism would include the spiritual creations as natural (angels and souls).

- The Greek philosophers seem to restrict the natural to physical, sensible, material.
- Another discussion of nature occurs when we speak of each thing as having a nature of its own. This discussion of the "nature of" anything seems to be a discussion of what it is (stating its definition of what characterizes it).

Necessity and Contingency

- Necessity = must. Implies that which can not be otherwise.
- Contingency = may. Implies that which can be otherwise.
- Concerns of these terms appear in four areas:

Being Change Thought Action

- Adler says that this chapter is a summary of others using the two terms.
- A contingent event is one that can not be predicted with certainty.
- Example of explaining necessity, in this case as it applies to the will:

The alternatives to necessity are referred to as chance and as contingency.

- According to one opinion, every effect is necessarily determined by its causes and every cause necessarily produces certain effects; every future event is determined; nothing happens contingently or by chance.
- As INDICATED IN the chapter on CHANCE, two things must be distinguished here: the absolutely uncaused-the spontaneous or fortuitous-and the contingently caused, or that which depends upon the coincidence of a number of independent causes. A given condition may be necessary to produce a certain result, as, for example, oxygen may be necessary for combustion. But by itself it may not be sufficient for the production of that effect. If the maxim, "nothing exists without a cause of its existence," requires a cause or causes adequate to produce the effect, then the maxim is equivalent to the principle of sufficient reason. Whenever two or more causes, each of which may be necessary, are not sufficient in separation, the existence of the effect depends upon their combination; and the effect is contingent if the required combination of causes is itself not necessarily caused.
- The issue concerning contingency in nature thus seems to be more sharply stated when there is no reference to our knowledge or ignorance of causes. On this issue, Aristotle and Spinoza appear to be more clearly opposed to one another than Hume is to either.
- If things do not take place of necessity, "an event," according to Aristotle, "might just as easily not happen as happen; for the meaning of the word 'fortuitous' with regard to present or future events is that reality is so constituted that it may issue in either of two opposite directions." For example, "a sea-fight must either take place tomorrow or not, but it is not necessary that it should take place tomorrow, neither is it necessary that it should not take place, yet it is necessary that it either should or should not take place tomorrow." Though Aristotle holds that "one of the two propositions in such instances must be true and the other false," he also insists that "we cannot say determinately that this or that is false, but must leave the alternative undecided."

- Aristotle's view with regard to propositions about future particular events is that our judgments cannot be either true or false, not because of insufficient knowledge but because future particulars are in themselves always contingent. Nothing in the nature of things or causes necessarily determines them to happen. They will occur only if independent causes happen to coincide. Since these causes are independent, the coincidence will be one a matter of chance, not of necessity.

Calvin agrees with Augustine

He excludes the contingency which depends on human will.
No cause must be sought for but the will of God.

Spinoza

- Nothing is contingent; all things are determined from the necessity of the divine nature to exist and act in a certain manner.

Hume

- There is no such thing as chance in the world.
- Our ignorance prevents us from connecting the real cause to the effect; this shortcoming does not imply the nonexistence of a cause and its effect.

Adler

- To say as Hume does that chance has no place in nature may only mean that “nothing exists without a cause of its existence, rather than that whatever happens is necessarily determined by its causes.”

Aquinas

- God wills some things to be done necessarily, some contingently.

Oligarchy

- The rule of the few.

Smith

- Criticism of the oligarchic influences of modern parliamentary gov't.
- But whoever imagines that masters rarely combine is as ignorant of the world as of the subject. Masters are always and everywhere in a sort of tacit, but constant and uniform combination, not to raise the wages of labor above their actual rate. Sometimes they combine to sink wages below this rate.

Mills

- Speaks of the persevering attempts to keep down wages. “Does parliament ever for an instant look at any question with the eyes of the working man?”

One and Many

- Considerably vague. Look elsewhere.

Opinion

- Locke

The mind has two faculties conversant about truth and falsehood:

- Knowledge – the mind perceives and is undoubtedly satisfied of the agreement or disagreement of ideas
- Judgment – perceived (as above), but not presumed

- Knowable properties:

- Necessity
- Immutability
- Disctinctness
- Universality
- Clarity

- Opinion properties:

- Contingent
- Confused
- Variable
- obscure

- Plato

- Opinion – formed with the aid of sensation and without reason; always becoming, never really is

- Mills

Opinions S/B permmitted as long as they aid in the pursuit of the aid of truth

Opposition

- Every fundamental notion, such as chance to fate, pleasure to pain, implies its opposite. Some notions do not have readily terms for their opposites, such as poetry and mathematics, except maybe no poetry, and no mathematics.

- Opposition appears everywhere:

Mechanics: action, reaction

Survival: one against another

Socrates

- Everything has one and only one opposite.

Aristotle

- No truths are necessary or axiomatic unless their contradictories are self-contradictory. Is the truth of the proposition ‘The whole is greater than the part’ made necessary by the impossibility of the contradictory statement ‘The whole is not greater than the part’ on the theory that this latter statement is impossible because it is self-contradictory?

Kant

- Makes distinction between synthetic and analytic propositions and restricts the principle of contradiction to serving as a criterion of truth for analytic judgments alone. (Remaining discussion is too abstract.)

Hegel

- Contradictions imply one another and require each other.
- Contradictions are resolved, not by a choice between them, but a synthesis uniting the opposites and reconciling their differences.
- Example: Being is opposed by nonbeing.
- Except the absolute, everything which is also is not and everything which is not also is.
- The apparent contradiction involved between being, nonbeing is overcome by a third category, becoming, which is the synthesis of being and nonbeing.
- Every opposition in reality of thought is a phase in the progressive realization of the absolute, wherein all contradictions are resolved.

Philosophy

- What is the use of philosophy if it cannot be used like other sciences (i.e. more utility).
- Modern authors writings have the effect of giving the status of knowledge only math and the empirical sciences and reducing philosophy to the status of opinion.

Aristotle and Plato

- Philosophy is the highest use of man's faculties.

Augustine and Aquinas

- Neither dismiss philosophy as useless learning or as dangerous folly but neither do they admit the sufficiency of philosophy for knowledge of God.

Aquinas

- Obviously had some regard for philosophy because he opens Summa Theologic with "whether, besides the philosophical sciences, any further doctrine is required."

Hobbes and Descartes

- Refer to philosophy as a science. Descartes uses the words interchangeable.

Hume

- For Hume, it is the general name for the particular sciences. The authors of the books which are today regarded as among the foundations of modern science — Galileo, Newton, Faraday — refers to themselves as philosophers.

Kant

- Appears to be the first (in the great books at least) to make a sharp separation between empirical and rational investigated methods. He still uses the name science for both sorts of investigation but he appears to restrict philosophy to the latter (rational). Finally, in the 19th century the word science is restricted to math and to such knowledge of nature, man and society.

Freud

- Separation is an accomplished fact, and one which leaves to philosophy no problem that can be solved by science.

Wittgenstein

- “philosophy simply puts everything before us and neither explains nor deduces anything.”

Physics

- A science is not a physical science unless it investigates, observes, and measures the sensible or instrumentally detectable phenomena. If it has no concern with the phenomena of change, then it does not have the character of a physical or natural science.
- The Great Books of experimental physics seem to have three characteristics in common:
 - They insist upon experimentation as either the indispensable sources or the ultimate test of scientific formulation.
 - They tend to rely upon math as much as experiment, both for the formulation of nature’s laws and for the demonstration of consequences or correlatives of the primary laws.
 - Though experiments and observations multiply as science develops, they seek to bring all the phenomena of nature under the smallest number of generalizations, which have the utmost simplicity in mathematical statements.

Quantum Theory

- 1920’s
- Heisenberg, Shrodinger, Dirac, Bohr
- Most effective scientific theory ever formatted
- Does rely on probability, which Einstein felt (supposedly) diminished its credibility.

Pleasure and Pain

- The only way of knowing pleasure and pain, like other simple ideas, is via experience.
- Desire includes both the sensitive and the rational appetites— both the passions and the will.
- If pleasure and pain were simply sensations, like sensations of color or sound, they would pose a problem for the physiologists
- If pleasure and pain were simply sensations, like sensations of color or sound, they would pose a problem for the physiological psychologist no different from the problems which arise in the fields of vision and audition. Modern pyhsiological research claims to have discovered

differentiated nerve endings for pain which, together with the specific sense organs for pressure, heat, and cold, make up the cutaneous senses. But whether there are special cells for the reception of pain stimuli or whether cutaneous pain results from the too intense stimulation of the pressure and thermal nerve endings, there seems to be no evidence or organs sensitized to pleasure as, for example, the nerve cells of the retina are sensitized to light. The feeling of pleasure, it would seem to follow, is not a sensation. This seems to be confirmed by the traditional observation that every type of sensation, including the sensation of pain, can be pleasant.

- Even' if pain, unlike pleasure, is found to be a specific mode of sensation with a special sense organ of its own, all other types of sensation-visual, auditory, olfactory, etc.might still have painfulness or a feeling of unpleasantness as an attribute. That such is the case seems to be a matter of traditional observation. Locke, for example, says that "delight or uneasiness, one or the other of them, join themselves to almost all our ideas of sensation and reflection: there is scarce any affection of our senses from without ... which is not able to produce in us pleasure or pain." So understood, pleasure and pain-or the pleasant and the unpleasant-are not opposite sensations, as are hot and cold, but contrary attributes with which every sort of sensation can be affected. All need not be. Some sensations may be neutral with respect to what psychologists call "affective tone" or "affective quality."
- The kind of pleasure and pain which is called "bodily" or "sensuous" would thus be sensuous because it is an attribute of sensations, and bodily because sensations involve bodily organs. But in almost every great discussion of pleasure and pain, other types are recognized: intellectual delights, the pleasures and pains of learning, aesthetic pleasure in contemplating beauty with the mind as well as with the senses, and the pain of loss, the grief accompanying deprivation, which is so different from the torment of a painful affliction of the senses. The human suffering with which the great poems deal is much more often a torment of the spirit than of the flesh.

Happiness in Relation to Pleasure

- Aristotle and Mill: Happiness consists in having all desires satisfied. A happy life can be either in terms of the goods which the happy man possesses or in terms of the pleasures which accompany the goods possessed.

Pleasure and Pain in Learning

- Almost unanimous voice of the pleasure all men find in knowing and the pain none can avoid in the process of pursuing truth. The pain in the pursuit of truth gradually diminishes as the mind learns how to learn.

Freud

- Our entire psychic activity is bent upon procuring pleasure and avoiding pain.
- The pleasure-principle automatically regulates the operation of the mental apparatus. Pleasure is in some way connected with lessening, lowering or extinguishing the amount of stimulation in the mental apparatus and that pain involves a heightening of the latter.

- The pleasure-principle is not the only regulator of mental life. In addition to the sexual instincts, which aim at gratification and pleasure, there are the ego-instincts which, “under the influence of necessity, their mistress, soon learn to replace the pleasure-principle by a modification of it. The task of avoiding pain becomes for them almost equal in importance to that of gaining pleasure; the ego learns that it must inevitably go without immediate satisfaction, postpone gratification, learn to endure a degree of pain, and altogether renounce certain sources of pleasure. Thus trained, the ego becomes ‘reasonable’, is no longer controlled by the pleasure-principle, but follows the reality-principle, which at bottom also seeks pleasure, although a delayed and diminished pleasure, one which is assured by its realization of fact, its relation to reality.”

Marcus Aurelius

- Pleasure is neither good nor useful nor is pain an evil, for when we are pained by any external thing we should remember that it is not this thing which disturbs us, but our judgment about it.

Pascal

- The fact that men spend their time in following a ball or a hare indicates how deep is the misery from which men try to escape through play and pleasure. Men need such diversions in order to prevent them from thinking of themselves.

Poetry

- The contemporary reader should know that epics and drama may be written either as prose or verse.

Voltaire

- Seems to conclude that a great poet never makes a rhyme at the expense of sense.

Aristotle

- In his Poetics his emphasis is not upon the devices of the language but upon the subject matters: construction of the plot, the development of characters, etc. The poet or maker should be the maker of plots rather than of verses.
- Style advice:
 - Be clear without being ordinary
 - Must have some lofty diction
 - Use phrases which are not part of current idiom (this give distinction to style)
 - Must have a command for metaphor

Augustine

- Why is it that men enjoy feeling sad at the sight of tragedy and suffering on the stage, although they would be most unhappy if they had to endure the same fate? The more a man is subject to such suffering himself, the more easily he is moved by it in the theatre.

- When man suffers himself we call it misery; when he suffers out of sympathy for others, we call it pity. But what sort of pity can we really feel for an imaginary scene on the stage?

Principle

- One way we use principle, when we use it as moral principles or political principles:
 - As rules of conduct, or
 - As standards by which to measure and judge human acts or political events.
- Principle, according to its Latin derivation, means a beginning or a foundation. Since priority may be either absolute or relative, “first principle” is not a redundancy.
- Second use of principle:
 - Principles in relation to conclusion or as the foundation of a science.
 - They must be first logically, as premises are logically prior to a conclusion.
- Third use of principle:
 - Refers to reality apart man. For example, matter and form, to Aristotle, are the principles of a physical substance.

Russell

- What actually happens is that we realize some particular application of the principle, then we realize the particular is irrelevant, and that there is a generally which may equally be affirmed. In addition to their characteristic of generality, principles seem to have quality of underlying or the source of things.
- We say a govt. act is unprincipled not to condemn a particular act but accuse govt of having no uniform policy or serve as a foundation for the act.

Aristotle

- We never deliberate about the end to be sought, only the means.
- Perceived particulars function as principles.
- “Intuitive reason” is the faculty which apprehends first principles.
- Perception is intuitive reason.
- Perception is one of two ways in which we apprehend the particular facts which are principles in practical reasoning.

- First principles are received by induction, perception, and habituation (morals rec'd this way).

Kant

- Principle is the general proposition which serve as the major premises in reasoning. Principles's express reason's understanding of universal and necessary relationship..

Progress

- The idea is modern.
- The theory of evolution suggest the general motion in the world is a progress from lower to higher forms.
- For the most part moderns are optimistic about progress: an inevitable development from less to more advanced stages of civilization, according to a dialectal pattern of conflict and resolution with each resolution necessarily rising to a higher level.

Waddington

- The changes brought about by evolution will always be an improvement.

Stephen Jay Gould

- Evolution is wholly unrelated to any form of human progress.

Prophecy

- Predict the future.
- Sometimes scientific prediction may be accompanied by attribution of moral qualities but usually they connote nature's indifference to man's welfare.
- Jewish and Christian prophecy addresses man as a responsible agent, who, even when he knows something of God's will, remains free to will good or evil for himself.
- Augustine refers to astrology as an insane and impious ritual.
- Hebrew prophets get theirs directly from God.
- There is prophetic doctrine in the Old and New testament.
- Aquinas and Augustine both agree that the time for the end of the world is hidden from men.
- Christ responding tot he apostles when the asked of his second coming, "it is not for you to know the time or moments which the Father hath put in his own powe."
- Greatest prophecy in Judeo-Christian religion: th birth of Christ.

- Christians believe the greatest messianic prophecy has been fulfilled: Jesus had come, sacrificed his life and arisen. The proof? The number of testimonies and the 4,000 year succession of men who say so.

Prudence

Punishment

Quality

- Kant and Aristotle agree that the categories signify real, not verbal, distinction.
- In one sense, no one questions the existence of qualities, as they do the existence of substances.
- The notion of qualities existing in themselves and not as the qualities of anything seems to be self-contradictory.
- Qualities have variation of degree, substances do not.

Locke

- The power to produce in us ideas of the object; for example, a snowball produces the ideas of white, cold and round.
- They exist in the object.
- Primary qualities:

Not separate from the body

Found in body which has bulk enough to be perceived

Solidity, extension, figure, number

- Secondary qualities:

Colors, sounds, tastes, etc.

Nothing in the objects themselves but powers to produce various sensations in us by their primary qualities

- Think of pain:
- A piece of steel has the power to produce pain in us, it does not have the quality of pain.

Descartes

- Nothing belongs to the nature or essence of body except length, breadth, etc.
- Colors, orders, etc. are merely sensations existing in our thoughts.

Berkeley

- Makes no distinction between primary and secondary qualities.

Aristotle

- Substances change, but qualities do not; substance in changing, passes from one quality to its contrary. A man changes from good to bad, quality makes no change.

Spinoza

- Substance is that which exist in itself.
- Mode is that which exist in another thing.

Quantity

- Once difference between quality and quantity: qualities are subject to variation in degree, quantities do not.
- Terms like quantity and quality do not appear to be susceptible of definition.
- Two principle species of quantity: number and magnitude. Russell and Whitehead wish to add relations and order.
- Western thought:
 - Quantities are primary
 - Bodies only have quantitative attributes
 - Sensible qualities (color, odors, etc.) have no reality apart from experience
 - The notion of matter and quantity to be inseparably associated.

Aristotle

- Whereas quality has a contrary, quantities do not (with a few exceptions). You may one thing as large, another as small, but the sizes of each are not contrary to one another.
- The objects of math is quantities abstracted from sensible matter.
- The most distinctive mark of quantity is equality and inequality.

Reasoning

- Syllogism:
 - Premise:
 - All men are mortal,
 - Socrates is as man;
 - Conclusion:
 - Therefore, Socrates is mortal.
- The premise yield the conclusion.
- Reason is merely that mode of thought which is a process.
- For Plotinus any form of thinking signifies a deficiency or weakness. Man is the lowest of intellectual beings. On the other hand God transcends thought; he is above reason.
- Instinct is considered higher intellectually.
- A priori is reasoning from principles.

- A posteriori is reasoning from experience.

Newton

- Analysis — going from effects to causes.
- Synthesis — goes from causes to effects.

Mill

- From the conclusion of a syllogism, one learns nothing more than one already knew in the premises; whereas in inductive reasoning, the mind goes beyond anything contained in the premises and genuinely discovers a new truth.

Descartes

- The syllogistic forms are of no aid in perceiving the truth about objects.

Locke

- All right reasoning may be reduced to forms of syllogisms yet it is not the best way of reasoning for the leading of those into truth who are willing to find it and desire to make the best use of their reason for attainment of knowledge. The rules of syllogism serve not to furnish the mind with those intermediate ideas that may show the connection of remote ones. This way of reasoning discovers no new proofs, but is the art of marshalling and ranging the old ones we have already. The 47th proposition of the first book of Euclid, is very true; but the discovery of it, I think, not owing to any rules of common logic. A man knows first, and then he is able to prove syllogistically; so that syllogism comes after knowledge, and then a man has little or no need of it. Syllogism, at best, is but the art of fencing with the little knowledge we have, without making any addition to it.

James

- Reasoning is a selective activity of the mind which serves an individual purpose.

Descartes and Intuition

- The way in which we know certain truths immediately and with certitude.
- Deduction supplements intuition, but it is never at any stage of the reasoning process independent of intuition.
- Not only does intuition, according to Descartes, supply the first principles or ultimate premises of reasoning, but it also certifies each step in the process.

Relation

- Perhaps the prototype of an indefinable notion.
- Any term which is essentially relative is also to be incapable of definition, that is, its meaning cannot be stated without referring to its correlative.

- Asymmetrical relation: Parent and child. It cannot be said that if “A” is a parent of “B” that “B” is also a parent of “A”.
- Symmetrical relation: If we say that “A” is the brother of “B”, we can also say that “B” is the brother of “A”.
- “To-the-right-of” is an asymmetrical spatial relation. “Next-to” is symmetrical. In time, “simultaneous-with” is symmetrical and “prior-to” asymmetrical.
- The relation of father to son or of “standing-next-to” in space is intransitive, for if “A” is the father of “B”, and “B” is the father of “C”, “A” is not the father of “C”.
- The spatial relation of “standing-to-the-right” is transitive, for if “A” is to the right of “B”, and “B” to the right of “C”, then “A” is to the right of “C”.
- All our knowledge of matters of fact depend upon the association of ideas, or the relations of resemblance, contiguity, and causation among the elements of experience. All other knowledge has for its object those relations between ideas which do not connect them causally or place them in a spatial or temporal order. In either case, relations of all sorts, rather than things and their properties (or substances and their attributes), seem to be the prime constituents of nature and of knowledge.

Absolute vs. Relative

- Planck: “Everything that is relative presupposes the existence of something that is absolute.”
- Any value is absolute if it is immutable and does not vary with time, place, and circumstance; it is relative when it varies in relation to differences in time, place, and circumstances. Things are said to be considered absolutely when they are considered in themselves, and relatively when they are considered with reference to something else.

-

Aristotle

- Terms like much and better seem to be quantitative but they are relations; for things are great or small absolutely; they are so called rather as the result of an act of comparison. All relatives have a correlative.

Russell

- It seems to be impossible to make any statement of what relation is without using the notion of relation in doing so.

Religion

- Two opposing definitions of religion:

Those who conceive it as having a supernatural foundation in God’s revelation and authority

- This view is the basis for anthropology, the study to discover correlations between different types of religions and different types of social organizations.
- Adler refers to others and quotes: “the course of nature is to some extent elastic or variable, and that we can persuade or induce the mighty beings who control it to deflect, for our

benefit, the current of events from the channel in which they would otherwise flow.” In this sense, religion is like magic.

- Those who deny this supernatural, according to those of faith, either lack the gift of faith or the wish to have it. Those who deny explain that it is an illusion to suppose faith is God’s gift rather than man’s own will to believe.
- Those who think of religion as having a purely natural origin in certain human tendencies. This group lack the intense religious faith; instead they study its social and cultural significance. Here religion does not demand that inner devotion and external conduct constitute the practice of a man’s belief if he is to avoid hypocrisy.

Sacred Books

- For the Muslims, the Koran is the word of God revealed to His one and only prophet.
- For the Jews, the Old Testament is divinely inspired writing.
- The Christians believe both Testaments as Holy Writ.

Locke on Revelation and Faith

- ”...the testimony [revelation] is of such a one as cannot deceive, nor be deceived, and that is of God himself. This [revelation] carries with it an assurance beyond doubt, evidence beyond exception.” Our acceptance of it is faith. Man must understand it to be divine revelation and that Man understand it to be right.

Hobbes

- Faith is a gift of God, which man can neither give nor take away by promises of rewards or menaces of torture.
- Faith depends only upon certainty or probability of arguments drawn from reason or from something men believe already.
- Faith does not come by supernatural inspiration or infusion.
- Faith comes by education, discipline, correction, and other natural ways, by which God worketh them in his elect, at such time as he thinketh fit.
- When we believe that the Scriptures are the word of God, having no immediate revelation from God himself, our belief, faith, and trust is in the Church, whose word we take, and acquiesce therein.”

Aquinas

- The articles of religious faith may be drawn from the content of Holy Writ, but that Holy Writ is the revealed truth of God must first be accepted by an act of faith.

Marx

- Religion is a social imposture. To theologians, every religion but their own is an invention of man, while their own religion is an emanation of God.

- Religion plays a large part in preventing revolution, which he sees as the only escape of the workers from oppression. Religion is the opiate of the masses.

Freud

- Religion is a neurotic need. If a man does not have science or art to live by, he must have religion, for “life as we find it is too hard for us and we cannot do without palliative remedies.” “The point which is being called in question is whether there is a divine spirit and a revelation; and it surely cannot be a conclusive reply to say that the question cannot be asked because the Deity cannot be called in question.”

Pascal

- “... the Christian faith goes mainly to establish these two facts:

The corruption of nature

- The redemption of Christ”
- Christianity has certain unique signs of truth:

Worships one God as the origin of everything.

- The obligation to love God.
- Must be aware of human lust and weakness.
- There must be remedies for #3. Christianity has prayer.
- No other religion has asked of God the power to love and follow him.

Hume

- Mere reason is insufficient to convince us of the veracity of the Christian religion (and their miracles). You must have faith, which subverts all the principles of his understanding and gives one a determination to believe what is most contrary to custom and experience.

Interpretation

- Augustine on People who insist on their own interpretation: “They have no knowledge of the thoughts in his [the author of the book in the bible] mind, but they are in love with their own opinions, not because they are true, but because they are their own.”
- Aquinas summarizes what he takes to be Augustine’s two rules:
 - Hold the truth of the scripture without wavering.
 - Since the Holy scripture can be explained in a mutliplicity of senses, one should adhere to a particular explanation only in such measure as to be ready to abandon it, if it be proved with certainty to be false; lest the Holy Scripture be exposed to the ridicule of unbelievers, and obstacles be placed to their believing.

Revolution

Rhetoric

- In addition to movement to action, the orator also hopes to make an impression of good character, integrity, etc.

Broader View

- Merge rhetoric with poetic to arrive at the art of eloquence in any discussion.

Narrower View

- The art of persuasion in practical affairs. Actually the objective is action, not persuasion. Usually restricted to moral and political problems.

Aristotle

- Rhetoric and dialectic are faculties for providing arguments.
- Rhetoric is for persuading an audience.
- Dialectician is concerned with carrying on a dispute in which two individuals may be privately engaged.

Same and Other

Aristotle

- The specific difference between man and ass with respect to rationality, accompanied by their generic sameness with respect to animality, makes them similar. If they were utterly diverse, i.e., the same in no respect, they would not be said to differ; just as if they were identical in all respects except number, they would not be called similar. The other and the same are thus opposed. But difference is not the same as otherness.

Canady

- If you speak of something as different, you are attempting to compare it. If you find a difference, there must be similarities.

James

- No two things can be utterly incomparable: a cigarette and a dollar bill are at least “enjoyable”.

Science

- One conception: science is a rigorous demonstration of conclusions from axioms.
- The conception of science as knowledge founded upon experiment (or extended observations) seems to be ancient as well as modern.

Freud

- Religion alone is a really serious enemy to the dominion of science over man and society. Religions and science might be compatible if religion would only say “It is fact that I cannot give you what men commonly call truth; to obtain that, you must go to science.” But religion

can not say that without losing all influence over the masses of mankind and science cannot yield at all in its claim to being the only avenue to truth.

- Philosophy parts company with science by clinging to the illusion that it can produce a complete and coherent picture of the universe. As such, philosophy must be regarded as an impostor in the halls of knowledge.
- The picture that philosophy tries to construct falls to pieces with every new advance in our knowledge. Not itself knowledge, but mere opinion or speculation, philosophy does not, any more than religion, offer a substitute for science.
- Hobbes: science begins with definition. Freud expresses the opposite view; the true beginning is with describing phenomena and then proceeding to group, classify, correlate.
- Physics, math and metaphysics proceed in the same way: by the demonstration of conclusions from principles obtained by induction from experience (sensory).

James

- The scientist describes the phenomena as precisely as possible as comprehensively, but without any implication of finality or totality. He recognizes his work is always tentative, always subject to the discovery of new data. Above he admits that he is only describing, not explaining.
- All attempts to explain our phenomenally given thoughts as products of deeper-lying entities ... are metaphysical.

Einstein

- Science without religion is lame; religion without science is blind.

Sense

- With few exceptions, notably Berkeley and Hume, the existence of a sensible world of material things is not denied or seriously doubted.

Aristotle and Aquinas

- The intellect abstracts all its ideas from the particular of sense.

Hobbes, Berkeley

- There is nothing in the understanding which has not first of all been in the senses.
- But Descartes offers the ideas of God as contrary examples to Hobbes, Berkeley.

Russell

- Common sense unhesitatingly asserts the existence of a world that is independent of out individual sense impressions.
- Sense data is private to each person.

James

- Hearing a sound is having a sensation but perception occurs when we hear a sound and say a "horse-car".
- Perception differs from sensation by the consciousness of further facts associated with the objects of sensation.

- All forms of consciousness are somehow functions of the brain.

Berkely, Hume, Hobbes

- Man has no abstract ideas or universal concepts; all the operations of thought are merely elaborations of the original impressions of sense.

Hobbes

- The cause of sense is the external object, which is presseth the organ proper to each step; sensible qualities are motions of the matter that presseth our organs.

Aristotle

- Sleep can only occur in those living things which have the power of sense perception.

Sign and Symbol

- A sign points to something.
- A symbol stands for or takes the place of another thing.
- Nonetheless, used interchangeability words are signs or symbols.
- Sign or symbol, one term in a relation, the relation being one of meaning.

Natural signs

- Apart from any intention or desire of using them as signs, do yet lead to the knowledge of something: smoke to fire.

Conventional signs (words)

- Those which people mutually exchange for the purpose of showing the feelings of their minds, their perceptions, their thoughts.

Locke and Aristotle

- Spoken words are the symbols of mental expense.
- Written words are the symbols of the spoken words.

Locke

- Words stand for ideas, not the thing.

Aristotle

- Words stand for ideas and things.

Aquinas

- It is impossible for words to signify things directly without meditation of ideas.
- Words ► ideas ► thing.

Wittgenstein

- To determine the use of a word one must look to its use in language.

Russell

- Common and proper names are best expressed in terms of definite and indefinite description, such as done when using the article “a” and “the”.

Hobbes

- Some words are the name of the things conceived; others are the names of the imaginations themselves; i.e. those ideas or mental images we have of all the things we see and remember. And others are names of names (plural is a name of a name).

Aristotle

- Two things are equivocal when they have the same name yet the definition corresponding with the name differs. Metaphoric type of equivocation. Occurs when we call a pig and man a pig.
- Metaphors are of two types:
 - Some are based on a direct similitude between two things in some accidental respect: a man is a pig.
 - Some are based on analogies or proportion: King is the father of his people.
- To grasp the various spiritual meanings, the reader must understand that in Holy Scripture, “divine things are metaphorically described by means of sensible things.” Sacraments, for example, use physical things to serve the meaning of spiritual grace. Whereas theologians maintain that metaphors serve a useful purpose in scripture, sacred doctrine.
- Philosophers and scientist often take an opposite view that metaphors have a place only in poetry and should be avoided in the exposition of knowledge.

Augustine

- A sign is a thing which, over and above the impression it makes on the senses, causes something else to come into mind as a consequence of itself.
 - Some things are simply things
 - Some are not things, but also signs of other things
 - Some things, such as words, are never employed except as signs

Sin

- Satan is highest among the angels, the first of God’s spiritual creatures. He is only less than God in the perfection of his nature. Adam is created with supernatural graces and gifts, his immortal body is completely responsive to his spirit, his appetite in all things is submissive to his reason, and his reason is turned toward God, according to the original justice which harmonized his faculties and the elements of his nature.

- The only evil latent in either Satan or Adam would seem to reside in the privation of infinite being, power, and knowledge. But this is not a moral evil in them; it is neither a sin nor a predisposition to sin. Hence the only cause of their sinning, if God himself does not predestine them to sin, must be a free choice on their part between good and evil. If God positively predestines them to sin, then they would seem to be without responsibility, and so without sin. If they are not predetermined to evil, how does the conflict arise in them which opens the choice between good and evil and impels them, almost against the inclination of their natures, away from good and toward evil?
- In the pagan and Judeo-Christian conceptions of sin, the fundamental meaning seems to depend upon the relation of man to the gods or to God, whether that itself be considered in terms of law or love. The vicious act may be conceived as one which is contrary to nature or reason. The criminal act may be conceived as a violation of the law of man, injurious to the welfare of the state or to its members. Both may involve the notions of responsibility and fault. But unless the act transgresses the law of God, it is not sinful. The divine law which is transgressed may be the natural law that God instills in human reason, but the act is sinful if the person who commits the act turns away from God to the worship of love of other things.
- To disbelieve in God, in divine law and divine punishment, is also to disbelieve in sin— at least in the sense in which religious men have distinguished between saints and sinners, between the righteous and the wicked in the eyes of God.
- To Pascal, there are only two kinds of men: the righteous who believe themselves sinners; the rest, sinners, who believe themselves righteous.

Freud

- People feel guilty when they have done something they know to be bad. But then one sees how little this answer tells one. What accounts for the judgment a man makes of himself as good or bad? Freud's answer is that what is bad is, to begin with, whatever causes one to be threatened with a loss of love; because of the dread of this loss, one must desist from it. That is why it makes little difference whether one has already committed the bad deed or only intends to do so.
- The external authority of the father and, through him, of society becomes, according to Freud, internalized by the development of a superego.
- Applies his theory of the origin of feelings of guilt (in the dread of authority and later in the dread of the superego) to the religious sense of sin. Jews believed themselves to be the favorite child. God hurled visitation upon them. Their faith remained firm. They introduced prophets and professed their sins to them. Out of guilt they constructed commandments.
- Religion has sought to save mankind from this sense of guilt which they call sin. Jesus takes the common guilt of all upon himself and sacrifices himself.

Milton's Paradise Lost

- God says of Adam: “I made him just and right, sufficient to have stood, though free to fall.”
- Of Satan and fallen angels, as well as of Adam, God observes:

They therefore as to right belonged,
So were created, nor can justly accuse
Their maker, or their making, or their Fate:
As if Predestination over-ruled
Their will, disposed by absolute Decree
Of high foreknowledge; they themselves decreed
Their own revolt, not I: if I foreknew,
Foreknowledge had no influence on their fault,
Which had no less prov’d certain unforeknown.
- There is a difference between Adam and Satan. The fallen angels by their own suggestion fell, self-tempted, depraved. Satan, having sinned, becomes man’s tempter. Man falls deceived by the other first: Man therefore shall find grace, the other income.
- The serpent speaks as a man to Adam and Eve: if they too partake, “shall be as Gods, knowing both Good and Evil as they know.” Eve succumbs and, as Milton tells the story, Adam, knowing fully the evil of the act, joins Eve in disobedience, not from envy of the gods, but out of love for her, willing to die because unwilling to live without her.
- In the poet’s expansion of the third chapter of Genesis, the basic elements in the Judeo-Christian conception of sin seem to be plainly accented: the pride and envy which move Satan and Eve, the disobedience which results from the disorder of Adam’s loving Eve more than he loves God.

Dante’s The Divine Comedy

- Adam speaks to Dante in Paradise and tells him that “the tasting of the tree was not in itself the cause of so long an exile, but solely the overpassing of the bound. Beatrice: in order to redeem man from sin, the Word of sin assumed human nature, the nature which had estranged itself from its Maker. Beatrice: this nature, which was thus united to its Maker, was, when it was created, pure and good; but by its own self it had been banished from Paradise, because it turned aside from the way of the truth and its proper life. Man can fall from his nobility by sin alone which disfranchises it and makes it unlike the Supreme Good, so that it is little illumined by Its light; and to its dignity it never returns unless, where fault has emptied, it fill up with just penalties against evil delight.

Spinoza

- In the state of nature, sin is not conceived; in a civil state, sin is disobedience to civil customs.

Calvin

- Original sin resulted from Adam’s exercise of free will. After that, man lost his freedom of choice.

Slavery

- Most of the ancients agree that tyrannical rule, the perversion of govt., is a kind of slavery.

Montesquieu and Aristotle

- For certain races of mankind subjection or slavery may be justified.

Mill

- At a certain stage of political development, subjection may be necessary for a time in preparation for citizenship.

The other evil sense of slavery:

Spinoza

- Human bondage: the condition of men enslaved by the tyranny of their passions.

Hobbes and Locke

- Maintained that the vanquished in war must pay for being allowed to live by submitting to slavery.

Natural Slavery

- One who is born a slave (not merely born of slaves and into slavery).

Slave by force or law

- Born a natural fit for freedom, is made a slave, either because
- His parents were slaves
- He was sold into slavery
- He forfeits his freedom

Aristotle (doctrine of natural slavery)

- The lower sort are by nature slaves and it is better for them as for all inferiors that they should be under the rule of a master
- Some are by nature free and others slaves, and that for these later slavery is both expedient and right.

Rousseau, Kant, Hegel, Mill

- All men are by nature born to be free.

Augustine and Aquinas

- Though slavery is instituted by nature it is not contrary to natural law or to the will of God.

Augustine

- Slavery is introduced by sin (punishment), not nature.

Aquinas

- Insitutional slavery seems due to the fallen nature of men (the penal consequence of original sin).
- Something can be according to natural law in two ways.
 - Because nature inclines thereto. Example: Nakedness is natural because nature did not give one clothes. So then men are by nature free because slavery was not instituted by nature by devised by human reason.
 - Because nature does not require the contrary.

Montesquieu

- Climate is the cause of slavery and to some extent its excuse.
- Where the excess fo heat enervates the body and renders the men so slothful and dispirited that nothing but the fear the chastisement can oblige them to peform any laborious duty.
- In arguing the right of Europeans to make slaves of the negroes: it is impossible for us to suppose these creatures to be men, because, allowing them to be men, a suspicion would follow that we ourselves are not christians.

Hegel

- On the enslavement of African negroes by Europeans: “Bad as this way be, their lot in their own land is even worse, since there a slavery quite as absolute exists.”

Mill

- Like Hegel, slavery is a stage to political life. A slave property so called is a being who has not learnt to help himself ... They have to be taught self-govt...”

Hobbes

- Men in a state of nature are free; they can actually enjoy as much feedom as they power to secure. Yet the natural right of mastership depends not merely upon victory in war, but upon a covenant into which the vanquished enter voluntarily to give their labor to avoid death.

Kant

- A contract by which the one party renounces his whole freedom for the advantage of the other, ceasing thereby to be a person and consequently having no duty even to observe a contract, is self-contradictory, and is therefore of itself null and void.

Hegel

- Agreeing that such a contract is a nullity, Hegels holds that the slave has an absolute right to free himself, but adds that if a man is a slave, his own will is responsible for his slavery ... Hence the wrong of slavery lies at the door not simply enslavess or conquerors, but of the slaves and the conquered themselves.

Boswell

- To abolish a status which in all ages God has sanctioned and man has continued would not only be robbery to an innumerable class of our fellow-subjects; but it would be extreme cruelty to the African savages, a portion of whom it saves form massacre or intolerable

bondage in their own country, and introduces into a much happier state of life, esp. now when their passage to the West Indies and there treatment there is humanely regulated.

The Federalist

- Constitution postponed until 1808 the importation of slaves.
- The Federalist defending the Constitution's apportionment of representation: "determined by adding to the whole number of free persons, including those bound to service for a term of yrs. , and excluding Indians not taxed, 3/5 of all other persons. Thus, the negro slave is reduced 2/5 property, 3/5 person.

Marx

- Because a laborer is forced to sell his labor power in the open market in order to subsist, his so-called freedom as a pious fiction. The contract by which he sold to the capitalist his labor-power proved in black and white that he disposed of himself freely. The bargain concluded, it is discovered that he was no free-agent, that the time for which he is free to sell his labor-power is the time for which he is forced to sell it. The chief difference between a bonded-slave and a wage-earner is that the wage-earner has the legal right to organize and strike.

Soul

Aquinas

- Agrees with Aristotle
- Man has a body and soul. The soul, though created, is immortal. Also known as spirit.
- Men can not think without images
- Disagreeing with Locke: Thinking can not be performed by matter
- There is nothing of a penal nature in the soul's union with the body in spite of the scripture "the corruptible body weighted down the soul, and the earthly tabernacle presseth down the mind." To Augustine, this does not mean that the flesh is evil in itself, but that man is beset by sin when "the flesh lusteth against the spirit." Augustine: man is both body and soul and one should not extol one above the other.
- "If the entire nature of man were to be a soul--the soul making use of the body as an instrument--there would be no need for the resurrection of the body after the Last Judgment." "The soul, as part of human nature, has its natural perfection only as united to the body."

Augustine

- To Aquinas: There is nothing of a penal nature in the soul's union with the body in spite of the scripture "the corruptible body weighted down the soul, and the earthly tabernacle presseth down the mind." To Augustine, this does not mean that the flesh is evil in itself, but that man is beset by sin when "the flesh lusteth against the spirit." Augustine: man is both body and soul and one should not extol one above the other.

Berkeley

- The soul is immortal

Christians

- Believe in the immortality of the soul

General

- Soul is generally viewed as the spiritual component, whereas the body is the material.
- The major question seems to be whether the body and soul are separate or “is the soul the substantial form of an organic body, with the consequence that the form and matter together constitute a single composite substance, which is the living thing?”
- Other questions concerning the soul?
 - Does it exist before being united to the body?
 - Does it exist after the union with the body is dissolved?
 - How does it exist when it exists separately from matter?

James

- Finds the concept useless so far as accounting for the actually verified facts of conscious experience goes
- Our findings have not established its nonexistence; they have only proved its superfluity for scientific purposes

Kant

- It is impossible to reach any conclusion about the existence of the soul.
- As for the existence of the soul:
- The premises does not support the conclusion. The “I” in “I think, therefore I am” does not give us intuitive knowledge of a really existing substance. The soul is a substance in idea only, not in reality. To say that it exist becomes a matter of faith.

Locke

- The idea of soul is as clear as our idea of body.

Lucretius

- The soul is composed of material particles within the framework of the body
- The soul can not be evidenced by direct observation but is inferred to exist much like the unobserveable atoms, which explain the constitution and change of all natural objects.

Plato

- Soul is an immaterial entity having being in its own right
- The soul is prior in existence to the body
- Attributes an independent mode of being to the soul, distinct in character from that of bodies

Aristotle

- The soul and the body come into existence together when the organism is generated
- The soul cannot be without the body; yet it cannot be a body, it is something relative to the body

Descartes

- Soul is an immaterial entity having being in its own right
- Suggests there are three components of the being: body, mind, soul
- The existence of the soul is just as certain as the existence of any other thing.
- The soul is immortal

Socrates

- Complete purification requires the separation of the soul from the body. That is why true philosophers are ever seeking to release the soul.

Space

State

- If man admits anything to be his superior, he acknowledges his inferiority only to God or to the state.
- Most agree it is natural for men to associate politically.

Locke

- The reason why men enter into society is the preservation of their property.

Hegel

- “The Philosophy of History”: the state is the divine idea as it exists on earth. State = developed political society + other societal life.

Temperance

Theology

- Theology = God discourse or reason.
- Natural theology — entirely philosophical and independent of any religious faith.

- Sacred theology — body of doctrine with fundamental principles in the articles (Bible; Koran) of a religious faith.
- Another example of a dogma not supported by reason is the proposition that the world began to be.

Kant

- A Supreme Being is for the speculative reason, a mere ideal, though a faultless one, a conception which perfects and crowns the system of human cognition, but the objective reality of which can neither be proved nor disproved by pure reason. It is this defect which moral theology remedies. We must assume a moral world-cause, that is, an Author of the world, if we are to set before ourselves a final end in conformity to the moral law. But, he adds, this moral argument is not intended to supply an objectively valid proof of the existence of God. It is not meant to demonstrate to the skeptic that there is a God, but that he must adopt the assumption of this proposition as a maxim of his practical reason, if he wishes to think in a manner consistent with morality.

Whitehead

- When science proclaims theories which modify our ideas, it is a triumph for science. Changes in theology and religious thought are regarded as retreat.

Aquinas

- That the world did not always exist we hold by faith alone.
- The newness of the world is known only by revelation.
- When anyone in the endeavor to prove what belongs to faith, brings forward arguments which are not cogent, he falls under the ridicule of the unbelievers; since they suppose that we base ourselves upon such arguments, and that we believe on their account. Therefore, we must not attempt to establish what is of faith, except by authority alone and only to those who accept the authority. For those who do not accept the authority of Scripture, the most that reason can do concerning propositions peculiar to faith is to prove that what faith teaches is not impossible. Although the argument from authority based on human reason is the weakest, yet the argument from authority based on divine revelation is the strongest.

Montaigne

- The existence of God or the immortality of the soul can be demonstrated by reason.

Descartes, Spinoza, and Locke

- Maintain that we can know God by reason with certainty and even more adequately, than we can know most other things.

☑ Time

- The past and future, it seems, have duration, or at least extent, but no existence. The present exists but does not endure.

- Time is coming out of what does not exist, passing through what has no duration, and moving into what no longer exists.
- An early view identified time with cyclical movement.

Augustine

- It seems true that we measure time yet I do not know what I measure.

Aristotle

- Not only do we measure the movement by the time, but also the time by the movement.
- Time had no beginning.

Bergson

- Reality is mobility. Rest is never more than apparent or relative.
- Define time as the measure of motion; makes time an attribute of movement.

James

- Time is objective as well as subjective. Time and space in which the objects of our thought exist, exist as independently of the mind as do those objects themselves.
- So far as our experience goes, past and future can exist only in the present. But how if the present is so fleeting. It is in the instant of becoming, the specious present.

Pascal

- Time washes away the desperate ennui men suffer when they feel themselves imprisoned in the present.
- We seek diversions to escape from ourselves. We anticipate the future as too slow. The past is too painful for us. Let each one examine his thoughts and he will find them all occupied with the past and the future. And so we never live...

Truth

- Lying consists in saying the contrary of what one thinks or believes.
- Lying must be inconsistent with our thought.
- Moral truth consists in the obligation to say what we mean.
- Physical truth depends not on the veracity of what we say but on the validity of what we mean. How valid are our statements.
- The great philosophers seem able to agree on what truth is, but not as readily on what is true. However, there is a common insight about truth: an agreement or correspondence between the mind and reality. That is, a true proposition is when you speak of the existence of something which is. James puts his pragmatism on truth when he says theories that work satisfactorily are true.

- The moral truth and the physical truth are related: if truthfulness, viewed socially, requires a man's words to be a faithful representation of his mind, truth in the mind itself depends on their conformity to reality.
- Divine truth has no source. It is not truth by correspondence with anything else.
- Even single statement may show itself false by being self-contradictory, and in consequence its opposite can be seen to be true. What Aristotle calls axioms, or self-evident and indisputable truths, are those propositions immediately known to be true, and necessarily true, because their contradictions, being self-contradictory, are impossible statements, or necessarily false. The truth of any proposition which is neither a self-evident axiom nor the statement of an evident, perceived fact, is tested, according to the principle of contradiction, by its consistency with axioms or perceptions.
- As opposed to consequences or effects, contradictions or consistency as a sign of truth seems to be an intrinsic criterion. But this criterion is not universally accepted. To Pascal contradiction is not a sign of a falsity, nor the want of contradiction a sign of truth. For Kant, it is a merely logical criterion of truth ... the negative condition of all truth. Farther than this logic cannot go, and the error which depends not on the form, but on the content of the cognition, it has no test to discover.

Mills

- The thinking which ascertains truth instead of dreaming is successful application to practice.

Bacon

- Of all the signs there is none more certain or worthy than that of the fruits produced ...

Kant

- Truth and error ... are only to be found in a judgment, the senses do not err, not because they always judge correctly, but because they do not judge at all.

Hobbes

- The cause of truth in speech: If men begin with definitions and then abide by their definitions in subsequent discourse, their discourse will have truth.
- Statements of fact about real existence are at best probable opinions.

Hume

- Statements of fact about real existence are at best probable opinions. (same as Hobbes)

James

- True ideas are those we can assimilate, validate, corroborate and verify. But they must not only appeal to our sensory experience but also to our aesthetic, emotional, and active needs. Truth relates to its consequences.

Temperance

- Most outstanding figures, fiction and non-fiction, in history were not temperant.
- Abstinence is an immoderate denial of pleasure.

Temperance and Continence

- Continence is opposed to temperance because it merely represents reason's inhibition of the act prompted by a licentious desire for pleasure. The continent man is one who, when acting against reason, knows that he is doing so. The continent man has bad appetites; the temperate man is free from them. The temperant man has no need for continence. The continent man is one who give the appearance of temperance without being really temperate in character.

Darwin

- Seems to think that a much greater degree of self-control characterizes modern life.
- Temperance is a virtue peculiar to civilized life. "The greatest intemperance is no reproach with savages."
- "The hatred of indecency...which is so valuable an aid to chastity, is a modern virtue, appertaining exclusively...to civilized life."

Adam Smith

- Looked upon prodigality as a major vice.

Marx

- Sees the capitalist as suffering from "a Faustian conflict between the passion for accumulation and the desire for enjoyment."

Freud

- "Temperance no less than courage serves the tribe or the state."
- "Civilization has been built up under the pressure of the struggle for existence, by sacrifices in gratification of the primitive impulses, and that is to a great extent forever being re-created as each individual, successively joining the community, repeats the sacrifice of his instinctive pleasures for the common good. The sexual are amongst the most important of the instinctive forces thus utilized; they are in this way sublimated, that is to say, their energy is turned aside from its sexual goal and diverted towards other ends, no longer sexual, and socially more valuable."
- Freud's theory of the reality: "a person dominated by the pleasure principle is infantile in character. The reality principle is one of the most important advances in the development of the ego. When the ego learns that it must inevitably go without immediate satisfaction, postpone gratification, learn to endure a degree of pain, and altogether renounce certain sources of pleasure, it becomes reasonable..."

Nietzsche

- Stands alone as being completely against any form of temperance. He calls all such doctrines a "Morality as Timidity".

J. S. Mills

- Questions the right of society to enforce temperance upon its members by the enactment of sumptuary laws, especially with regard to food and drink. The supposition seems to be that the intemperate man injures only himself—to do which is the prerogative of his personal liberty—whereas the unjust man injures others.
- Sumptuary laws in principle because consumption, which they try to regulate, is a private matter. Whenever there is a definite damage, or a definite risk of damage, either to another individual or to the public, the case is taken out of the province of liberty, and placed in that of morality or law.

Aquinas

- Defines temperance as a disposition of the soul, moderating any passions or acts, so as to keep them within bounds.
- When reason curbs the desire for bodily pleasures, it is not to lessen sensual pleasure but to prevent the force of concupiscence [lust] from cleaving to it immoderately. By immoderately he explains “going beyond the bounds of reason, as a sober person does not take less pleasure in food eaten in moderation than the glutton, but his lust lingers less in such pleasures.
- When in the religious life a man does his utmost to strive onward to divine things, in those who are tending towards the divine similitude, temperance is a perfecting virtue.

William James

- Drunkenness is one of the deepest functions of human nature. Half of the poetry and tragedy of human life would vanish if alcohol were taken away.

Aristotle

- Children live at the beck and call of appetite and it is in them that the desire for what is pleasant is strongest.
- Temperance is concerned not with all pleasures but with the kind of pleasures that other animals share in which therefore appear slavish and brutish; these are touch and taste. Self-indulgence is a matter of reproach because it attaches to us not as men but as animals.

Augustine

Theology

- The study of the nature of God and religious truth; rational inquiry into religious questions.

Tyranny and Despotism

- Need the despot, the absolute ruler, always rule tyrannically? A tyrant can never be benevolent. When a father rules his children for their own good, he is a despot (i.e. an absolute ruler). But if he treats them like slaves he is a tyrannical despot.

- Aristotle and Plato seem to disapprove unequivocally of tyrants and tyranny.

Locke

- Tyranny is the exercise of power beyond right, which nobody can have a right to.

Madison

- The consolidation of powers in a few hands is tyranny.

Hobbes

- The lone exception. In every form of govt. the sovereign power must be absolute to be effective.

Aristotle

- Kings rule according to law over voluntary subjects, but tyrants rule over involuntary; one guarded by its subjects, the other guarded against.

Universal and Particular

- Conceptualists maintain the universals exist only as abstract ideas in the mind.
- Nominalists deny universals exist in the mind; they are a property of words alone.

Hobbes, Berkeley

- Realists assert the actual subsistence of universals.

Socrates

- Common definition could not be a definition of any sensible thing, as they are always changing. They must be ideas. Thinkers of old ranked particular things as substances; thinkers of new ranked universals as substances. We speak of sensations as particulars. A universal will be anything shared by many particulars.
- Proper nouns = particulars.
- Socrates assumes there is an absolute beauty and goodness, etc.

Russell

- There are relational universals signified by prepositions and verbs. If existence implies definite location in time and space, universals do not exist, we say instead they subsist or have being, which is unchangeable.

Virtue and Vice

- Different views of virtue in relation to the forum of gov't. and the ends of the state.
- Virtue (current popular definition) is identified with chastity or conformity to the prevailing standards of sexual behavior.
- Vice (current popular definition) implies injury to a person's character or health as the result of strong habitual addictions.
- Vice and virtue are largely concerned with pleasures or sensual indulgences.

How does one achieve virtue?

- The ancients are inconclusive as to whether virtue can be taught or not.

Christian Moralists

- Man needs more than the natural virtues to achieve salvation. Natural virtues are those which man can attain by their own effort. Also needed are faith, hope, and charity.

Principle virtues

- Courage
- Justice
- Temperance
- Prudence (practical wisdom)
- Wisdom
- Art
- Science
- Intuitive reason (understanding)

Aristotle

- Different views of virtue in relation to the forum of gov't and the ends of the state.
- (Aquinas says something similar): the virtue of the citizen must be relative to the constitution of the state of which he is a member.
- There are three things which make men good and virtuous: nature, habit, and rational principle. Nature's part evidently does not depend on us, but as a result of some divine causes is present in those who are truly fortunate.

Montaigne, Kant, Plato, Aristotle

- Seem to reject the doctrine that a man can be truly virtuous in some aspects of character while vicious in others.

Aquinas

- Contemplates the need for disobeying a civil ordinance if it demands too great a sacrifice of virtue by requiring the citizen to violate the natural or the divine law.

Rousseau

- A man's duty takes precedence over that of a citizen.

Augustine

- What ways appear to be virtues are rather vices than virtues so long as there is no reference to God in the matter.

Plato, Aristotle, Aquinas

- Virtues promote and serve happiness as a means to an end.

Spinoza, Hobbes

- Both make self-preservation the end which determines the direction of virtuous conduct.

Relating Virtue to Happiness

Mills

- The multiplication of happiness is the object of virtue. But virtue is not natural and necessary condition of happiness. Plato and Aristotle seem to think the contrary because they define happiness as the ultimate end because it leaves nothing to be desired.

What is the good of virtue?

Hobbes

- Proposes a list of virtues which derive their goodness from the natural law: peace, and the ways or means of peace: justice, gratitude, modesty, equity, mercy

Locke

- Utility is the source of goodness in the virtues. . . . “the practice thereof necessary to the preservation of society and visibly beneficial to all with whom the virtuous man has to do”
- Virtues are whatever the members of a particular society deem advantageous.

Marcus Aurelius

- Virtue is its own reward.

War and Peace

- Man has always acted at variance with his wisdom, nullifying the hope of peace by preparing always for the next war.
- Good or bad, war seems inevitable.
- Plato and Aristotle seem to agree that war is rooted in the nature of things.

Aristotle

- The whole of life is divided into two parts, business and leisure, war and peace . . . There must be war for the sake of peace, business for the sake of leisure, things useful and necessary for the sake of things honorable.

Kant

- Agrees that, in the absence of what he calls a cosmo-political constitution or world state, war is inevitable.

Freud

- War is inevitable. Our fellow-citizens have not sunk so low as we feared, because they have never risen so high as we believed. So long as the conditions of existence among the nation are so varied, and the repulsions between so intense, there will be, there must be, war.

Hegel

- He is alone is not ambivalent. War is not only not to be regarded as an absolute evil but a necessary corrective for the corrosive influence of peace. War deals in earnest with the vanity of temporal goods and concerns.
- As a result of war, nations are strengthened, and people involved in civil strife also acquire peace at home through making war abroad.

Kant

- A prolong peace favours the predominance of a mere commercial spirit and with it a debasing self-interest, cowardice and effeminacy and tends to degrade the characters of the nation.
- War has subline about it ... the more sublime the more numerous the dangers to which they are exposed ...

Hobbes, like Matthews later

- “when all the world is overcharged with inhabitants, then the last remedy of all is war”

Homer, Tolstoy

- war is a mixed blessing, an occasion for courage and agony.

Argument for World Govt.

Dante

- Contention can arise between two govts: through their own faults or their subjects; therefore, there should be judication between them.

Kant

- Of the great writers only Kant explicitly reaches this conclusion but he qualifies his acceptance and advocacy of it.

Augustine

- Does not prophecy a single political community of all men living together under one govt.

Dostoevsky

- Universal unity is the third and last anquish of men.

Wealth

- Adam Smith in “Wealth of Nations” treats wealth as an end and tries to formulate the natural laws fo wealth making.
- Shakespeare on money: “the common whore of mankind.”
- Rousseau and Smith: Civil govt was really instituted to protect the property of the rich against the poor.
- Tawney in “The Acquisitive Society”:

- Wealth is the result of the release of all men to pursue without social conscience or inhibition to their personal self-interest.
 - He does not condemn indiscriminately the pursuit of wealth.
 - He seeks a social order in which industrial activity is professionalized. He would encourage such professionalism by the organization of workers to exercise power countering the power of the greedy.
 - Veblen in *The Theory of the Leisure Class*:
 - Author of the phrase: “Conspicuous Consumption” and Conspicuous Waste”
 - With his book, he accomplished the nearly impossible: he made wealth and its display a subject of amusement, and maybe even scorn.
 - Hegel
 - Poverty seems to be an inevitable consequence of property and the cause can not be abolished. The evil consists precisely in an excess of production and in the lack of a proportionate number of consumers who are themselves also producers, and thus it is simply intensified by both of the methods by which it is sought to alleviate it.
 - Hegel concludes that it becomes apparent that despite an excess of wealth that civil society is not rich enough...to check excessive poverty and the creation of a penurious rabble.
 - Rousseau:
 - Wealth is contrary to nature
 - The privileged few gorge themselves with superfluities while the starving multitude are in want of bare necessities.
- Gov't. should prevent extreme inequalities.
- Keynes in “*General Theory of Employment, Interest, and Money*”:
 - Very interested in the moral, social, or even economic aspects of wealth.
 - He largely accepted what existed.
 - His concern was to have an economy that functioned with full or near full employment.
 - Marx:
 - Describes the economic process in order to criticize the way in which some men get richer than they need be while others become poorer than they should be. His concern is primarily to remedy unequal distribution.

Will

- The traditional name for the intellectual appetite or the faculty of rational desire is will.
- Acting may follow thinking, but not without the intervention of a determination or a desire to translate thought into deed.
- Kant and Hegel are the most stalwart defenders of the will's freedom.

James

- Free will is the exertion of an effort on our part which is not determined by its object. Willing to admit that our conscious of freedom may be a delusion. Yet he goes on to say that scientific law and prediction seem to call for the postulate of determinism, so moral responsibility and the genuineness of moral options seem to demand free will.

Hobbes

- If the only sense in which freedom can be affirmed is that of natural or political liberty — that is, the sense in which a man can do what he wills without restraint or compulsion — then the will is not free, for its freedom depends on how its own acts are caused, or how it causes other acts, not on how the acts it causes are affected by outward circumstances beyond its control.

Plato

- Reason depends also upon spirit (i.e. will) for without its support even wisdom must fail to influence conduct.

Aristotle

- Appetite is the generic notion. Will and desire are modes of appetite.

Kant

- The faculty of desire in so far as its inner principle of determination is the ground of its liking or predilection lies in the reason of the subject, constitutes the will.

Hegel

- Freedom is the essence of Will. Will without freedom is an empty word, while freedom is actual only as will.

Locke

- Power to begin or forbear, continue or end, the several actions of our minds and motions of our bodies ... unlike the mind's understanding, which is passive in receiving thoughts, the Will is active.
- Will is not an act of desires. Desire is an uneasiness of the mind for want of some absent good.

Hobbes, Locke, Hume

- Difference between voluntary and involuntary consists in the fact that when a man acts, he does what he himself has decided to do. The fact that his decision is itself caused does not abolish the freedom of his action but only the freedom of his will.
- For them freedom is abridged only by external forces which coerce a man to act contrary to his wishes or constrain him from acting as he wills.

Descartes

- We are immediately conscious of our freedom of choice. “I made no assumption concerning freedom which is not a matter of universal experience.”

Hume’s reply to Descartes’ Notion of Universal Experience

- Experience is no proof since it is open to the suspicion that it is illusory rather than real. We suffer this illusion because we are motivated by the fantastical desire of shewing liberty.

Freud

- Freud discounts objections to the determinism of psychoanalysis on the part of those who refuse to recognize the hidden causes which control their actions. You have an illusion of a psychic freedom within you which you do not want to give up. But this deeply rooted belief in psychic freedom and choice must be given up because it is quite unscientific. It must give way before the claims of a determinism which governs even mental life.

Nietzsche

- Dismisses the whole issue of determinism versus free will by saying, “What is called freedom of will is essentially the emotion of superiority over him who must obey.” Elsewhere he lists the notion of the will’s freedom as one of “the four greatest errors.” It is certainly not the least charm of a theory that it is refutable: it is with precisely this charm that it entices subtler minds. It seems that the hundred times refuted theory of free will owes its continued existence to this charm alone—again and again there comes along someone who feels he is strong enough to refute it.

Dr. Johnson

- All theory is against the freedom of the will, all experience for it.

Tolstoy

- We find a general law of necessity to which man is subject but regarding him from within ourselves as what we are conscious of, we feel ourselves to be free.

Wisdom

- With time, knowledge and learning may be increased but we do not think the same of wisdom.
- We do not think a man wise unless he acts wisely.
- Scriptures proclaim again and again that fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom.
- Pierre, in War and Peace: the height of wisdom is to acknowledge that all we can know is that we know nothing.
- Wisdom is the perfection of the intellect.

World

The Great Ideas

Mortimer Adler

Hardback

Law

Nature law (not man made).

- Aquinas implanted in the very nature of things at their creation by God.

Human law (positive law, written law, civil law):

- Not innate as natural law.
- Something posited, something originated by man.

Locke

- The rules of positive law must be conformable to the law of nature (i.e. to the will of God).
- The municipal laws of any particular state are only so far right as they are founded on the law of nature, by which they are to be regulated and interpreted.
- So long as due process of law is available to remedy unjust ordinances or illegal acts, the individual is not justified in disobedience, for such action would unhinge and overturn, leave nothing but anarchy confusion. Nor is it effective for the individual to act alone in using force to resist tyranny or injustice. But if these illegal acts have extended to the majority of the people and they are persuaded in their consequences, that their laws, and with them their estates, liberties, and lives are in danger, and perhaps, their religion too, how they will be hindered from resisting illegal force used against them, I cannot tell. This is an inconvenience, I confess, that attends all governments. There is no alternative then but rebellion — “properly a state of war wherein the appeal lies only to heaven.”

Hobbes

- “Nothing the sovereign representative can do to a subject, on what pretense so ever, can properly be called injustice, or injury.”

Thoreau, Gandhi, ML King Jr

- Unjust laws, or laws which violate a man’s conscience exert no authority over them. Man is obliged in conscience not to await help from others or to be patient in the use of gradual means. He is obliged to act alone and at once.

Aquinas

- Unless what the law commands involves a transgression of God’s commandments, an unjust law may be obeyed in order to avoid scandal or disturbance.

Liberty

Hobbes

- The natural freedom of man is not free will since every act of man's has some cause.
- Liberty is not of the will but the freedom in doing what he has the will, desire, or inclination.
- The natural right of man is the liberty each man has to use his own power ... for the preservation of his own life. This liberty or natural right belongs to man only in a state of nature. When men leave the state of nature and enter the commonwealth, they surrender this natural liberty in exchange for a civil liberty which consists in their freedom to do what the law of the state does not prohibit, or to omit doing what the law does not command.

Locke

- Agrees that man's natural liberty is not the freedom of his will in choosing but the freedom to do what he wills without constraint or impediment.

Adler

- Man does not lose their innate freedom when they live a civil society. Govts. May interfere with a man's actions, it cannot coerce his will.

Montesquieu

- Liberty can consist only in the power of doing what we ought to will and in not being constrained to do what we ought not to will.

Kant

- Freedom is independent of the compulsory will of another; and in so far as it can co-exist with the freedom of all according to a universal law, it is the sole, original inborn right belonging to every man in virtue of his humanity. There is an innate equality belonging to every man which consists in his right to be independent of being bound by others to anything more than that to which he may also reciprocally bind them. The fundamental equality of men thus appears to be founded in their equal right to freedom; and that rests on the freedom of will which all men are born.

Mill

- Freedom from government or social coercion is freedom for the max. development of individuality — freedom to be as different from all others as one's personal inclinations, talents, and tastes dispose one and enable one to be.
- It is desirable that in things which do not primarily concern others, individuality should assert itself. Liberty is undervalued as long as the free development of individuality is not regarded as one of the principal ingredients of human happiness and indispensable to the welfare of society. The only freedom which deserves the name is that of pursuing our own good in our own way, so long as we do not attempt to deprive others of theirs, or impede their efforts to obtain it; for in proportion to the development of his individuality, each person becomes more valuable to himself, and is therefore capable of being more valuable to others.

Life and Death

Logic

Love

- Facts about love
 - There are many kinds, different in object, tendency, expression
 - Love frequently turns into its opposite: hate. Sometimes there is love and hate of the same object; sometimes love inspires hate.
 - There seems to be no happiness more perfect than that which love confirms. But there is also no misery more profound than that into which others are plunged when they are bereft, disunited. Is it better to have loved and suffered than never to have loved at all?

Observations about love

- Freud places the origin of love in the sexual instincts. The many varieties of love are simply the forms which love takes as the libido fixes upon various objects.
- Darwin maintains that associated animals have a feeling of love for each other, which is not felt by non-social adult animals.
- Dante maintains that hell is made by the absence of God's love--the punishment of those who on earth loved other things more than God.
- The author states that love retains some honor when it defies morality, at least according to the poets. Other transgressions, like greed and gluttony, do not.
- One thing seems clear: that both love and desire belong to the appetitive faculty, to the sphere of the emotions and the will rather than to the sphere of perception and knowledge.

Love vs. Desire

- Whereas nothing short of physical possession satisfies desire, love can be satisfied in the contemplation of its object's beauty or goodness.

Man

Mathematics

- Bacon: math should serve physics, not seek to dominate it.
- Hume: When mixed with physics, math remains subordinate.
- Galileo, Descartes, Newton seem to think as the structure of the world is math, so, too, must the science of nature be math.
- Newton's aim is to subject all the phenomena of nature to the laws of mathematics and to cultivate math as far as it relates to natural philosophy.

Russell on modern math:

Math is the science in which we never know what we are talking about, nor whether what we are saying is true.

- Aristotle, Aquinas, Locke, and William James think of the objects of math as universals formed by abstraction from the particulars of sense and imagination.
- Aquinas: the mathematical do not subsist as separate beings. Apart from numbered things and physical configurations, numbers and figures have a separate existence only in the reason, in so far as they are abstracted from motion and matter.
- Hobbes, Berkeley, Hume: deny abstract ideas or universal concepts. Hume: let any man try to conceive a triangle in general, which is neither isosceles ... nor has any particular length or proportion of sides and he will soon perceive the absurdity of all the scholastic notions with regard to abstraction and general ideas.
- Kant and James think of math as a priori, not a posteriori.
- For James, Locke, Hume math is strictly a science of the relations between ideas, not of real existence.

Hardy

- If useful knowledge is ... Knowledge which is likely to contribute to the material comfort of mankind ... then the great bulk of higher math is useless. As for the great modern mathematicians, “the world would have been as happy a place without them.”
- The notion that all math truths can be strictly and formally deduced as stated by Russell and Whitehead, was widely accepted by mathematicians until the work of Godel in the early 1930s. Godel posed the problem of whether arithmetic was a consistent, logical system. Could one prove that it was impossible to deduce at the same time two incompatible arithmetical propositions? Godel’s answer was no, it was not impossible. In other words, Godel showed that within the formal structure of arithmetic itself, there was no way of proving that arithmetic was internally consistent. Many mathematicians now accept the fact that there are math truths that cannot be proved formally. Godel’s contributions was to deflate their exaggerated claim for logical rigor in math.

Matter

- Boswell in his “Life of Samuel Johnson” on Berkeley’s ingenious sophistry to prove the non-existence of matter and that everything is ideal: I observed that though we are satisfied his doctrine is not true, it is impossible to refute it.
- Sometimes it is said that the essence of matter itself is extensions; sometimes that bodies—not matter itself—have the property of tridimensionality. But in either case that which is or has matter in it necessarily occupies space.
- The manner of that occupation is also generally agreed upon. Two bodies or two distinct quantities of matter cannot occupy the same place at the same time. A body may not be impenetrable in the sense of being indivisible, but so long as it remains the whole that it is, it offers resistance to other bodies tending to move into the place it occupies.
- Universal = intelligible
- Particular = sensible
- Atoms = insensible particle of matter; this may be due to our inability to sense them.

- Aristotle, Plotinus, Augustine, Aquinas all have different names for matter but they agree that matter can not have existence by itself or be an object of knowledge.

Berkely

- I do not argue against the existence of any one thing that we can apprehend either by sense or reflexion. Rather he denies that which philosophers call matter or corporeal substance.
- The rest of mankind does need to be instructed when they use the word “matter”, they speak of nothing. They may from careless habit suppose they referring to the most obvious something there is in the world —the solid, massy, visible, movable, and moving things are made. Of them, how do you know they exist. It is not itself perceptible. We perceive a variety of qualities —color, shape, etc. —but these have their being in being perceived. These qualities are not matter, but only properties. Matter itself is not sensible. Those who assert its existence postulate it as a support for the sensible qualities they perceive.
- Berkeley’s argument first denies Locke’s distinction between primary and secondary qualities. Colors, sounds, odors have no actual existence except in the perceiving mind. Secondly, Berkeley argues that matter is not needed as a substratum or support for the qualities we perceive.

Descartes and Locke

- Matter gives actuality to sensible bodies.

Aristotle and Plotinus

- Bodies would not exist at all if they were composed only of matter, for matter is no more than a capacity for being, not something which by itself actually is.

Lucretius, Hobbes

- Complete materialist: only body exist.

Descartes, Spinoza, Locke

- Bodies do not comprise the whole of existence, but matter is the whole substance of bodies.

Aristotle

- Matter (to Aristotle) – the capacity of being and not being (i.e. it has the capacity for change); think of the potentiality of wood to a craftsman.

Locke

- He may not insist upon the absolute indivisibility of the particles, or upon the eternity of the uncreated atoms of matter; but he, like Hobbes and Newton, carries the division of the familiar bodies of sense-experience down to parts which cannot be perceived and yet have, in a way, a more ultimate reality as units of matter than the complex bodies they constitute.

Mechanics

- Two points constitute the essence of mechanical theory:
 - Exclusive emphasis upon efficient causes. Efficient causality is one thing acting on another. An efficient cause is mechanical only if it consists in a moving body acting on another by impact.
 - Exclusive emphasis upon quantity, not qualities.

Newton

- In Mathematical Principles, he disavows once more any knowledge of gravity. It is enough that gravity does really exist, and acts according to the laws which we have explained, and abundantly serves to account for all the motions of the celestial bodies, and of our seas.
- Every particle of matter attracts every other particle of matter with a force proportional to the mass of each and to the inverse square of the distance between them.

Huygens' Wave Theory

- Light comes from the luminous body to our eyes by some movement impressed on the matter which is between the two.
- It resembles waves created when a stone is thrown into water.
- The matter between is called ethereal matter.

20th Century

- The true revolution in mechanics begins with the discovery of the quantum theory.
- No material object can move faster than the speed of light. This means that no influence of one object upon another that is caused by the propagation of a field can take place instantaneously. In this sense, there is no such action-at-a-distance in which objects influence each other instantaneously. Influences on the present that propagate to us from the past always take a finite amount of time in the process. That these influences can propagate in a vacuum is not regarded as a paradox, but rather as a fact.
- The so-called old quantum theory, began with Bohr, who attempted to account for the spectral light emitted by atoms when they are excited by such forces as electrical discharges. He argued that light was emitted when an electron made a quantum jump to the nucleus.
- The old quantum theory was replaced by quantum mechanics, the work of Heisenberg, Schrodinger, Pauli, and Dirac. In quantum mechanics, strictly speaking, there are no orbits. The fundamental quantity in the theory is the so-called wave function. Using this function, one can compute the probability of finding, say, an electron at some point in space at a given time. The classical orbits of Newton and Einstein are positions in space where, on the average, electrons are most likely to be found.
- Most physicists now accept the fact that the objective reality of classical mechanics does not apply to subatomic phenomena.

Medicine

- The subordination of the medical art to nature seems to be the keystone of the whole structure of Hippocratic medicine. It is implied in the emphasis which Hippocrates places on the control of the patient's regimen, especially the elements of his diet, the exercise of his body, and the general circumstances of his life. Even in the treatment of acute diseases, Hippocrates looks to the regimen first, prescribing changes or special articles of diet.
- Medicines or drugs perform an auxiliary function. Surgery is always a last resort, to be used primarily in the treatment of injuries, and not to be employed in diseases which will yield to a course of regimen and medication. There is an element of violence in surgery which puts it last among the means of an art which should work by cooperating with nature rather than by operating on it. And among medicines, those are preferable which, like ptisan, a special preparation of barley water, derive their efficacy from properties similar to those of normal nutriment.
- According to Hippocrates, the control of regimen is not only the primary factor in therapy, but also the original principle of medicine. In the treatise *On Ancient Medicine*, he points out that "the art of medicine would not have been invented at first, nor would it have been made the subject of investigation (for there would have been no need for it), if when men are indisposed, the same food and other articles of regimen which they eat and drink when in good health were proper for them, and if no other were preferable to these ... The diet and food which people in health now use would not have been discovered, provided it suited man to eat and drink in like manner as the ox, the horse, and all other animals ... What other object, then, has he in view who is called a physician, and is admitted to be a practitioner of the art, who found out the regimen and diet befitting the sick, than he who originally found out and prepared for all mankind that kind of food which we all now use, in place of the former savage and brutish mode of living?"
- THE SAME CONCEPTION of medicine's relation to nature seems to be fundamental in Galen's thought. He attributes to Hippocrates his own reformulation of the insight that the art of healing consists in imitating the health-giving and healing powers of nature itself. The medical doctrines which he criticizes were based on the atomism of Epicurus. They regarded the body as a complex piece of machinery. When it gets out of order, it needs a mechanic and mechanical remedies to fix it. On the contrary, it seems to him, the living body is an organic unity, not an aggregation of atoms, or a system of interlocking parts.
- "Nature is not posterior to the corpuscles, but a long way prior to them," Galen writes. "Therefore it is nature which puts together the bodies both of plants and animals; and this she does by virtue of certain faculties which she possesses-these being, on the one hand, attractive and assimilative of what is appropriate, and, on the other, expulsive of what is foreign."

Hippocratic Oath

- Implies intellectual as well as moral conditions to be fulfilled by health service providers.

Montaigne

- The patient's ignorance permits the physicians to claim credit for his successes and to blame fortune for his failures.

Moliere

- A doctor means no ill in anything that he does: "it's with the best faith in the world that he will finish you off, and in killing you he will do just what he has done to his wife and children, and what, if the occasion should arise, he will do to himself."

Memory and Imagination

- It is understood that memory and imagination depend upon sense perception or upon previous experience.
- Even when imagination outruns perception, it draws upon experience for the material it uses in its construction.
- Our mind reproduces sensory material; the image does not differ from the original sense impression.
- Russell regards Berkeley's argument as fallacious but admits that many philosophers, perhaps a majority, have held that there is nothing real except minds and their ideas.
- Experiments of Hermann Ebbingham that James reports:
 - Retention is affected by the strength of the original associations
 - Retention is also affected by the interval between the time of learning and the time of revival

Freud

- The things put out of mind are hindered from becoming conscious and forced to remain in the unconscious by a force (repression).

Freud's Theory of Dream Symbolism

- Holds that the dream as remembered is not the real thing at all, but a distortion substitute. Beneath what he calls the manifest dream-content, the actual moving images which occupy the dreaming consciousness, lie the latent dream-thoughts which are distorted in the actual dream. This distortion is due to the activities of censorship, directed against the unacceptable unconscious wish-impulses ... invariably of an objectionable nature, offensive from the ethical, aesthetic, or social point of view, things about which we do not dare to think at all, or think of only with abhorrence. The repressed desires or wishes, the loves or fears, which the dreamer refuses to acknowledge consciously must, therefore, appear in dreams in a disguised form. The imagery of dreams seems to Freud to be a kind of language in which the repressed materials of thought and feeling employ a special symbolism to express what the moral censor will not permit us to express in the ordinary language of our conscious thought or social conversation.

- Repression occurred when a wish had been aroused, which was in sharp opposition to the other desires of the individual and was not capable of being reconciled with the ethical, aesthetic and personal pretensions of the patient's personality. The results of this struggle was repression.
- An overwhelming majority of symbols in dreams are sex symbols.
- Freud points out why it would be a mistake to treat dream symbols like the words of an ordinary language. Their object is not to tell anyone anything; they are not a means of communication; on the contrary, it is important to them not to be understood.

Metaphysics

- After physics.
- Some argue it is not a science because the objects investigated are not susceptible to scientific inquiry.

Kant

- Does not exclude it from science because it consists merely of synthetic propositions a priori.
- Metaphysics has for the proper object of its inquiries only three grand ideas: God, freedom, and immortality.

Planck

- "... the world of sensation is not the only world which may conceivably exist, but that there is still another world. To be sure this other world is not directly accessible to us, but its existence is indicated, time and again, with compelling clarity ... by the labors of science."
- "... scientists have learned that the starting point of their investigations does not lie solely in the perceptions of the senses, and that science cannot exist without some small portion of metaphysics."

Russell

- "Most of the great ambitious arguments of metaphysicians have proceeded by the attempt to prove that such and such apparent features of the actual world were self-contradictory, and therefore could not be real. The whole tendency of modern thought, however, is more and more in the direction of showing that the supposed contradictions were illusory, and that very little can be proved a priori from considerations of what must be."

Hume and Kant

- Deny metaphysics (so far as it is identified with what is traditionally natural theology) the status of a valid theoretical science.

Mind

- Most agree that thinking involves more than impressions from without.
- Most of the discussion focused on the argument for or against dualism.

- A contingent event is one that can not be predicted with certainty.
- Example of explaining necessity, in this case as it applies to the will:
- The alternatives to necessity are referred to as chance and as contingency.
- According to one opinion, every effect is necessarily determined by its causes and every cause necessarily produces certain effects; every future event is determined; nothing happens contingently or by chance.
- As INDICATED IN the chapter on CHANCE, two things must be distinguished here: the absolutely uncaused-the spontaneous or fortuitous-and the contingently caused, or that which depends upon the coincidence of a number of independent causes. A given condition may be necessary to produce a certain result, as, for example, oxygen may be necessary for combustion. But by itself it may not be sufficient for the production of that effect. If the maxim, "nothing exists without a cause of its existence," requires a cause or causes adequate to produce the effect, then the maxim is equivalent to the principle of sufficient reason. Whenever two or more causes, each of which may be necessary, are not sufficient in separation, the existence of the effect depends upon their combination; and the effect is contingent if the required combination of causes is itself not necessarily caused.
- The issue concerning contingency in nature thus seems to be more sharply stated when there is no reference to our knowledge or ignorance of causes. On this issue, Aristotle and Spinoza appear to be more clearly opposed to one another than Hume is to either.
- If things do not take place of necessity, "an event," according to Aristotle, "might just as easily not happen as happen; for the meaning of the word 'fortuitous' with regard to present or future events is that reality is so constituted that it may issue in either of two opposite directions." For example, "a sea-fight must either take place tomorrow or not, but it is not necessary that it should take place tomorrow, neither is it necessary that it should not take place, yet it is necessary that it either should or should not take place tomorrow." Though Aristotle holds that "one of the two propositions in such instances must be true and the other false," he also insists that "we cannot say determinately that this or that is false, but must leave the alternative undecided."
- Aristotle's view with regard to propositions about future particular events is that our judgments cannot be either true or false, not because of insufficient knowledge but because future particulars are in themselves always contingent. Nothing in the nature of things or causes necessarily determines them to happen. They will occur only if independent causes happen to coincide. Since these causes are independent, the coincidence will be one a matter of chance, not of necessity.

Calvin agrees with Augustine

- He excludes the contingency which depends on human will.
- No cause must be sought for but the will of God.

Spinoza

- Nothing is contingent; all things are determined from the necessity of the divine nature to exist and act in a certain manner.

Hume

- There is no such thing as chance in the world.
- Our ignorance prevents us from connecting the real cause to the effect; this shortcoming does not imply the nonexistence of a cause and its effect.

Adler

- To say as Hume does that chance has no place in nature may only mean that “nothing exists without a cause of its existence, rather than that whatever happens is necessarily determined by its causes.”

Aquinas

- God wills some things to be done necessarily, some contingently.
-

Oligarchy

- The rule of the few.

Smith

- Criticism of the oligarchic influences of modern parliamentary gov't.
- But whoever imagines that masters rarely combine is as ignorant of the world as of the subject. Masters are always and everywhere in a sort of tacit, but constant and uniform combination, not to raise the wages of labor above their actual rate. Sometimes they combine to sink wages below this rate.

Mills

- Speaks of the persevering attempts to keep down wages. “Does parliament ever for an instant look at any question with the eyes of the working man?”

One and Many

- Considerably vague. Look elsewhere.

Opinion

- Locke

The mind has two faculties conversant about truth and falsehood:

- Knowledge – the mind perceives and is undoubtedly satisfied of the agreement or disagreement of ideas
- Judgment – perceived (as above), but not presumed

- Knowable properties:
 - Necessity
 - Immutability
 - Disctinctness
 - Universality
 - Clarity
- Opinion properties:
 - Contingent
 - Confused
 - Variable
 - obscure
- Plato
- Opinion – formed with the aid of sensation and without reason; always becoming, never really is
- Mills: Opinions S/B permented as long as they aid in the pursuit of the aid of truth

Opposition

- Every fundamental notion, such as chance to fate, pleasure to pain, implies its opposite. Some notions do not have readily terms for their opposites, such as poetry and mathematics, except maybe no poetry, and no mathematics.
- Opposition appears everywhere:

Mechanics: action, reaction

Survival: one against another

Socrates

- Everything has one and only one opposite.

Aristotle

- No truths are necessary or axiomatic unless their contradictories are self-contradictory. Is the truth of the proposition ‘The whole is greater than the part’ made necessary by the impossibility of the contradictory statement ‘The whole is not greater than the part’ on the theory that this latter statement is impossible because it is self-contradictory?

Kant

- Makes distinction between synthetic and analytic propositions and restricts the principle of contradiction to serving as a criterion of truth for analytic judgments alone. (Remaining discussion is too abstract.)

Hegel

- Contradictions imply one another and require each other.
- Contradictions are resolved, not by a choice between them, but a synthesis uniting the opposites and reconciling their differences.
- Example: Being is opposed by nonbeing.
- Except the absolute, everything which is also is not and everything which is not also is.
- The apparent contradiction involved between being, nonbeing is overcome by a third category, becoming, which is the synthesis of being and nonbeing.
- Every opposition in reality of thought is a phase in the progressive realization of the absolute, wherein all contradictions are resolved.

Philosophy

- What is the use of philosophy if it cannot be used like other sciences (i.e. more utility).
- Modern authors writings have the effect of giving the status of knowledge only math and the empirical sciences and reducing philosophy to the status of opinion.

Aristotle and Plato

- Philosophy is the highest use of man's faculties.

Augustine and Aquinas

- Neither dismiss philosophy as useless learning or as dangerous folly but neither do they admit the sufficiency of philosophy for knowledge of God.

Aquinas

- Obviously had some regard for philosophy because he opens Summa Theologic with "whether, besides the philosophical sciences, any further doctrine is required."

Hobbes and Descartes

- Refer to philosophy as a science. Descartes uses the words interchangeable.

Hume

- For Hume, it is the general name for the particular sciences. The authors of the books which are today regarded as among the foundations of modern science — Galileo, Newton, Faraday — refers to themselves as philosophers.

Kant

- Appears to be the first (in the great books at least) to make a sharp separation between empirical and rational investigated methods. He still uses the name science for both sorts of investigation but he appears to restrict philosophy to the latter (rational). Finally, in the 19th century the word science is restricted to math and to such knowledge of nature, man and society.

Freud

- Separation is an accomplished fact, and one which leaves to philosophy no problem that can be solved by science.

Wittgenstein

- “philosophy simply puts everything before us and neither explains nor deduces anything.”

Physics

- A science is not a physical science unless it investigates, observes, and measures the sensible or instrumentally detectable phenomena. If it has no concern with the phenomena of change, then it does not have the character of a physical or natural science.
- The Great Books of experimental physics seem to have three characteristics in common:
 - They insist upon experimentation as either the indispensable sources or the ultimate test of scientific formulation.
 - They tend to rely upon math as much as experiment, both for the formulation of nature’s laws and for the demonstration of consequences or correlatives of the primary laws.
 - Though experiments and observations multiply as science develops, they seek to bring all the phenomena of nature under the smallest number of generalizations, which have the utmost simplicity in mathematical statements.

Quantum Theory

- 1920’s
- Heisenberg, Shrodinger, Dirac, Bohr
- Most effective scientific theory ever formatted
- Does rely on probability, which Einstein felt (supposedly) diminished its credibility.

Pleasure and Pain

- The only way of knowing pleasure and pain, like other simple ideas, is via experience.
- Desire includes both the sensitive and the rational appetites—both the passions and the will.
- If pleasure and pain were simply sensations, like sensations of color or sound, they would pose a problem for the physiologists
- If pleasure and pain were simply sensations, like color or sound, they would pose a problem for the physiological psychologist no different from the problems in the fields of vision and audition. Modern physiological research claims to have discovered differentiated nerve endings for pain which, together with the specific sense organs for pressure, heat, and cold, make up the cutaneous senses. But whether there are special cells for the reception of pain stimuli or whether cutaneous pain results from the too intense stimulation of the pressure and thermal nerve endings, there seems to be no evidence of organs sensitized to pleasure as, for example, the nerve cells of the retina are sensitized to light. The feeling of pleasure, it would seem to follow, is not a sensation. This seems to be confirmed by the traditional observation that every type of sensation, including the sensation of pain, can be pleasant.

- Even if pain, unlike pleasure, is found to be a specific mode of sensation with a special sense organ of its own, all other types of sensation-visual, auditory, olfactory, etc. might still have painfulness or a feeling of unpleasantness as an attribute. That such is the case seems to be a matter of traditional observation. Locke, for example, says that "delight or uneasiness, one or the other of them, join themselves to almost all our ideas of sensation and reflection: there is scarce any affection of our senses from without ... which is not able to produce in us pleasure or pain." So understood, pleasure and pain-or the pleasant and the unpleasant-are not opposite sensations but contrary attributes with which every sort of sensation can be affected. All need not be.
- The kind of pleasure and pain which is called "sensuous" would thus be sensuous because it is an attribute of sensations, and bodily because sensations involve bodily organs. But in almost every great discussion of pleasure and pain, other types are recognized: intellectual delights, the pleasures and pains of learning, aesthetic pleasure in contemplating beauty with the mind as well as with the senses, and the pain of loss, the grief accompanying deprivation, which is so different from the torment of a painful affliction of the senses. Human suffering, which great poems deal, is more often a torment of the spirit than of the flesh.

Happiness in Relation to Pleasure

Aristotle and Mill:

Happiness consists in having all desires satisfied. A happy life can be either in terms of the goods which the happy man possesses or in terms of the pleasures which accompany the goods possessed.

Pleasure and Pain in Learning

- Almost unanimous voice of the pleasure all men find in knowing and the pain none can avoid in the process of pursuing truth. The pain in the pursuit of truth gradually diminishes as the mind learns how to learn.

Freud

- Our entire psychic activity is bent upon procuring pleasure and avoiding pain.
- The pleasure-principle automatically regulates the operation of the mental apparatus. Pleasure is in some way connected with lessening, lowering or extinguishing the amount of stimulation in the mental apparatus and that pain involves a heightening of the latter.
- The pleasure-principle is not the only regulator of mental life. In addition to the sexual instincts, which aim at gratification and pleasure, there are the ego-instincts which, "under the influence of necessity, their mistress, soon learn to replace the pleasure-principle by a modification of it. The task of avoiding pain becomes for them almost equal in importance to that of gaining pleasure; the ego learns that it must inevitably go without immediate satisfaction, postpone gratification, learn to endure a degree of pain, and altogether renounce certain sources of pleasure. Thus trained, the ego becomes 'reasonable', is no longer controlled by the pleasure-principle, but follows the reality-principle, which at bottom also seeks pleasure, although a delayed and diminished pleasure, one which is assured by its realization of fact, its relation to reality."

Marcus Aurelius

- Pleasure is neither good nor useful nor is pain an evil, for when we are pained by any external thing we should remember that it is not this thing which disturbs us, but our judgment about it.

Pascal

- The fact that men spend their time in following a ball or a hare indicates how deep is the misery from which men try to escape through play and pleasure. Men need such diversions in order to prevent them from thinking of themselves.

Abbot

-
-

Poetry

- The contemporary reader should be informed that epics and drama may be written either as prose or verse.

Voltaire

- Seems to conclude that a great poet never makes a rhyme at the expense of sense.

Aristotle

- In his Poetics his emphasis is not upon the devices of the language but upon the subject matters: construction of the plot, the development of characters, etc. The poet or maker should be the maker of plots rather than of verses.
- Style advice:
 - Be clear without being ordinary
 - Must have some lofty diction
 - Use phrases which are not part of current idiom (this give distinction to style)
 - Must have a command for metaphor

Augustine

- Why is it that men enjoy feeling sad at the sight of tragedy and suffering on the stage, although they would be most unhappy if they had to endure the same fate? The more a man is subject to such suffering himself, the more easily he is moved by it in the theatre.
- When man suffers himself we call it misery; when he suffers out of sympathy for others, we call it pity. But what sort of pity can we really feel for an imaginary scene on the stage?

Principle

- One way we use principle, when we use it as moral principles or political principles:
 - As rules of conduct, or
 - As standards by which to measure and judge human acts or political events.
- Principle, according to its Latin derivation, means a beginning or a foundation. Since priority may be wither absolute or relative, “first principle” is not a redundancy.
- Second use of principle:
 - Principles in relation to conclusion or as the foundation of a science.
 - They must be first logically, as premises are logically prior to a conclusion.
- Third use of principle:
 - Refers to reality apart of man. For example, matter an form, to Aristotle, are the principles of a physical substance.

Russell

- What actually happens is that we realize some particular application of the principle, then we realize the particularly is irrelevant, and that there is a generally which may equally be affirmed. In addition to their characteristic of generality, pirnciples seem to have quality of underlying or the source of things.
- We say a govt. act is unprincipled not to condemn a particular act but accuse govt of having no uniform policy ot serve as a foundation for the act.

Aristotle

- We never deliberate about the end to be sought, only the means.
- Perceived particulars function as principles.
- “Intuitive reason” is the faculty which apprehends first principles.
- Perception is intuitive reason.
- Perception is one of two ways in which we apprehend the particular facts which are principles in practical reasoning.
- First principles are received by induction, perception, and habituation.

Kant

- Principle is the general proposition which serve as the major premises in reasoning. Principles’s express reason’s understanding of universal and necessary relationship..

Progress

- The idea is modern.
- The theory of evolution suggest the general motion in the world is a progress from lower to higher forms.
- For the most part moderns are optimistic about progress: an inevitable development from less to more advanced stages of civilization, according to a dialectal pattern of conflict and resolution with each resolution necessarily rising to a higher level.

Waddington

- The changes brought about by evolution will always be an improvement.

Stephen Jay Gould

- Evolution is wholly unrelated to any form of human progress.

Prophecy

- Predict the future.
- Sometimes scientific prediction may be accompanied by attribution of moral qualities but usually they connote nature's indifference to man's welfare.
- Jewish and Christian prophecy addresses man as a responsible agent, who, even when he knows something of God's will, remains free to will good or evil for himself.
- Augustine refers to astrology as an insane and impious ritual.
- Hebrew prophets get theirs directly from God.
- There is prophetic doctrine in the Old and New testament.
- Aquinas and Augustine both agree that the time for the end of the world is hidden from men.
- Christ responding tot he apostles when the asked of his second coming, "it is not for you to know the time or moments which the Father hath put in his own powe."
- Greatest prophecy in Judeo-Christian religion: the birth of Christ.
- Christians believe the greatest messianic prophecy has been fulfilled: Jesus had come, sacrificed his life and arisen. The proof? The number of testimonies and the 4,000 year succession of men who say so.

Prudence

Punishment

Quality

- Kant and Aristotle agree that the categories signify real, not verbal, distinction.
- In one sense, no one questions the existence of qualities, as they do the existence of substances.
- The notion of qualities existing in themselves and not as the qualities of anything seems to be self-contradictory.
- Qualities have variation of degree, substances do not.

Locke

- The power to produce in us ideas of the object; for example, a snowball produces the ideas of white, cold and round.
- They exist in the object.
- Primary qualities:
 - Not separate from the body
 - Found in body which has bulk enough to be perceived
 - Solidity, extension, figure, number
- Secondary qualities:
 - Colors, sounds, tastes, etc.
 - Nothing in the objects themselves but powers to produce various sensations in us by their primary qualities
- Think of pain: A piece of steel has the power to produce pain in us, it does not have the quality of pain.

Descartes

- Nothing belongs to the nature or essence of body except length, breadth, etc.
- Colors, orders, etc. are merely sensations existing in our thoughts.

Berkeley

- Makes no distinction between primary and secondary qualities.

Aristotle

- Substances change, but qualities do not; substance in changing, passes from one quality to its contrary. A man changes from good to bad, quality makes no change.

Spinoza

- Substance is that which exist in itself.
- Mode is that which exist in another thing.

Quantity

- Once difference between quality and quantity: qualities are subject to variation in degree, quantities do not.
- Terms like quantity and quality do not appear to be susceptible of definition.
- Two principle species of quantity: number and magnitude. Russell and Whitehead wish to add relations and order.
- Western thought:
 - Quantities are primary
 - Bodies only have quantitative attributes
 - Sensible qualities (color, odors, etc.) have no reality apart from experience
 - The notion of matter and quantity to be inseparably associated.

Aristotle

- Whereas quality has a contrary, quantities do not (with a few exceptions). You may one thing as large, another as small, but the sizes of each are not contrary to one another.
- The objects of math is quantities abstracted from sensible matter.
- The most distinctive mark of quantity is equality and inequality.

Reasoning

- Syllogism:
 - Premise:
 - All men are mortal,
 - Socrates is as man;
 - Conclusion:
 - Therefore, Socrates is mortal.
- The premise yield the conclusion.
- Reason is merely that mode of thought which is a process.
- For Plotinus any form of thinking signifies a deficiency or weakness. Man is the lowest of intellectual beings. On the other hand God transcends thought; he is above reason.
- Instinct is considered higher intellectually.
- A priori is reasoning from principles.
- A posteriori is reasoning from experience.

Newton

- Analysis — going from effects to causes.
- Synthesis — goes from causes to effects.

Mill

- From the conclusion of a syllogism, one learns nothing more than one already knew in the premises; whereas in inductive reasoning, the mind goes beyond anything contained in the premises and genuinely discovers a new truth.

Descartes

- The syllogistic forms are of no aid in perceiving the truth about objects.

Locke

- All right reasoning may be reduced to forms of syllogisms yet it is not the best way of reasoning for the leading of those into truth who are willing to find it and desire to make the best use of their reason for attainment of knowledge. The rules of syllogism serve not to furnish the mind with those intermediate ideas that may show the connection of remote ones. This way of reasoning discovers no new proofs, but is the art of marshalling and ranging the old ones we have already. The 47th proposition of the first book of Euclid, is very true; but the discovery of it, I think, not owing to any rules of common logic. A man knows first, and then he is able to prove syllogistically; so that syllogism comes after knowledge, and then a man has little or no need of it. Syllogism, at best, is but the art of fencing with the little knowledge we have, without making any addition to it.

James

- Reasoning is a selective activity of the mind which serves an individual purpose.

Descartes and Intuition

- The way in which we know certain truths immediately and with certitude.
- Deduction supplements intuition, but it is never at any stage of the reasoning process independent of intuition.
- Not only does intuition, according to Descartes, supply the first principles or ultimate premises of reasoning, but it also certifies each step in the process.

Relation

- Perhaps the prototype of an indefinable notion.
- Any term which is essentially relative is also to be incapable of definition, that is, its meaning cannot be stated without referring to its correlative.
- Asymmetrical relation: Parent and child. It cannot be said that if "A" is a parent of "B" that "B" is also a parent of "A".
- Symmetrical relation: If we say that "A" is the brother of "B", we can also say that "B" is the brother of "A".
- "To-the-right-of" is an asymmetrical spatial relation. "Next-to" is symmetrical. In time, "simultaneous-with" is symmetrical and "prior-to" asymmetrical.
- The relation of father to son or of "standing-next-to" in space is intransitive, for if "A" is the father of "B", and "B" is the father of "C", "A" is not the father of "C".

- The spatial relation of “standing-to-the-right” is transitive, for if “A” is to the right of “B”, and “B” to the right of “C”, then “A” is to the right of “C”.
- All our knowledge of matters of fact depend upon the association of ideas, or the relations of resemblance, contiguity, and causation among the elements of experience. All other knowledge has for its object those relations between ideas which do not connect them causally or place them in a spatial or temporal order. In either case, relations of all sorts, rather than things and their properties (or substances and their attributes), seem to be the prime constituents of nature and of knowledge.

Absolute vs. Relative

- Planck: “Everything that is relative presupposes the existence of something that is absolute.”
- Any value is absolute if it is immutable and does not vary with time, place, and circumstance; it is relative when it varies in relation to differences in time, place, and circumstances. Things are said to be considered absolutely when they are considered in themselves, and relatively when they are considered with reference to something else.

Aristotle

- Terms like much and better seem to be quantitative but they are relations; for things are great or small absolutely; they are so called rather as the result of an act of comparison. All relatives have a correlative.

Russell

- It seems to be impossible to make any statement of what relation is without using the notion of relation in doing so.

Religion

- Two opposing definitions of religion:
 1. Those who conceive it as having a supernatural foundation in God’s revelation and authority
 - This view is the basis for anthropology, the study to discover correlations between different types of religions and different types of social organizations.
 - Adler refers to others and quotes: “the course of nature is to some extent elastic or variable, and that we can persuade or induce the mighty beings who control it to deflect, for our benefit, the current of events from the channel in which they would otherwise flow.” In this sense, religion is like magic.
 - Those who deny this supernatural, according to those of faith, either lack the gift of faith or the wish to have it. Those who deny explain that it is an illusion to suppose faith is God’s gift rather than man’s own will to believe.
 2. Those who think of religion as having a purely natural origin in certain human tendencies. This group lack the intense religious faith; instead they study its social and cultural significance.
 - Here religion does not demand that inner devotion and external conduct constitute the practice of a man’s belief if he is to avoid hypocrisy.

Sacred Books

- For the Muslims, the Koran is the word of God revealed to His one and only prophet.
- For the Jews, the Old Testament is divinely inspired writing.
- The Christians believe both Testaments as Holy Writ.

Locke on Revelation and Faith

- "...the testimony [revelation] is of such a one as cannot deceive, nor be deceived, and that is of God himself. This [revelation] carries with it an assurance beyond doubt, evidence beyond exception." Our acceptance of it is faith. Man must understand it to be divine revelation and that Man understand it to be right.

Hobbes

- Faith is a gift of God, which man can neither give nor take away by promises of rewards or menaces of torture.
- Faith depends only upon certainty or probability of arguments drawn from reason or from something men believe already.
- Faith does not come by supernatural inspiration or infusion.
- Faith comes by education, discipline, correction, and other natural ways, by which God worketh them in his elect, at such time as he thinketh fit.
- When we believe that the Scriptures are the word of God, having no immediate revelation from God himself, our belief, faith, and trust is in the Church, whose word we take, and acquiesce therein."

Aquinas

- The articles of religious faith may be drawn from the content of Holy Writ, but that Holy Writ is the revealed truth of God must first be accepted by an act of faith.

Marx

- Religion is a social imposture.
- To theologians, every religion but their own is an invention of man, while their own religion is an emanation of God.
- Religion plays a large part in preventing revolution, which he sees as the only escape of the workers from oppression. Religion is the opiate of the masses.

Freud

- Religion is a neurotic need. If a man does not have science or art to live by, he must have religion, for “life as we find it is too hard for us and we cannot do without palliative remedies.”
- “The point which is being called in question is whether there is a divine spirit and a revelation; and it surely cannot be a conclusive reply to say that the question cannot be asked because the Deity cannot be called in question.”

Pascal

- “... the Christian faith goes mainly to establish these two facts:
 1. The corruption of nature
- The redemption of Christ”
- Christianity has certain unique signs of truth:
 1. Worships one God as the origin of everything.
- The obligation to love God.
- Must be aware of human lust and weakness.
- There must be remedies for #3. Christianity has prayer.
- No other religion has asked of God the power to love and follow him.

Hume

- Mere reason is insufficient to convince us of the veracity of the Christian religion (and their miracles). You must have faith, which subverts all the principles of his understanding and gives one a determination to believe what is most contrary to custom and experience.

Interpretation

- Augustine on People who insist on their own interpretation:
 - ‘They have no knowledge of the thoughts in his [the author of the book in the bible] mind, but they are in love with their own opinions, not because they are true, but because they are their own.’
- Aquinas summarizes what he takes to be Augustine’s two rules:
 1. Hold the truth of the scripture without wavering.
 2. Since the Holy scripture can be explained in a multiplicity of senses, one should adhere to a particular explanation only in such measure as to be ready to abandon it, if it be proved with certainty to be false; lest the Holy Scripture be exposed to the ridicule of unbelievers, and obstacles be placed to their believing.

Revolution

Rhetoric

- In addition to movement to action, the orator also hopes to make an impression of good character, integrity, etc.

Broader View

- Merge rhetoric with poetic to arrive at the art of eloquence in any discussion.

Narrower View

- The art of persuasion in practical affairs. Actually the objective is action, not persuasion. Usually restricted to moral and political problems.

Aristotle

- Rhetoric and dialectic are faculties for providing arguments.
- Rhetoric is for persuading an audience.
- Dialectician is concerned with carrying on a dispute in which two individuals may be privately engaged.

Same and Other

Aristotle

- The specific difference between man and ass with respect to rationality, accompanied by their generic sameness with respect to animality, makes them similar. If they were utterly diverse, i.e., the same in no respect, they would not be said to differ; just as if they were identical in all respects except number, they would not be called similar. The other and the same are thus opposed. But difference is not the same as otherness.

Canady

- If you speak of something as different, you are attempting to compare it. If you find a difference, there must be similarities.

James

- No two things can be utterly incomparable: a cigarette and a dollar are at least “enjoyable”.

Science

- One conception: science is a rigorous demonstration for conclusions from axioms.
- The conception of science as knowledge founded upon experiment (or extended observations) seems to be ancient as well as modern.

Freud

- Religion alone is a really serious enemy to the dominion of science over man and society. Religions and science might be compatible if religion would only say “It is fact that I cannot give you what men commonly call truth; to obtain that, you must go to science.” But religion can not say that without losing all influence over the masses of mankind and science cannot yield at all in its claim to being the only avenue to truth.

- Philosophy parts company with science by clinging to the illusion that it can produce a complete and coherent picture of the universe. As such, philosophy must be regarded as an impostor in the halls of knowledge.
- The picture that philosophy tries to construct falls to pieces with every new advance in our knowledge. Not itself knowledge, but mere opinion or speculation, philosophy does not, any more than religion, offer a substitute for science.
- Hobbes: science begins with definition. Freud expresses the opposite view; the true beginning is with describing phenomena and then proceeding to group, classify, correlate.
- Physics, math and metaphysics proceed in the same way: by the demonstration of conclusions from principles obtained by induction from experience (sensory).

James

- The scientist describes the phenomena as precisely as possible as comprehensively, but without any implication of finality or totality. He recognizes his work is always tentative, always subject to the discovery of new data. Above he admits that he is only describing, not explaining.
- All attempts to explain our phenomenally given thoughts as products of deeper-lying entities ... are metaphysical.

Einstein

- Science without religion is lame; religion without science is blind.

Sense

- With few exceptions, notably Berkeley and Hume, the existence of a sensible world of material things is not denied or seriously doubted.

Aristotle and Aquinas

- The intellect abstracts all its ideas from the particular of sense.

Hobbes, Berkeley

- There is nothing in the understanding which has not first of all been in the senses.
- But Descartes offers the ideas of God as contrary examples to Hobbes, Berkeley.

Russell

- Common sense unhesitatingly asserts the existence of a world that is independent of out individual sense impressions.
- Sense data is private to each person.

James

- Hearing a sound is having a sensation but perception occurs when we hear a sound and say a "horse-car".
- Perception differs from sensation by the consciousness of further facts associated with the objects of sensation.
- All forms of consciousness are somehow functions of the brain.

Berkely, Hume, Hobbes

- Man has no abstract ideas or universal concepts; all the operations of thought are merely elaborations of the original impressions of sense.

Hobbes

- The cause of sense is the external object, which is pressed the organ proper to each step; sensible qualities are motions of the matter that presses our organs.

Aristotle

- Sleep can only occur in those living things which have the power of sense perception.

Sign and Symbol

- A sign points to something.
- A symbol stands for or takes the place of another thing.
- Nonetheless, used interchangeability words are signs or symbols.
- Sign or symbol, one term in a relation, the relation being one of meaning.

Natural signs

- Apart from any intention or desire of using them as signs, do yet lead to the knowledge of something: smoke to fire.

Conventional signs (words)

- Those which people mutually exchange for the purpose of showing the feelings of their minds, their perceptions, their thoughts.

Locke and Aristotle

- Spoken words are the symbols of mental experience.
- Written words are the symbols of the spoken words.

Locke

- Words stand for ideas, not the thing.

Aristotle

- Words stand for ideas and things.

Aquinas

- It is impossible for words to signify things directly without mediation of ideas.
- Words ► ideas ► thing.

Wittgenstein

- To determine the use of a word one must look to its use in language.

Russell

- Common and proper names are best expressed in terms of definite and indefinite description, such as done when using the article “a” and “the”.

Hobbes

- Some words are the name of the things conceived; others are the names of the imaginations themselves; i.e. those ideas or mental images we have of all the things we see and remember. And others are names of names (plural is a name of a name).

Aristotle

- Two things are equivocal when they have the same name yet the definition corresponding with the name differs. Metaphoric type of equivocation. Occurs when we call a pig and man a pig.
- Metaphors are of two types:
 - Some are based on a direct similitude between two things in some accidental respect: a man is a pig.
 - Some are based on analogies or proportion: King is the father of his people.
- To grasp the various spiritual meanings, the reader must understand that in Holy Scripture, “divine things are metaphorically described by means of sensible things.” Sacraments, for example, use physical things to serve the meaning of spiritual grace. Whereas theologians maintain that metaphors serve a useful purpose in scripture, sacred doctrine.
- Philosophers and scientist often take an opposite view that metaphors have a place only in poetry and should be avoided in the exposition of knowledge.

Augustine

- A sign is a thing which, over and above the impression it makes on the senses, causes something else to come into mind as a consequence of itself.
 - Some things are simply things
 - Some are not things, but also signs of other things
 - Some things, such as words, are never employed except as signs

Sin

- Satan is highest among the angels, the first of God’s spiritual creatures. He is only less than God in the perfection of his nature. Adam is created with supernatural graces and gifts, his immortal body is completely responsive to his spirit, his appetite in all things is submissive to his reason, and his reason is turned toward God, according to the original justice which harmonized his faculties and the elements of his nature.
- The only evil latent in either Satan or Adam would seem to reside in the privation of infinite being, power, and knowledge. But this is not a moral evil in them; it is neither a sin nor a predisposition to sin. Hence the only cause of their sinning, if God himself does not predestine them to sin, must be a free choice on their part between good and evil. If God positively predestines them to sin, then they would seem to be without responsibility, and so without sin. If they are not predetermined to evil, how does the conflict arise in them which opens the choice between good and evil and impels them, almost against the inclination of their natures, away from good and toward evil?

- In the pagan and Judeo-Christian conceptions of sin, the fundamental meaning seems to depend upon the relation of man to the gods or to God, whether that itself be considered in terms of law or love. The vicious act may be conceived as one which is contrary to nature or reason. The criminal act may be conceived as a violation of the law of man, injurious to the welfare of the state or to its members. Both may involve the notions of responsibility and fault. But unless the act transgresses the law of God, it is not sinful. The divine law which is transgressed may be the natural law that God instills in human reason, but the act is sinful if the person who commits the act turns away from God to the worship of love of other things.
- To disbelieve in God, in divine law and divine punishment, is also to disbelieve in sin—at least in the sense in which religious men have distinguished between saints and sinners, between the righteous and the wicked in the eyes of God. To Pascal, there are only two kinds of men: the righteous who believe themselves sinners; the rest, sinners, who believe themselves righteous.

Freud

- When one asks how a sense of guilt arises in anyone, one is told something one cannot dispute: people feel guilty when they have done something they know to be bad. But then one sees how little this answer tells one. What accounts for the judgment a man makes of himself as good or bad? Freud's answer is that what is bad is, to begin with, whatever causes one to be threatened with a loss of love; because of the dread of this loss, one must desist from it. That is why it makes little difference whether one has already committed the bad deed or only intends to do so.
- The external authority of the father and, through him, of society becomes, according to Freud, internalized by the development of a superego.
- Applies his theory of the origin of feelings of guilt (in the dread of authority and later in the dread of the superego) to the religious sense of sin. Jews believed themselves to be the favorite child. God hurled visitation upon them. Their faith remained firm. They introduced prophets and professed their sins to them. Out of this sense of guilt they constructed commandments.
- Religion have never overlooked the part played by the sense of guilt in civilization. They have sought to save mankind from this sense of guilt which they call sin. Jesus takes the common guilt of all upon himself and sacrifices himself.

Milton's Paradise Lost

- God says of Adam: "I made him just and right, sufficient to have stood, though free to fall."
- Of Satan and fallen angels, as well as of Adam, God observes:
They therefore as to right belonged,
So were created, nor can justly accuse
Their maker, or their making, or their Fate:
As if Predestination over-ruled
Their will, disposed by absolute Decree
Of high foreknowledge; they themselves decreed
Their own revolt, not I: if I foreknew,
Foreknowledge had no influence on their fault,
Which had no less prov'd certain unforeknown.
- There is a difference between Adam and Satan. The fallen angels by their own suggestion fell, self-tempted, depraved. Satan, having sinned, becomes man's tempter. Man falls deceived by the other first: Man therefore shall find grace, the other income.
- The serpent speaks as a man to Adam and Eve: if they too partake, "shall be as Gods, knowing both Good and Evil as they know." Eve succumbs and, as Milton tells the story, Adam, knowing fully the evil of the act, joins Eve in disobedience, not from envy of the gods, but out of love for her, willing to die because unwilling to live without her.
- In the poet's expansion of the third chapter of Genesis, the basic elements in the Judeo-Christian conception of sin seem to be plainly accented: the pride and envy which move Satan and Eve, the disobedience which results from the disorder of Adam's loving Eve more than he loves God.

Dante's The Divine Comedy

- Adam speaks to Dante in Paradise and tells him that "the tasting of the tree was not in itself the cause of so long an exile, but solely the overpassing of the bound. Beatrice: in order to redeem man from sin, the Word of sin assumed human nature, the nature which had estranged itself from its Maker. Beatrice: this nature, which was thus united to its Maker, was, when it was created, pure and good; but by its own self it had been banished from Paradise, because it turned aside from the way of the truth and its proper life. Man can fall from his nobility by sin alone which disfranchises it and makes it unlike the Supreme Good, so that it is little illumined by Its light; and to its dignity it never returns unless, where fault has emptied, it fill up with just penalties against evil delight.

Spinoza

- In the state of nature, sin is not conceived; in a civil state, sin is disobedience to civil customs.

Calvin

- Original sin resulted from Adam's exercise of free will. After that, man lost his freedom of choice.

Slavery

- Most of the ancients agree that tyrannical rule, the perversion of govt., is a kind of slavery.

Montesquieu and Aristotle

- For certain races of mankind subjection or slavery may be justified.

Mill

- At a certain stage of political development, subjection may be necessary for a time in preparation for citizenship.

The other evil sense of slavery:

Spinoza

- Human bondage: the condition of men enslaved by the tyranny of their passions.

Hobbes and Locke

- Maintained that the vanquished in war must pay for being allowed to live by submitting to slavery.

Natural Slavery

- One who is born a slave (not merely born of slaves and into slavery).

Slave by force or law

- Born a natural fit for freedom, is made a slave, either because
- His parents were slaves
- He was sold into slavery
- He forfeits his freedom

Aristotle (doctrine of natural slavery)

- The lower sort are by natural slaves and it is better for them as for all inferiors that they should be under the rule of a master
- Some are by nature free and others slaves, and that for these later slavery is both expedient and right.

Rousseau, Kant, Hegel, Mill

- All men are by nature born to be free.

Augustine and Aquinas

- Though slavery is instituted by nature it is not contrary to natural law or to the will of God.

Augustine

- Slavery is introduced by sin (punishment), not nature.

Aquinas

- Institutional slavery seems due to the fallen nature of men (the penal consequence of original sin).
- Something can be according to natural law in two ways.
 - Because nature inclines thereto
- Example: Nakedness is natural because nature did not give one clothes. So then men are by nature free because slavery was not instituted by nature but devised by human reason.
 - Because nature does not require the contrary.

Montesquieu

- Climate is the cause of slavery and to some extent its excuse.
- Where the excess of heat enervates the body and renders the men so slothful and dispirited that nothing but the fear of chastisement can oblige them to perform any laborious duty.
- In arguing the right of Europeans to make slaves of the negroes: it is impossible for us to suppose these creatures to be men, because, allowing them to be men, a suspicion would follow that we ourselves are not Christians.

Hegel

- On the enslavement of African negroes by Europeans: “Bad as this way be, their lot in their own land is even worse, since there a slavery quite as absolute exists.”

Mill

- Like Hegel, slavery is a stage to political life. A slave property so called is a being who has not learnt to help himself ... They have to be taught self-govt...”

Hobbes

- Men in a state of nature are free, though they can actually enjoy as much freedom as they power to secure. Yet the natural right of mastership depends not merely upon victory in war, but upon a covenant into which the vanquished enter voluntarily to give their labor to avoid death.

Kant

- A contract by which the one party renounces his whole freedom for the advantage of the other, ceasing thereby to be a person and consequently having no duty even to observe a contract, is self-contradictory, and is therefore of itself null and void.

Hegel

- Agreeing that such a contract is a nullity, Hegel holds that the slave has an absolute right to free himself, but adds that if a man is a slave, his own will is responsible for his slavery ... Hence the wrong of slavery lies at the door not simply of enslavers or conquerors, but of the slaves and the conquered themselves.

Boswell

- To abolish a status which in all ages God has sanctioned and man has continued would not only be robbery to an innumerable class of our fellow-subjects; but it would be extreme cruelty to the African savages, a portion of whom it saves from massacre or intolerable bondage in their own country, and introduces into a much happier state of life, esp. now when their passage to the West Indies and their treatment there is humanely regulated.

The Federalist

- Constitution postponed until 1808 the importation of slaves.
- The Federalist defending the Constitution's apportionment of representation: "determined by adding to the whole number of free persons, including those bound to service for a term of yrs. , and excluding Indians not taxed, 3/5 of all other persons. Thus, the negro slave is reduced 2/5 property, 3/5 person.

Marx

- Because a laborer is forced to sell his labor power in the open market in order to subsist, Marx regards his so-called freedom as a pious fiction. The contract by which he sold to the capitalist his labor-power proved in black and white that he disposed of himself freely. The bargain concluded, it is discovered that he was no free-agent, that the time for which he is free to sell his labor-power is the time for which he is forced to sell it.
- The chief difference between a bonded-slave and a wage-earner is that the wage-earner has the legal right to organize and strike.

Soul

Aquinas

- Agrees with Aristotle
- Man has a body and soul. The soul, though created, is immortal. Also known as spirit.
- Men can not think without images
- Disagreeing with Locke: Thinking can not be performed by matter
- There is nothing of a penal nature in the soul's union with the body in spite of the scripture "the corruptible body weighted down the soul, and the earthly tabernacle presseth down the mind." To Augustine, this does not mean that the flesh is evil in itself, but that man is beset by sin when "the flesh lusteth against the spirit." Augustine: man is both body and soul and one should not extol one above the other.
- "If the entire nature of man were to be a soul--the soul making use of the body as an instrument--there would be no need for the resurrection of the body after the Last Judgment." "The soul, as part of human nature, has its natural perfection only as united to the body."

Augustine

- To Aquinas: There is nothing of a penal nature in the soul's union with the body in spite of the scripture "the corruptible body weighted down the soul, and the earthly tabernacle presseth down the mind." To Augustine, this does not mean that the flesh is evil in itself, but that man is beset by sin when "the flesh lusteth against the spirit." Augustine: man is both body and soul and one should not extol one above the other.

Berkeley

- The soul is immortal

Christians

- Believe in the immortality of the soul

General

- The soul is generally viewed as the spiritual component of man whereas the body is the material component.
- The major question seems to be whether the body and soul are separate or "is the soul the substantial form of an organic body, with the consequence that the form and matter together constitute a single composite substance, which is the living thing?"
- Other questions concerning the soul?
 - Does it exist before being united to the body?
 - Does it exist after the union with the body is dissolved?
 - How does it exist when it exists separately from matter?

James

- Finds the concept useless so far as accounting for the actually verified facts of conscious experience goes
- Our findings have not established its nonexistence; they have only proved its superfluity for scientific purposes

Kant

- It is impossible to reach any conclusion about the existence of the soul.
- As for the existence of the soul:

The premises does not support the conclusion. The "I" in "I think, therefore I am" does not give us intuitive knowledge of a really existing substance. The soul is a substance in idea only, not in reality. To say that it exist becomes a matter of faith.

Locke

- The idea of soul is as clear as our idea of body.

Lucretius

- The soul is composed of material particles within the framework of the body
- The soul can not be evidenced by direct observation but is inferred to exist much like the unobservable atoms, which explain the constitution and change of all natural objects.

Plato

- Soul is an immaterial entity having being in its own right
- The soul is prior in existence to the body
- Attributes an independent mode of being to the soul, distinct in character from that of bodies

Aristotle

- The soul and the body come into existence together when the organism is generated
- The soul cannot be without the body; yet it cannot be a body, it is something relative to the body

Descartes

- Soul is an immaterial entity having being in its own right
- Suggests there are three components of the being: body, mind, soul
- The existence of the soul is just as certain as the existence of any other thing.
- The soul is immortal

Socrates

- Complete purification requires the separation of the soul from the body. That is why true philosophers are ever seeking to release the soul.

Space

State

- If man admits anything to be his superior, he acknowledges his inferiority only to God or to the state.
- Most agree it is natural for men to associate politically.

Locke

- The reason why men enter into society is the preservation of their property.

Hegel

- “The Philosophy of History”: the state is the divine idea as it exists on earth. State = developed political society + other societal life.

Temperance

Theology

- Theology = God discourse or reason.
- Natural theology — entirely philosophical and independent of any religious faith.
- Sacred theology — body of doctrine with fundamental principles in the articles (Bible; Koran) of a religious faith.
- Another example of a dogma not supported by reason is the proposition that the world began to be.

Kant

- A Supreme Being is for the speculative reason, a mere ideal, though a faultless one, a conception which perfects and crowns the system of human cognition, but the objective reality of which can neither be proved nor disproved by pure reason. It is this defect which moral theology remedies. We must assume a moral world-cause, that is, an Author of the world, if we are to set before ourselves a final end in conformity to the moral law. But, he adds, this moral argument is not intended to supply an objectively valid proof of the existence of God. It is not meant to demonstrate to the skeptic that there is a God, but that he must adopt the assumption of this proposition as a maxim of his practical reason, if he wishes to think in a manner consistent with morality.

Whitehead

- When science proclaim theories which modify our ideas, it is a triumph for science. Changes in theology and religious thought are regarded as retreat.

Aquinas

- That the world did not always exist we hold by faith alone.
- The newness of the world is known only by revelation.
- When anyone in the endeavor to prove what belongs to faith, brings forward arguments which not cogent, he falls under the ridicule of the unbelievers; since they suppose that we base ourselves upon such arguments, and that we believe on their account. Therefore, we must not attempt to establish what is of faith, except by authority alone and only to those who accept the authority. For those who do not accept the authority of Scripture, the most that reason can do concerning propositions peculiar to faith is to prove that what faith teaches is not impossible. Although the argument from authority based on human reason is the weakest, yet the argument from authority based on divine revelation is the strongest.

Montaigne

- The existence of God or the immortality of the soul can be demonstrated by reason.

Descartes, Spinoza, and Locke

- Maintain that we can know God by reason with certainty and even more adequately, than we can know most other things.

Time

- The past and future, it seems, have duration, or at least extent, but no existence. The present exists but does not endure.
- Time is coming out of what does not exist, passing through what has no duration, and moving into what no longer exists.
- An early view identified time with cyclical movement.

Augustine

- It seems true that we measure time yet I do not know what I measure.

Aristotle

- Not only do we measure the movement by the time, but also the time by the movement.
- Time had no beginning.

Bergson

- Reality is mobility. Rest is never more than apparent or relative.
- Define time as the measure of motion; makes time an attribute of movement.

James

- Time is objective as well as subjective. Time and space in which the objects of our thought exist, exist as independently of the mind as do those objects themselves.
- So far as our experience goes, past and future can exist only in the present. But how if the present is so fleeting. It is in the instant of becoming, the specious present.

Pascal

- Time washes away the desperate ennui men suffer when they feel themselves imprisoned in the present.
- We seek diversions to escape from ourselves. We anticipate the future as too slow. The past is too painful for us. Let each one examine his thoughts and he will find them all occupied with the past and the future. And so we never live...

Truth

- Lying consists in saying the contrary of what one thinks or believes.
- Lying must be inconsistent with our thought.
- Moral truth consists in the obligation to say what we mean.
- Physical truth depends not on the veracity of what we say but on the validity of what we mean. How valid are our statements.
- The great philosophers seem able to agree on what truth is, but not as readily on what is true. However, there is a common insight about truth: an agreement or correspondence between the mind and reality. That is, a true proposition is when you speak of the existence of something which is. James puts his pragmatism on truth when he says theories that work satisfactorily are true.
- The moral truth and the physical truth are related: if truthfulness, viewed socially, requires a man's words to be a faithful representation of his mind, truth in the mind itself depends on their conformity to reality.
- Divine truth has no source. It is not truth by correspondence with anything else.
- Even single statement may show itself false by being self-contradictory, and in consequence its opposite can be seen to be true. What Aristotle calls axioms, or self-evident and indisputable truths, are those propositions immediately known to be true, and necessarily true, because their contradictions, being self-contradictory, are impossible statements, or necessarily false. The truth of any proposition which is neither a self-evident axiom nor the statement of an evident, perceived fact, is tested, according to the principle of contradiction, by its consistency with axioms or perceptions.
- As opposed to consequences or effects, contradictions or consistency as a sign of truth seems to be an intrinsic criterion. But this criterion is not universally accepted. To Pascal contradiction is not a sign of a falsity, nor the want of contradiction a sign of truth. For Kant, it is a merely logical criterion of truth ... the negative condition of all truth. Farther than this logic cannot go, and the error which depends not on the form, but on the content of the cognition, it has no test to discover.

Mills

- The thinking which ascertains truth instead of dreaming is successful application to practice.

Bacon

- Of all the signs there is none more certain or worthy than that of the fruits produced ...

Kant

- Truth and error ... are only to be found in a judgment, the senses do not err, not because they always judge correctly, but because they do not judge at all.

Hobbes

- The cause of truth in speech: If men begin with definitions and then abide by their definitions in subsequent discourse, their discourse will have truth.
- Statements of fact about real existence are at best probable opinions.

Hume

- Statements of fact about real existence are at best probable opinions. (same as Hobbes)

James

- True ideas are those we can assimilate, validate, corroborate and verify. But they must not only appeal to our sensory experience but also to our aesthetic, emotional, and active needs. Truth relates to its consequences.

Temperance

- Most outstanding figures, fiction and non-fiction, in history were not temperant.
- Abstinence is an immoderate denial of pleasure.

Temperance and Continnence

- Continnence is opposed to temperance because it merely represents reason's inhibition of the act prompted by a licentious desire for pleasure. The continent man is one who, when acting against reason, knows that he is doing so. The continent man has bad appetites; the temperate man is free from them. The temperant man has no need for continnence. The continent man is one who give the appearance of temperance without being really temperate in character.

Darwin

- Seems to think that a much greater degree of self-control characterizes modern life.
- Temperance is a virtue peculiar to civilized life. "The greatest intemperance is no reproach with savages."
- "The hatred of indecency...which is so valuable an aid to chastity, is a modern virtue, appertaining exclusively...to civilized life."

Adam Smith

- Looked upon prodigality as a major vice.

Marx

- Sees the capitalist as suffering from "a Faustian conflict between the passion for accumulation and the desire for enjoyment."

Freud

- “Temperance no less than courage serves the tribe or the state.”
- “Civilization has been built up under the pressure of the struggle for existence, by sacrifices in gratification of the primitive impulses, and that is to a great extent forever being re-created as each individual, successively joining the community, repeats the sacrifice of his instinctive pleasures for the common good. The sexual are amongst the most important of the instinctive forces thus utilized; they are in this way sublimated, that is to say, their energy is turned aside from its sexual goal and diverted towards other ends, no longer sexual, and socially more valuable.”
- Freud’s theory of the reality: “a person dominated by the pleasure principle is infantile in character. The reality principle is one of the most important advances in the development of the ego. When the ego learns that it must inevitably go without immediate satisfaction, postpone gratification, learn to endure a degree of pain, and altogether renounce certain sources of pleasure, it becomes reasonable...”

Nietzsche

- Stands alone as being completely against any form of temperance. He calls all such doctrines a “Morality as Timidity”.

J. S. Mills

- Questions the right of society to enforce temperance upon its members by the enactment of sumptuary laws, especially with regard to food and drink. The supposition seems to be that the intemperate man injures only himself—to do which is the prerogative of his personal liberty—whereas the unjust man injures others.
- Sumptuary laws in principle because consumption, which they try to regulate, is a private matter. Whenever there is a definite damage, or a definite risk of damage, either to another individual or to the public, the case is taken out of the province of liberty, and placed in that of morality or law.

Aquinas

- Defines temperance as a disposition of the soul, moderating any passions or acts, so as to keep them within bounds.
- When reason curbs the desire for bodily pleasures, it is not to lessen sensual pleasure but to prevent the force of concupiscence [lust] from cleaving to it immoderately. By immoderately he explains “going beyond the bounds of reason, as a sober person does not take less pleasure in food eaten in moderation than the glutton, but his lust lingers less in such pleasures.
- When in the religious life a man does his utmost to strive onward to divine things, in those who are tending towards the divine similitude, temperance is a perfecting virtue.

William James

- Drunkenness is one of the deepest functions of human nature. Half of the poetry and tragedy of human life would vanish if alcohol were taken away.

Aristotle

- Children live at the beck and call of appetite and it is in them that the desire for what is pleasant is strongest.
- Temperance is concerned not with all pleasures but with the kind of pleasures that other animals share in which therefore appear slavish and brutish; these are touch and taste. Self-indulgence is a matter of reproach because it attaches to us not as men but as animals.

Augustine

Theology

- The study of the nature of God and religious truth; rational inquiry into religious questions.

Tyranny and Despotism

- Need the despot, the absolute ruler, always rule tyrannically? A tyrant can never be benevolent. When a father rules his children for their own good, he is a despot (i.e. an absolute ruler). But if he treats them like slaves he is a tyrannical despot.
- Aristotle and Plato seem to disapprove unequivocally of tyrants and tyranny.

Locke

- Tranny is the exercise of power beyond right, which nobody can have a right to.

Madison

- The consolidation of powers in a few hands is tyranny.

Hobbes

- The lone exception. In every form of govt. the sovereign power must be absolute to be effective.

Aristotle

- Kings rule according to law over voluntary subjects, but tyrants rule over involuntary; one guarded by its subjects, the other guarded against.

Universal and Particular

- Conceptualists maintain the universals exist only as abstract ideas in the mind.
- Nominalist deny universals exist the mind; they are a property of words alone.

Hobbes, Berkeley

- Realists assert the actual subsistence of universals.

Socrates

- Common definition could not be a definition of any sensible thing, as they are always changing. They must be ideas. Thinkers of old ranked particular things as substances; thinkers of new ranked universals as substances. We speak of sensations as particulars. A universal will be anything shared by many particulars.
- Proper nouns = particulars.
- Socrates assumes there is an absolute beauty and goodness, etc.

Russell

- There are relational universals signified by prepositions and verbs. If existence implies definite location in time and space, universals do not exist, we say instead they subsist or have being, which is unchangeable.

Virtue and Vice

- Different views of virtue in relation to the forum of gov't. and the ends of the state.
- Virtue (current popular definition) is identified with chastity or conformity to the prevailing standards of sexual behavior.
- Vice (current popular definition) implies injury to a person's character or health as the result of strong habitual addictions.
- Vice and virtue are largely concerned with pleasures or sensual indulgences.

How does one achieve virtue?

- The ancients are inconclusive as to whether virtue can be taught or not.

Christian Moralists

- Man needs more than the natural virtues to achieve salvation. Natural virtues are those which man can attain by their own effort. Also needed are faith, hope, and charity.

Principle virtues

- Courage
- Justice
- Temperance
- Prudence (practical wisdom)
- Wisdom
- Art
- Science
- Intuitive reason (understanding)

Aristotle

- Different views of virtue in relation to the forum of gov't and the ends of the state.
- (Aquinas says something similar): the virtue of the citizen must be relative to the constitution of the state of which he is a member.
- There are three things which make men good and virtuous: nature, habit, and rational principle. Nature's part evidently does not depend on us, but as a result of some divine causes is present in those who are truly fortunate.

Montaigne, Kant, Plato, Aristotle

- Seem to reject the doctrine that a man can be truly virtuous in some aspects of character while vicious in others.

Aquinas

- Contemplates the need for disobeying a civil ordinance if it demands too great a sacrifice of virtue by requiring the citizen to violate the natural or the divine law.

Rousseau

- A man's duty takes precedence over that of a citizen.

Augustine

- What ways appear to be virtues are rather vices than virtues so long as there is no reference to God in the matter.

Plato, Aristotle, Aquinas

- Virtues promote and serve happiness as a means to an end.

Spinoza, Hobbes

- Both make self-preservation the end which determines the direction of virtuous conduct.

Relating Virtue to Happiness

Mills

- The multiplication of happiness is the object of virtue. But virtue is not natural and necessary condition of happiness. Plato and Aristotle seem to think the contrary because they define happiness as the ultimate end because it leaves nothing to be desired.

What is the good of virtue?

Hobbes

- Proposes a list of virtues which derive their goodness from the natural law: peace, and the ways or means of peace: justice, gratitude, modesty, equity, mercy

Locke

- Utility is the source of goodness in the virtues. . . . “the practice thereof necessary to the preservation of society and visibly beneficial to all with whom the virtuous man has to do”
- Virtues are whatever the members of a particular society deem advantageous.

Marcus Aurelius

- Virtue is its own reward.

War and Peace

- Man has always acted at variance with his wisdom, nullifying the hope of peace by preparing always for the next war.
- Good or bad, war seems inevitable.
- Plato and Aristotle seem to agree that war is rooted in the nature of things.

Aristotle

- The whole of life is divided into two parts, business and leisure, war and peace . . . There must be war for the sake of peace, business for the sake of leisure, things useful and necessary for the sake of things honorable.

Kant

- Agrees that, in the absence of what he calls a cosmo-political constitution or world state, war is inevitable.

Freud

- War is inevitable. Our fellow-citizens have not sunk so low as we feared, because they have never risen so high as we believed. So long as the conditions of existence among the nation are so varied, and the repulsions between so intense, there will be, there must be, war.

Hegel

- He is alone is not ambivalent. War is not only not to be regarded as an absolute evil but a necessary corrective for the corrosive influence of peace. War deals in earnest with the vanity of temporal goods and concerns.
- As a result of war, nations are strengthened, and people involved in civil strife also acquire peace at home through making war abroad.

Kant

- A prolonged peace favours the predominance of a mere commercial spirit and with it a debasing self-interest, cowardice and effeminacy and tends to degrade the characters of the nation.
- War has sublimity about it . . . the more sublime the more numerous the dangers to which they are exposed . . .

Hobbes, like Matthews later

- “when all the world is overcharged with inhabitants, then the last remedy of all is war”

Homer, Tolstoy

- war is a mixed blessing, an occasion for courage and agony.

Argument for World Govt.

Dante

- Contention can arise between two govts: through their own faults or their subjects; therefore, there should be judication between them.

Kant

- Of the great writers only Kant explicitly reaches this conclusion but he qualifies his acceptance and advocacy of it.

Augustine

- Does not prophecise a single political community of all men living together under one govt.

Dostoevsky

- Universal unity is the third and last anguish of men.

Wealth

- Adam Smith in “Wealth of Nations” treats wealth as an end and tries to formulate the natural laws for wealth making.
- Shakespeare on money: “the common whore of mankind.”
- Rousseau and Smith:
Civil govt was really instituted to protect the property of the rich against the poor.
- Tawney in “The Acquisitive Society”:
 - Wealth is the result of the release of all men to pursue without social conscience or inhibition to their personal self-interest.
 - He does not condemn indiscriminately the pursuit of wealth.
 - He seeks a social order in which industrial activity is professionalized. He would encourage such professionalism by the organization of workers to exercise power countering the power of the greedy.
- Veblen in The Theory of the Leisure Class:
 - Author of the phrase: “Conspicuous Consumption” and Conspicuous Waste”
 - With his book, he accomplished the nearly impossible: he made wealth and its display a subject of amusement, and maybe even scorn.
- Hegel
 - Poverty seems to be an inevitable consequence of property and the cause can not be abolished. The evil consists precisely in an excess of production and in the lack of a proportionate number of consumers who are themselves also producers, and thus it is simply intensified by both of the methods by which it is sought to alleviate it. Hegel concludes that it becomes apparent that despite an excess of wealth that civil society is not rich enough...to check excessive poverty and the creation of a penurious rabble.
- Rousseau
 - Wealth is contrary to nature

- The privileged few gorge themselves with superfluities while the starving multitude are in want of bare necessities.
- Gov't. should prevent extreme inequalities.
- Keynes in "General Theory of Employment, Interest, and Money":
Very interested in the moral, social, or even economic aspects of wealth.
He largely accepted what existed.
His concern was to have an economy that functioned with full or near full employment.
- Marx:
Describes the economic process in order to criticize the way in which some men get richer than they need be while others become poorer than they should be. His concern is primarily to remedy unequal distribution.

Will

- The traditional name for the intellectual appetite or the faculty of rational desire is will.
- Acting may follow thinking, but not without the intervention of a determination or a desire to translate thought into deed.
- Kant and Hegel are the most stalwart defenders of the will's freedom.

James

- Free will is the exertion of an effort on our part which is not determined by its object.
Willing to admit that our conscious of freedom may be a delusion. Yet he goes on to say that scientific law and prediction seem to call for the postulate of determinism, so moral responsibility and the genuineness of moral options seem to demand free will.

Hobbes

- If the only sense in which freedom can be affirmed is that of natural or political liberty — that is, the sense in which a man can do what he wills without restraint or compulsion — then the will is not free, for its freedom depends on how its own acts are caused, or how it causes other acts, not on how the acts it causes are affected by outward circumstances beyond its control.

Plato

- Reason depends also upon spirit (i.e. will) for without its support even wisdom must fail to influence conduct.

Aristotle

- Appetite is the generic notion. Will and desire are modes of appetite.

Kant

- The faculty of desire in so far as its inner principle of determination is the ground of its liking or predilection lies in the reason of the subject, constitutes the will.

Hegel

- Freedom is the essence of Will. Will without freedom is an empty word, while freedom is actual only as will.

Locke

- Power to begin or forebear, continue or end, the several actions of our minds and motions of our bodies ... unlike the mind's understanding, which is passive in receiving thoughts, the Will is active.
- Will is not an act of desires. Desire is an uneasiness of the mind for want of some absent good.

Hobbes, Locke, Hume

- Difference between voluntary and involuntary consists in the fact that when a man acts, he does what he himself has decided to do. The fact that his decision is itself caused does not abolish the freedom of his action but only the freedom of his will.
- For them freedom is abridged only by external forces which coerce a man to act contrary to his wishes or constrain him from acting as he wills.

Descartes

- We are immediately conscious of our freedom of choice. "I made no assumption concerning freedom which is not a matter of universal experience."

Hume's reply to Descartes' Notion of Universal Experience

- Experience is no proof since it is open to the suspicion that it is illusory rather than real. We suffer this illusion because we are motivated by the fantastical desire of shewing liberty.

Freud

- Freud discounts objections to the determinism of psychoanalysis on the part of those who refuse to recognize the hidden causes which control their actions. You have an illusion of a psychic freedom within you which you do not want to give up. But this deeply rooted belief in psychic freedom and choice must be given up because it is quite unscientific. It must give way before the claims of a determinism which governs even mental life.

Nietzsche

- Dismisses the whole issue of determinism versus free will by saying, "What is called freedom of will is essentially the emotion of superiority over him who must obey." Elsewhere he lists the notion of the will's freedom as one of "the four greatest errors." It is certainly not the least charm of a theory that it is refutable: it is with precisely this charm that it entices subtler minds. It seems that the hundred times refuted theory of free will owes its continued existence to this charm alone—again and again there comes along someone who feels he is strong enough to refute it.

Dr. Johnson

- All theory is against the freedom of the will, all experience for it.

Tolstoy

- We find a general law of necessity to which man is subject but regarding him from within ourselves as what we are conscious of, we feel ourselves to be free.

Wisdom

- With time, knowledge and learning may be increased but we do not think the same of wisdom.
- We do not think a man wise unless he acts wisely.
- Scriptures proclaim again and again that fear of the Lord is the beginning of wisdom.
- Pierre, in War and Peace: the height of wisdom is to acknowledge that all we can know is that we know nothing.
- Wisdom is the perfection of the intellect.

World