

Should the Colonies Have Revolted Against Great Britain?

Author: Lauren Catts, Hawthorne Elementary School; Elizabeth Getsinger, Westowne Elementary School; Corjie Tarlton, Sparks Elementary School, Baltimore County Public Schools

Grade Level: Upper Elementary

Duration: 6 Days

Overview:

At the time of the Revolutionary War, public opinion differed on whether the colonists should rebel against Great Britain. Some chose to remain loyal and thought America should remain part of the British Empire. Others wanted to break away and establish an independent nation. Many Native Americans, African Americans, and women were on both sides, but also had goals of obtaining individual rights. In this History Lab students will examine primary sources, including letters, pamphlets, paintings, political cartoons, agreements, speeches, treaties, and proclamations, to analyze the varying perspectives of white men, white women, African Americans, and Native Americans. They will synthesize historical evidence and make reasoned arguments to answer the overarching question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?”

History Standards

National History Standards

Era 3: Revolution and the New Nation (1754-1820s)

Standard 1: The causes of the American Revolution, the ideas and interests involved in forging the Revolutionary movement and the reasons for the American victory

Historical Thinking Standards

Standard 3: Historical Analysis and Interpretation

- A. Compare and contrast differing sets of ideas.
- B. Consider multiple perspectives.

Common Core State Standards

Reading Standards for Informational Text, Grade 5

Key Ideas and Details

- Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.
- Explain the relationship or interactions between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text based on specific information in the text.

Craft and Structure

- Analyze multiple accounts of the same event or topic, noting important similarities and differences in the point of view they represent.

Integration of Knowledge and Ideas

- Integrate information from several texts on the same topic in order to write or speak about the subject knowledgeably.

- Explain how an author uses reason and evidence to support particular points in a text identifying which reasons and evidence supports which point(s).

Range of Reading and Level of Text Complexity

- By the end of the year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, at the high end of the grades 4-5 text complexity band independently and proficiently.

Writing Standards, Grade 5

Text Types and Purposes

- Introduce a topic or text clearly, state an opinion, and create an organization structure in which ideas are logically grouped to support the writer's purpose
- Provide logically ordered reasons that are supported by facts and details
- Provide a concluding statement or section related to the opinion presented

Speaking and Listening Standards, Grade 5:

Comprehension and Collaboration

- Report on a topic or text or present an opinion, sequencing ideas logically and using appropriate facts and relevant, descriptive details to support main ideas or themes: speak clearly at an understandable pace.
- Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions.

Maryland State Curriculum Standards for Social Studies

Standard 5.0 History

Topic B: Emergence, Expansion and Changes in Nations and Empires

Indicator 2. Analyze the growth and development of colonial America

Objective C. Analyze the different roles and viewpoints of individuals and groups, such as women, men, free and enslaved Africans, and Native Americans during the Revolutionary period

Topic C: Conflict Between Ideas and Institutions

Indicator 1. Analyze the causes of the American Revolution

Objective B. Examine the viewpoints of Patriots and Loyalists regarding British colonial policy after the Seven Years' War

Standard 6.0 Social Studies Skills and Processes

Topic D: Acquire Social Studies Information

Indicator 1. Identify primary and secondary sources of information that relate to the topic/situation/problem being studied

Objective B. Read and obtain information from texts representing diversity in content, culture, authorship, and perspective

Topic F: Analyze Social Studies Information

Indicator 1. Interpret information from primary and secondary sources

Objective C. Analyze a document to determine point of view

Objective D. Analyze the perspective of the author

Topic G: Answer Social Studies Questions

Indicator 2. Use historic contexts to answer questions

Objective A. Use historically accurate resources to answer questions, make predictions, and support ideas

Objective C. Construct a sound historical interpretation

Purpose

In this History Lab students will analyze and synthesize historical evidence in order to make reasoned arguments to answer the overarching question: Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?

Students will:

- analyze primary and secondary sources and identify the perspectives of patriots, loyalists, white men, white women, Native Americans, and African Americans;
- classify and evaluate perspectives in order to answer the overarching question;
- determine which perspective best addresses the overarching question in determining whether the colonists should have revolted against Great Britain.

Topic Background

At the time of the Revolutionary War, public opinion varied about whether the colonists should revolt against Great Britain. Those who encouraged revolt were called Patriots. Some wanted to remain loyal to Great Britain and were called Loyalists. Still others, due to their religious beliefs, remained neutral. The decision to support the revolution was complex for white men, white women, African Americans and Native Americans.

White men wrote most accounts on the lead-up to the American Revolution. Thomas Paine was an influential proponent of the revolution. Paine had come to the colonies from Great Britain in 1774 after meeting Benjamin Franklin. Perhaps because of his humble background, Paine developed strong feelings about government and society. Government, Paine argued, was a “necessary evil” required to protect society. He strongly believed that monarchies were unnatural, since all men were born equal. He did not believe that anyone should inherit power. By doing so, he argued, monarchs were prone to corruption, which led to war and bloodshed. In *Common Sense*, the most widely read pamphlet of its time, Paine stated his case in simple, strong language. It was a powerful piece of propaganda that generated enthusiasm for all-out revolution.

Not all white men agreed with Paine. James Chalmers, who was a wealthy landowner from Maryland’s Eastern Shore, published *Plain Truth* as a lengthy response and counter-argument to *Common Sense*. Written for the educated elite, many of whom were already Loyalists, the tract included both literary and historical references. Chalmers, a Loyalist officer, writing under the

pseudonym Candidus, was convinced that the American colonies would be ruined by breaking away from Great Britain. He believed that history had proven that democratic nations were unsuccessful because they were wrought with mayhem. The colonists, he thought, would be better off if they remained loyal to Britain to avoid a serious war. He did not trust the intentions of the French and believed that the colonies owed a great deal to their mother country.

White women of the period were conflicted as well. The war, which was not confined to a distant frontier, was particularly difficult and unnerving, and impacted their homes and neighborhoods. Shortages of supplies and inflation required that women improvise and take on new responsibilities. Women in Patriot households participated in boycotts and protests. A group of genteel ladies launched a campaign to raise funds and supplies for the Continental Army. Some women took up arms to protect their children and homes. Others operated family farms and businesses, in addition to their household duties, while their husbands, fathers, and sons were away at war.

A number of white women worked directly for the Continental or for the British armies. Many women followed the men along the battlefield. While a distraction at times, women performed necessary tasks, such as cooking, laundering uniforms, and tending to the injured. Other women participated in military operations as couriers, conveying messages and supplies to the battlefield, and some even disguised themselves as men in order to fight in battle.

Women faced many dangers during the war. Loyalist women were targeted by gangs that looted their homes and terrorized them. Patriot women were tormented by British troops, who would force themselves into their homes, destroying everything in sight and taking valuable supplies. Many women found themselves in the unfamiliar position as the head of their household, in charge of their family's security for the first time.

Abigail Adams, wife to John Adams, an influential delegate to both the First and Second Continental Congress, and later the second President of the United States, was a prolific correspondent, who wrote frequently to her husband. Initially neutral at the onset of the war, Adams' views evolved and she came to favor revolution, believing that a new government might be the best opportunity for women to gain equality and economic freedom. Her letters were a passionate and reasoned argument for the rights of women.

Native Americans and African Americans also hoped to benefit from the revolution and formation of a new government. Native Americans, who were primarily concerned with protecting their way of life, were not particularly interested in entering the war. Years of skirmishes and exploitation made them skeptical about pledging their allegiance to either side, but the British and Americans promised supplies, protection, and land in return for their assistance.

Their reluctance was warranted. The Proclamation Line of 1763 was an attempt by the British to curb expansion of white settlement onto Native American lands. Almost as soon as it was signed, it became clear that the Colonial government had no real interest in or power to enforce the law. Land speculators and independent settlers were determined to move into western territory, regardless. In what would become a pattern, a new treaty was signed in 1768, the Treaty of Fort Stanwix, which established yet another western boundary for white settlement.

Native Americans were not particularly concerned with sacrificing themselves for the cause of the revolution, but they were interested in the outcome. They wanted to preserve their way of life, protect their territorial integrity, and avoid political cooptation by either side. Native Americans made decisions about the war based on their regional and tribal concerns. By the end of the war, however, the offers of land and peaceful co-existence were never actually realized, leaving many tribal communities divided and weakened.

Similarly, enslaved African Americans had their own goals for the revolution. Their primary concern was in gaining their freedom. They, too, had to determine which side best served their interests. At the time, abolitionist rhetoric was increasing and words like “tyranny” and “slavery” were used to describe British control over the colonies. The notion of inherent equality was discussed. Many African Americans were inspired and hopeful that the Revolution might bring about freedom and equality.

On November 7, 1775, John Murray, the fourth Earl of Dunmore and Royal Governor of Virginia, as well as a slaveholder, issued a proclamation offering freedom to any slave that joined the British Army. George Washington and members of the Continental Congress, many of whom also owned slaves, were reluctant to arm enslaved men or anger their owners. Instead, they allowed free blacks to join the Continental Army. Eventually slaves became part of the Patriot army as the need for soldiers increased. While most African-American soldiers and sailors participated in non-combat roles, some divisions saw combat. African Americans participated in the earliest battles at Lexington, Concord, Bunker Hill, and others.

Freedom, however, would elude African Americans during the Revolutionary period, even for those who allied themselves with the British. Many African-American soldiers succumbed to smallpox and fevers. British officers took others into personal service. Most were left to fend for themselves in the immediate aftermath of the war, only to be enslaved once more in the Southern states of the new independent American nation.

The diverse populations of the American colonies reveal the multiple perspectives on the Revolution. Gender, race, socio-economic status, and even religion, influenced and, in some instances, circumscribed people’s decisions to revolt or to remain loyal to Great Britain.

Reference List

Berkin, Carol. 2006. *Revolutionary Mothers: Women in the Struggle for America’s Independence*. New York: Vintage Books.

Kaplan, Sidney and Emma Nogrady Kaplan. 1989. *The Black Presence in the Era of the American Revolution*. Revised ed. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts Press.

Nash, Gary B. 2005. *The Unknown American Revolution: The Unruly Birth of Democracy and the Struggle to Create America*. New York: Penguin Books.

Raphael, Ray. *A People's History of the American Revolution: How Common People Shaped the Fight for Independence*. A New Press People's History, ed. Howard Zinn. New York: New Press, 2001.

Vocabulary

Primary Sources – Artifacts, documents, recordings, or other sources of information that were created at the time under study; they serve as an original source of information about the topic.

Secondary Sources – Interpretations and analysis of primary sources; they are one step removed from the original event.

Monarchy – A government in which the power is held by the king or queen.

Succession – The process where one relative replaces another for the throne.

Constitution – The fundamental policies on which a state is governed.

Democracy – A government where the power is held by the people.

Treaty – An agreement between nations.

Alliance – A formal friendship, usually united by a treaty.

Ally – A formal friend, usually united by a treaty.

Traitor – One who goes against his/her government.

Conducting the History Lab

Overarching Question: Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?

Students will examine primary sources, including letters, pamphlets, paintings, political cartoons, agreements, speeches, treaties, and proclamations, to analyze the varying perspectives of white men, white women, African Americans, and Native Americans. They will synthesize this historical evidence in order to make reasoned arguments to answer the overarching question.

The lessons in this History Lab contain primary source documents that will guide students in answering the overarching question. To help students make the connection between daily instruction and the big picture, each day begins by asking re-stating the overarching question. Teachers should create an interactive bulletin board on which students can record the differing perspectives from each lesson that helps them to answer the overarching question.

Differentiated resources are included to provide content support for students of varying reading and writing levels.

Day One: White Male Perspectives – *Common Sense*

Students will analyze a primary source document, *Common Sense*, by Thomas Paine, in order to classify and evaluate the Patriot viewpoint of the American Revolution. They will discuss the focus question: What was the white male perspective?

Materials:

- RS#29 Revolution History Lab PowerPoint 1 (Optional PowerPoint presentations have been included as a resource for each day's lesson.)
- Bulletin board with overarching question posted
- RS #01 "The Battle of Bunker Hill," painting by John Trumbull (one color image to display to the class)
- RS#02 Selection from *Common Sense* for teacher use (Complete transcripts of the documents in this History Lab are included for teachers or for use with high-ability readers.)
- RS#03 Selected Paragraphs from *Common Sense*
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (also to display in room)
- RS#05/#05MAssessment - Evaluating Thomas Paine
- RS#06 Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways)

For Students:

- Notebook, folder, or piece of construction paper, folded in half, in which to keep all History Lab papers. Students will need to refer back to work from previous lessons to complete the final assessment. Students should label with their name and the overarching question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?"

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab: Tell students that historians discover information about the past by analyzing different documents. Show students what you mean by introducing and analyzing "The Battle of Bunker Hill/The Death of General Warren" painting, by John Trumbull. This will help to access prior knowledge and set the context for the History Lab.

Cover the caption. Reveal the information as students respond.

What do students know about analyzing a historical document or work of art? Are they asking questions similar to the ones below? If not, elicit these responses:

- Who painted this? *John Trumbull*
- Who was this painted for? *The public*
- Who is in the painting? *The students should see Patriots and British soldiers in different uniforms*
- What does this painting show? *The painting shows what happened during the Battle of Bunker Hill.*
- Where does the scene in this painting take place? *On a battlefield on Breed's Hill (The Battle was misnamed for the nearby Bunker Hill.)*
- When was this painting created? *March 1786*
- When does the scene take place? *June 1775*
- Why did the painter choose to paint this scene? *He wanted to illustrate a moment in history when the British had finally taken the hill and General Warren was killed.*
- How did the painter create this painting? *It was idealized and inaccurate but students will soon learn that Trumbull was actually there. He painted it eleven years after the battle though.*
- What is the main action in the foreground? *General Warren had been shot in the head by a musket ball and laid dying. Another soldier held him to prevent a British soldier from stabbing him with his bayonet.*
- Why do you think this section was highlighted? *Trumbull was saying that Warren's death was an important part of the Battle of Bunker Hill. This showed a Patriot dying for the cause of*

Liberty. (This could lead to a discussion of whether or not the students would fight and possibly die for their liberty.)

- What else and who else do you see in the background? *General Putnam was ordering the retreat of his men. Major Pitcairn can be seen behind Colonel Small. Pitcairn, of the British marines, was mortally wounded, and had fallen into the arms of a soldier. Under the heel of Colonel Small laid the dead body of Colonel Abercrombie. General Howe, who commanded the British troops, and General Clinton can be seen behind the principal group.*
- What perspective does this represent? *Although this shows the Americans in defeat, the scene favorably highlights the colonists.*

Provide more information about John Trumbull to further prove that he was a Patriot.

- He lived from June 6, 1756 to November 10, 1843.
- He was an American artist during the period of the American Revolutionary War.
- His *Declaration of Independence* was used on the reverse of the two-dollar bill.
- He was a soldier in the American Revolutionary War (sketched plans of British works and witnessed the Battle of Bunker Hill).
- He was appointed second personal aide to General George Washington.

Discuss what students already know about the Battle of Bunker Hill and Revolutionary War era.

- Does this painting depict this event accurately? *No*
- Is there any other information we can glean from this picture that we did not already know? *Although the painting was imprecise, it did show the British charging up a hill and attacking the colonists from below. It also depicted the key players in the event, including the deaths of General Warren, Major Pitcairn, and Colonel Abercrombie. The British lost quite a few troops that day. Even though they won the battle, they were disappointed by the losses they suffered.*

Before Reading - Frame the History Lab: Reveal the overarching question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?”

Facilitate the students’ framing of focus questions that will lead them to addressing the overarching question. Record and post students’ questions.

If necessary, lead students to important questions that they have not considered, including:

- Whose perspective did John Trumbull represent?
- Are there other perspectives to consider?
- Who else was living in the colonies at that time?
- What was the white female perspective?
- What was the white male perspective?
- What was the African perspective?
- What was the Native American perspective?
- What was the Patriot perspective?
- What was the Loyalist perspective?
- What was the neutral perspective?

Identify sources of information that would provide answers to focus questions, such as the Internet, textbooks, library, experts, newspapers, paintings, diaries, letters, film, music, poetry.

Differentiate and define primary and secondary sources. Primary sources are artifacts, documents, recordings, or other sources of information that were created at the time. They serve as original sources of information about the topic. Secondary sources provide interpretation and analysis of primary sources. Secondary sources are one step removed from the original event or “horse’s mouth.” They are created by people who did not witness the event.

During Reading - Model the historical process by doing a close reading:

Use a focus question to model the process of analyzing historical sources: What was the white male perspective?

Introduce Thomas Paine’s *Common Sense*.

Explain to students that you will show them how a historian thinks when he or she is looking at a historical document and that they will have a chance to do this. Remind students to think about what you are doing as a historian that will help them analyze the document so that they can answer the question: What is the white male perspective?

Model thinking aloud:

When historians look at historical documents, the first thing they think is what kind of document is this? I see that we have something that looks like a book – it is actually a pamphlet.

A historian looks at the words on the front cover. I see the word “America,” so I am thinking it has to do with our country. When I look closer, it says, “addressed to the inhabitants of America,” so the author is writing this to everyone in America.

I notice the title, Common Sense. I know that Common Sense is an important text that greatly influenced people’s opinions during the Revolutionary period. I even notice the date on the bottom that says, “1776.”

I also notice an image with the words “Thomas Paine” underneath. I know this is the author of this text.

Now that I have examined the front cover, it is time to look inside. As we are reading as historians, we want to think about what the text is trying to tell us. Specifically, we are trying to discover the white male perspective and how it contributes to whether the colonists should have revolted against Great Britain.

Let’s read the first paragraph. When I read, I can tell already that Thomas Paine does not like kings. I know this because it says, “there was no kings, the consequence of which there was no wars.” So, I can infer Paine thinks that when there are kings, there is also war. A historian is going to question Paine’s opinion. Does he present any facts to support his statements? Paine mentions Holland as a country that doesn’t have a king and has had peace for nearly 100 years. Could we find information to support this statement?

Let’s read paragraph two. Paine is using really strong language here. He says that kings are created by the devil. I get the feeling that Paine would not follow a king, because he says that kings were created by people who don’t believe in God. He even calls kings “worms.” I am wondering why Paine hates kings and monarchies so much. Let’s keep reading.

Let's read paragraphs three and four. Well, that answers our question! Paine says a monarchy is evil because kings and queens inherit the throne at any age—so you could have a really young king or a really old king. Then the public becomes prey to villainous people in the king's court who will try to take advantage of the king's age. Paine doesn't seem to have faith in the process of a monarchy. He believes they just result in blood.

Let's read the next paragraph. "MONSTERS!" Look at the word choice again. I can tell Paine is ashamed of his country, because he is using a metaphor to compare Britain to beasts eating their children, bloodthirsty people making war on their families, and monsters. Therefore, if Britain is the parent country, then the colonies are the children. Paine is trying to paint a visual image of the relationship between Britain and the colonies — it is not a very healthy one!

Let's read the last paragraph. Paine does not think that the colonies need to be dependent on Britain anymore. He believes "a government of our own is our natural right."

After Reading - Continue to model aloud:

So, what is "common sense" to Thomas Paine? *It is common sense that the colonies should rule themselves. It does not make sense for the colonies to be ruled by a king.*

Based on Paine's text, what is his perspective on whether the colonies should revolt against Great Britain? *Paine thinks the colonists should revolt, because he believes the colonies should rule themselves instead of being ruled by a king. He finds fault with monarchies and thinks that kings cause war and the worship of false idols. Also, old and young kings can be manipulated by evil people who will destroy the country. Basically, monarchies go against God and cause bloodshed and it is only natural that the colonies have the right to their own government.*

Co-create an anchor chart with students, entitled Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents.

- Identify the type of document
- Identify the author and any relevant information about the author
- Identify the date and historical context
- Identify the audience
- Identify the purpose for writing
- Look for clues in the text that help to identify the author's perspectives (word choice, tone, facts and opinions, inferences, connect the text back to the title)
- Connect the text back to the title

Distribute notebook, folder, or a piece of construction paper folded in half for students to keep all History Lab papers together (Students will need to refer back to work from previous lessons in order to complete the final assessment. Students should label it with their name and the overarching question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?") Have students glue or clip RS#04, Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents, into their folders.

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Have students respond to this prompt: Do you agree with Paine? Explain why or why not using specific text support from *Common Sense*.

Teachers may choose to use RS#05/#05M, Assessment - Evaluating Thomas Paine, or post the question on the board.

Wrap-Up Discussion: Review Paine's perspective. Confirm the historical facts and clarify the reasons behind his interpretation.

Post *Common Sense* on bulletin board, with "thumb" from RS #06 Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways) — thumbs up for Paine, because he is in favor of the colonists revolting against Great Britain. Explain that the bulletin board will help us keep track of all the perspectives we are learning about so that at the end of the lab, we will be able to make an informed decision about whether we think the colonists should have revolted against Great Britain.

Briefly engage the students in a concluding conversation about the progress they've made so far in answering the focus question, "What is the white male perspective?" Review the overarching question.

Have we answered the question, "What is the white male perspective?" *We've only learned about one male perspective.*

- Do you think Paine's perspective represented every white male perspective? *No*
- What could we as historians do to gain a better understanding of the white male perspective? *Look at more documents by white males.*

Day Two: White Male Perspectives – Plain Truth

Students will analyze a primary source document, *Plain Truth*, in order to classify and evaluate the Loyalist viewpoint of the American Revolution.

Materials:

- RS#31 Revolution History Lab PowerPoint 2
- History Lab Bulletin Board
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (displayed in room)
- RS#06 Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways)
- RS#30 Common Sense Document Log Answer Key
- RS#07 *Plain Truth* (can show whole class unless you use PowerPoint / need one for whole class and one for bulletin board)
- RS#08 Selected Paragraphs from *Plain Truth*
- RS#32 Plain Truth Document Log Answer Key

For Students:

- History Lab notebook
- RS#30 Common Sense Document Log Answer Key (one for each student)
- RS#08 Selected Paragraphs for *Plain Truth*
- RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log (one for each student)

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab: Ask students to think back to yesterday. *What is our goal as historians in this History Lab? To learn the different perspectives of people living in the Revolutionary War era in order to answer our overarching question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?"*

Hand out Historian Notebooks and RS#30 Common Sense Document Log Answer Key. Review Log and ask students – What did we learn about the white male perspective yesterday? Do you think it represented all white males? Do you think every white male agree with Paine? *No.*

Before Reading - Frame the History Lab:

Mention: *Today we are going to continue investigating the focus question, “What is the white male perspective?”*

Provide students with a copy of RS#08 Selected Paragraphs from Plain Truth, RS#09/#09M History Lab Document, and the Historian Notebooks students constructed in Lesson One.

During Reading - Model the historical process by doing a close reading:

Indicate: *It’s your turn to analyze documents to uncover the author’s perspective. As you analyze this historical document, remember to use the strategies from our first lesson. What is the first thing you should be thinking? What questions should you ask when you analyze a document?*

Elicit responses:

- Type of document
- Title
- Author and author information
- Date and historical context
- Intended audience
- Purpose for writing

Teachers can refer students to RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents if they need help.

Have students read through *Plain Truth* and try to complete the first section of the Historical Document Log. Go over the answers as a class and allow students to correct their answers. Lead students in a close reading of the document. Students who have difficulty finding text support in primary source documents can underline the sections discussed.

Say: *Let’s take a closer look at the text in the document.*

Read the introduction aloud.

Say: *Turn and discuss with your partner what Chalmers is saying. Talk about the strategy you used to understand the introduction.*

Chalmers was angered by Common Sense. He loved his country as it was, and believed that if the colonies became independent, the country would “plunge” into “ruin.”

Have we learned anything about Chalmers’ perspective? Turn and talk to your partner.

Chalmers supported “his country,” Great Britain, and did not want the colonies to break away.

Read Row 2. Briefly explain that Chalmers had *Common Sense* in front of him and used it to state his argument.

Read Rows 3 and 4.

Continue: *Talk with your partner about the strategy you used to interpret what Chalmers is saying.*

Chalmers believed that without the king, average people could not rule themselves.

Democracies caused countries to engage in war.

Say: Remember, Chalmers has Common Sense right in front of him—what specific argument do you notice Chalmers was attacking? Paine believed that kings caused wars. He used the Bible and Holland as historical examples. Chalmers believed that democracies caused wars. He used Greece and Rome as historical examples.

Read Rows 5, 6, and 7 with your partner and complete the “Text Support” and “Purpose for Writing” sections of the History Lab Document Log.

Lead a whole-group discussion of Rows 5, 6, and 7. Have students share what else they learned about Chalmers’ perspective.

Elicit responses that use specific text support from RS#32 Plain Truth Document Log Answer Key, including:

Row 5 - Great Britain made “monstrous efforts” to save the colonies from France and to protect that land. Great Britain would not peacefully allow the colonies to gain independence.

Row 6 - If the colonies remained with Great Britain, they would have avoided war and still been able to trade with other countries.

Row 7 - Independence and slavery are the same thing—life for the colonists would have been horrible without Great Britain. Colonists seeking “true liberty” should have settled the dispute with Great Britain.

If further discussion of the document is needed, you can ask:

- What specific words and phrases did Chalmers use to get his point across? *Some powerful phrases came from Row 6 (“horrors and misfortune of war”) and Row 7 (“horror, misery, and devastation, awaiting the people who are trying to gain American independence”).*
- What tactic was Chalmers using to make his point? *Chalmers was definitely trying to scare the Americans into staying with Great Britain.*

After Reading - Continue to model aloud:

Have students complete the “Author’s Perspective” section on RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log independently. Remind students to include specific information from the text and a concluding statement. You may use this for an assessment. Elicit student responses to the question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?” Students should be able to explain what they think and why they think it.

Possible answer: James Chalmers thought “our country” would be ruined if the colonists tried to break away from Great Britain. Democratic countries were “wracked” with war. We (the colonies) should have

remained loyal to England to try to avoid war. We should have tried to resolve our dispute, instead of trying to break away.

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Review Chalmers' and Paine's perspectives and have students help you post *Plain Truth* on bulletin board with "thumbs"—thumbs down for Chalmers.

Discuss the ways in which the interpretations relate to each other. Look for commonalities and differences. Solidify historical facts and clarify the reasons behind these interpretations. Students should say that Paine and Chalmers had conflicting views on monarchies and democracies. Both men thought the other's type of government caused wars. They also disagreed on our overarching question and used very strong language to make their points.

Briefly engage the students in a concluding conversation about the progress they have made so far in answering the focus question and overarching question.

What other information do we need in order to better answer our overarching question? *We need to learn other perspectives, such as those of white women, Native Americans, and African Americans.*

Conclude: *Tomorrow we will take a look at the perspectives of white females.*

Collect Historical Document Logs.

Day Three: White Female Perspectives

Students will analyze primary source documents, including a political cartoon, letters, and a newspaper article, in order to classify and evaluate the white female viewpoint of the American Revolution.

Materials:

- RS#33 Revolution History Lab PowerPoint 3
- History Lab Bulletin Board
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (displayed in room)
- RS#06 4 thumbs from Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways)
- RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log
- RS#10 The Edenton "Tea Party" (Transcript) (one for teacher and bulletin board)
- RS#11 The Edenton "Tea Party" (Adapted)
- RS#34 Edenton Tea Party Document Log Answer Key
- RS#12 A Society of Patriotic Ladies, at Edenton in North Carolina
- RS#35 Society of Patriotic Ladies Document Log Answer Key
- RS#13 Letters from Abigail Adams to John Adams (Transcript)
- RS#14 Letters from Abigail Adams to John Adams (Adapted) (one for teacher and bulletin board)
- RS#36 Letters from Abigail Adams Document Log Answer Key
- RS#15 Letter from Deborah Champion to Patience (Transcript) (one for teacher and bulletin board)
- RS#16 Excerpt from Letter from Deborah Champion to Patience
- RS#37 Letter from Deborah Champion Document Log Answer Key

For Students:

- History Lab notebook
- RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log (one blank copy per student)
- RS#11 The Edenton “Tea Party” (Adapted) (one per student unless you want to display it for whole class)
- RS#34 Edenton Tea Party Document Log Answer Key (one per student)
- RS#12 A Society of Patriotic Ladies, at Edenton in North Carolina (one per student unless you want to display it for whole class)
- RS#35 Society of Patriotic Ladies Document Log Answer Key (one per student)
- RS#14 Letters from Abigail Adams to John Adams (Adapted) (one per student)
- RS#36 Letters from Abigail Adams Document Log Answer Key (one for half of the class)
- RS#15 Letter from Deborah Champion to Patience (Transcript) (one per student)
- RS#37 Letter from Deborah Champion Document Log Answer Key (one for half of the class)

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab: Say: *Well, historians, today we are back and continuing our investigation of the question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?” What have we learned over the past two days? (One thumbs up, one thumbs down posted so far.)*

Before Reading - Frame the History Lab:

Begin: *Today we will look at the perspectives of several white females. How do you think women of the time felt about the colonies revolting?*

Present RS#11 The Edenton “Tea Party” (Adapted)

Say: *We will work together to analyze this document. In it, you will find a document within a document. Let’s take a look. Remember to employ the strategies of historians. What questions should you ask about this document? Turn and talk to your partner.*

Elicit responses:

- Type of document
- Title
- Author and author information
- Date and historical context
- Intended audience
- Purpose for writing

Teachers can refer students to RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents if they need help.

During Reading - Model the historical process by doing a close reading:

Allow the students to do a close reading of the document. This can be done as a whole group or independently.

Elicit student responses, including:

- What type of document is this? *This is a document within a document—there is a quote from the Edenton Tea Party Proclamation within a letter about the tea party that was published in a newspaper. Discuss both.*

- Who wrote the letter? *Unknown author*
- Who wrote the document (proclamation)? *A female association - see signatures*
- What do we know about the women? *They seemed to be upset about the Tea Act if they were having a "Tea Party."*
- What is the historical context? *This happened after the Tea Act of 1773, when Britain gave a monopoly on the tea trade to the British East India Trading Company. It also happened after the Boston Tea Party of 1773.*
- What year was the letter written? *October 27, 1774*
- When was it published? *January 31, 1775.*
- When was the proclamation signed? *October 25, 1774*
- Who is the intended audience for the letter? *It was printed in the Morning Chronicle and London Advertiser, so it was written for the public and the British government.*
- Who is the intended audience for the Proclamation? *Fellow colonists who may have been inspired to stand with them. Loyalists who may have been intimidated.*
- What was the author's purpose in writing the letter? *The author wanted to show the female colonists and British government what the women were doing. The ladies of Edenton served as examples for other women and the government to take notice.*
- What was the purpose of the Proclamation? *The ladies proclaimed they were rebelling.*
- What evidence from the Proclamation tells us the white female perspective? *See RS#34 Edenton Tea Party Document Log Answer Key.*
- Would these women support a revolt again Great Britain? *Yes*
- Do you think this perspective represented the perspective of all white females? *No*

Hand out RS#34 Edenton Tea Party Document Log Answer Key for students to include in their Historian Notebooks.

Say: *Let's take a look at another perspective.*

Present RS#12 A Society of Patriotic Ladies, at Edenton in North Carolina.

Say: *You will work together to analyze this document. Remember to employ the strategies historians use to help them understand historical documents. What questions do you have about this document? Talk to your partner and answer some of the most important questions.*

Elicit student responses to the questions:

- What type of document is this? *Political cartoon*
- Who created this document? *Unknown*
- What do we know about the cartoonist? *The cartoon was published in a London newspaper, so maybe the cartoonist was from London too. Maybe he was a Loyalist.*
- What year was this created? *March 1775*
- What is the historical context of the political cartoon? *The cartoon was published 4 or 5 months after the Ladies of Edenton signed their Proclamation. It was published after the Tea Act and Boston Tea Party of 1773.*
- Who is the intended audience? *The audience may have been members of British society, who may have agreed with this cartoon. The creator may have wanted the Ladies of Edenton to see it too.*

- What is the purpose of printing this political cartoon? *To make fun of the Edenton women and possibly male Patriots*

Continue:

Since this is a political cartoon, we will need to “read” this document for support in a slightly different way. We need to look closely for small visual details.

Elicit responses, including:

- What are the women doing? *Mention the action in the foreground and the background. The women are having a meeting. Several of the women appear coy and to be flirting with the men. Some of the women are pouring flasks of tea (or alcohol) and there are other flasks under the table. Also underneath the table, a child is holding a tray of food that is being licked by a dog. This was meant to imply that the women were not good mothers.*
- Who are these women? *A Society of Ladies at Edenton*
- How are they portrayed? *The cartoonist meant for the women to look silly. In 1775, a woman being involved in politics was strange. Women having a political meeting would have been scoffed at. Several of the women look ridiculous wearing extreme high fashion (small caps over huge hair). The woman chairing the meeting and holding the gavel was depicted as rather ugly and almost manly. The cartoonist might have intended to suggest that only a man could run a political meeting.*
- Do you think this is what actually happened? *No*
- What does this evidence tell us about the British perspective on the Edenton tea party? *The cartoonist did not take the women seriously. He thought what they were doing was silly and unimportant.*
- Would the political cartoonist support a revolt against Great Britain? *No*

This is also an appropriate point to discuss the elements of a political: satire, captions, caricature, symbolism, and exaggeration.

Distribute RS#34 Edenton Tea Party Document Log Answer Key and RS#35 Society of Patriotic Ladies Document Log Answer Key for reference for students when they complete their final assessment on Day Six.

Hand out RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log, RS#14 Letters from Abigail Adams to John Adams (Adapted), and RS#15 Letter from Deborah Champion to Patience (Transcript). Every student needs a copy of both documents so they can refer to them during the discussion.

Announce: *You are now going to have the opportunity to think and work as a historian on your own. You have been given one of two different documents to closely read and analyze. You will be looking at a white female perspective and will need to use your historian strategies to analyze these documents. You will have time to analyze and complete your Historical Document Log on your own. Remember to include specific information from the text and a concluding statement. Then you will share with another classmate who has analyzed another primary source document. Finally, we will all discuss what we have learned about the white female perspective.*

After Reading - Continue to model aloud:

Have students pair off in groups so they can share the information from their document with other students who did not read it. It may be helpful to have groups of 4 so you can have 2 students explain the same document. Remind students to take turns, speak clearly, listen carefully, and to feel free to ask questions.

Whole Group Interpretation Discussion:

Review the Historical Document Logs using the Abigail Adams and Deborah Champion answer keys:

Discuss the text support students found to provide evidence for the authors' perspective. Elicit the student responses, including:

Abigail Adams - Abigail Adams was the highly intelligent wife of John Adams, a member of the Continental Congress. John Adams thought the colonists should revolt against Great Britain, but Abigail expressed her uncertainty about America's future. She asked John a lot of questions about the type of government America would have and how it would be governed. She was worried about the fate of the country because there were no clear answers. She was also concerned with the rights of women and wanted to make sure that when the new government was formed, that women would be represented. Abigail was neither for nor against a revolt in 1775. She seemed to want her questions answered before she formed an opinion about the current situation. She did, however, feel that the difficulties in creating a new government could be overcome by patience and perseverance. By 1776 her feelings had evolved. She did want the colonists to revolt with the hope that they would include women in the new government.

Deborah Champion - Deborah was the daughter of a Patriot general in Washington's Continental army. She had to travel to deliver a very important document to General Washington. She believed that the "Mother Country" was not giving the colonists their rights and that the colonists would go to war to fight for independence if they had to. She commented that British tea was not served at any house where she stopped. Deborah believed she was a Patriot, and was even complimented by Washington himself for her "courage and patriotism."

Give students the completed answer keys for the documents they did not analyze for the final assessment.

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Wrap-Up Discussion: Post all documents on bulletin board with "thumbs"—thumbs up for *Morning Chronicle and London Advertiser* newspaper article/letter; thumbs down for London political cartoon; thumbs sideways for Abigail Adams; thumbs up for Deborah Champion.

Discuss the white female perspectives and the ways in which the interpretations relate to each other. Look for commonalities and differences. Solidify historical facts and clarify the reasons behind these interpretations.

Briefly engage the students in a concluding conversation about the progress they have made so far in answering the overarching question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?"

Say: Now that we have analyzed the white male and female perspectives, which other perspectives would be helpful in answering our question? *Native Americans and African Americans*

Collect Historical Document Logs.

Day Four: Native-American Perspectives

Students will analyze primary source documents including a painting, a speech, and a treaty in order to classify and evaluate the Native American viewpoint of the American Revolution.

Materials:

- RS#38 Revolution History Lab PowerPoint Day 4
- History Lab Bulletin Board
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (displayed in room)
- RS#06 2 thumbs from Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways)
- RS#17 “The Death of Jane McCrea” by John Vanderlyn (color copy to display to whole class or use PowerPoint)
- RS#18 Disturbances in America, Joseph Brant
- RS#19 Disturbances in America, Joseph Brant (Adapted) (one for teacher and bulletin board)
- RS#39 Disturbances in America (Joseph Brant) Document Log Answer Key
- RS#20 Treaty with the Delawares, 1778
- RS#21 Treaty with the Delawares, 1778 (Transcript)
- RS#22 Treaty with the Delawares, 1778 (Adapted) (one for teacher and bulletin board)
- RS#40 Treaty with the Delawares Document Log Answer Key

For Students

- History Lab notebook
- RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log (one for each student)
- RS#19 Disturbances in America, Joseph Brant (Adapted) (one for half the class)
- RS#39 Disturbances in America (Joseph Brant) Document Log Answer Key (one for half the class)
- RS#22 Treaty with the Delawares, 1778 (Adapted) (one for half the class)
- RS#40 Treaty with the Delawares Document Log Answer Key one for half the class)

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab: *What have we learned so far in trying to cover our question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?”*

Today we will examine Native American perspectives.

Before Reading - Frame the History Lab: Introduce the painting, “The Death of Jane McCrea,” by John Vanderlyn. Cover the caption to set the context for the today’s lesson. Reveal information as the students respond.

Remind students about the questions they should ask when analyzing a historical work of art or document. Make sure they ask questions similar to the ones below.

- Who painted this? *John Vanderlyn (born in New York)*
- Who was the painter painting for? *Student responses could vary, but say that Vanderlyn actually painted it for Joel Barlow, an American-born poet, diplomat, and politician, who used it as an illustration for one of his epic poems. Vanderlyn painted many portraits and panoramas.*

- Who is depicted in the painting? *Jane McCrea and two Native Americans*
- What does this painting show? *Jane had been captured by the Native Americans and was about to be scalped. There are several versions of the real story: (1) McCrea, a Loyalist, was ambushed by Native Americans who took her back to a British camp expecting a reward. On the way, the Native Americans got into a quarrel over the reward, and one of them then killed and scalped her. (2) McCrea was killed by a bullet fired by pursuing Americans and later an exhumation of her body revealed only bullet wounds, and no tomahawk wounds.*
- How are the figures portrayed? *The Native Americans appear strong, vicious, and angry and Jane looks terrified. The figures are romanticized because they are so attractive and perfect.*
- What is John Vanderlyn's perspective of the Native Americans? *John Vanderlyn portrayed Jane as innocent and the Native Americans as savages. He was portraying the Native Americans in a bad light.*
- Where does the scene in this painting take place? *A forest*
- When was this painting created? *1804*
- When does the scene take place? *July 27, 1777*
- Why did the painter choose to paint this scene? *He was commissioned to capture this alleged event for poet Joel Barlow. It made the Native Americans and British look bad and helped the Patriots to recruit more soldiers. As the caption says, Jane McCrea was the fiancée of a soldier in Burgoyne's Army. When she was slain, Burgoyne was unable to find her killers. This led to decreased confidence in the ability of the British to protect their citizens and a recruiting boom for the Patriot army.*
- How did the painter create this painting? *He was not at the event, but likely heard about it because it was notorious. He could have read about the event in Barlow's poem, "The Columbia," before illustrating it.*
- How did analyzing this painting help you to understand the relationship between the Native Americans, British, and colonists? *There was friction between the Native Americans and both groups at this time. The Native Americans killed a Loyalist woman and the Patriots took advantage of the situation by turning it into propaganda, creating an enlistment boom for their army.*

Say: *Based on the historical context, let's now examine Native American perspectives.*

Hand out RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log, RS#19 Disturbances in America, Joseph Brant (Adapted), and RS#22 Treaty with the Delawares, 1778 (Adapted) to the whole class. Students will need a copy of each document to refer to during the discussion.

Say: *You will think and work as a historian on your own. You will be given one of two different documents to closely read and analyze. You will need to use your historian strategies to analyze these documents. You will have time to analyze and complete your Historical Document Log on your own. Remember to include specific information from the text and a concluding statement. Then you will share with another classmate who has analyzed another primary source document. Then we will all discuss what we've learned about the Native American perspective.*

During Reading - Model the historical process by doing a close reading:

Have half the class read one document and half the class read the other. Provide students time to work independently—they should read their documents and complete the Historical Document Log.

After Reading - Continue to model aloud:

Small Group Interpretation Discussion: Have students pair off in groups so they can share the information from their document with other students who did not read it. It may be helpful to have groups of 4 so you can have 2 students explain the same document. Remind students to take turns, speak clearly, listen carefully, and to feel free to ask questions.

Whole Group Interpretation Discussion:

Review the Historical Document Logs using the Joseph Brant and the Treaty with the Delawares answer keys.

Discuss the text support students found to provide evidence for the authors' perspective. Elicit the student responses, including:

Treaty with the Delawares, 1778 - The Delaware Nations sided with the Americans in order to make peace with them and protect their lands. The Native Americans allowed the Americans to come through their lands to reach enemy forts. They also provided the Americans with supplies and sent strong warriors to help fight off the British. The Native Americans seemed to be in favor of the colonists breaking away since they were helping them.

- Do you think that the Native Americans and Patriots abided by this treaty? *The Americans actually broke many treaties and so did the British, as you will see with the next document.*

“The Disturbances in America give great trouble to our all Nations” - Joseph Brant swore his allegiance to the King of England but was not very happy with him. The British soldiers were not helping the Native Americans to defend their land against the colonists and the British people were trying to trick the Indians out of their land. He seemed to want the king's help in punishing the colonists and some British subjects. Brant supported the king in his endeavor to prevent the colonists' revolt but also cared about the needs of his people.

- Which do you think was Joseph Brant's higher priority, holding on to his homeland and way of life or helping the British to maintain possession of the colonies? Use specific words and phrases to support your answer. *Answers may vary, but Native Americans were trying to hold onto their culture and avoid being forced into Britain's political system of government. Brant wanted to stay in the king's favor so he could have what he wanted. He said, “The Six Nations who always loved the king” and that the Mohawks have “shown their passion and loyalty to the Great King.” He mentioned all the negative things the British have done, as well as the fact that they have very little land to live on.*

Give students the following completed answer keys for the documents they did not analyze to keep as resources for the final assessment.

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Wrap-Up Discussion: Post the documents on bulletin board with “thumbs” — thumbs up for the Treaty with the Delawares and thumbs down for Joseph Brant.

Discuss the Native American perspectives and the ways in which the interpretations relate to each other. Look for commonalities and differences. Solidify historical facts and clarify the reasons behind these interpretations.

Briefly engage the students in a concluding conversation about the progress they have made so far in answering the overarching question, “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?”

Now that we have analyzed the white male and female and Native-American perspectives, which other perspective would be helpful in answering our question? *African American*

Collect Historical Document Logs.

Day Five: African-American Perspectives

Students will analyze primary source documents including a painting, a speech, and a treaty in order to classify and evaluate the African-American viewpoint of the American Revolution.

Materials:

- RS#41 Revolutionary History Lab PowerPoint 5
- History Lab Bulletin Board
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (displayed in room)
- RS#06 3 thumbs from Historical Thumb Response Document (to be cut apart and positioned up, down, or sideways)
- RS#23 James Forten Quote (one copy for teacher and one copy for bulletin board)
- RS#24 Petition of 1779 (Transcript)
- RS#25 Petition of 1779 (Adapted)
- RS#42 Petition of 1779 Document Log Answer Key
- RS#26 Lord Dunmore’s Proclamation (Transcript)
- RS#27 Lord Dunmore’s Proclamation (Selected Paragraphs)
- RS#43 Lord Dunmore’s Proclamation Document Log Answer Key

For Students:

- History Lab notebook (from day one)
- RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log (one for each student)
- RS#23 James Forten Quote (one for each student or post)
- RS#25 Petition of 1779 (Adapted) (one for each student)
- RS#42 Petition of 1779 Document Log Answer Key (one for half the class)
- RS#27 Lord Dunmore’s Proclamation (Selected Paragraphs) (one for each student)
- RS#43 Lord Dunmore’s Proclamation Document Log Answer Key (one for half the class)

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab

Say: Well, historians, today we are continuing our investigation: “Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?” What have we learned so far?

Today we will analyze several African-American perspectives to help us answer the question.

Before Reading - Frame the History Lab:

Show RS# 23 James Forten Quote to the class and have students read the document. Question students to reveal the author's perspective.

- Why did James Forten say this? *He was about to be taken to Great Britain and did not want to go. He was afraid to be considered a traitor to America.*
- Evaluate Forten's decision not to go to Britain to get an education with the captain's son. *Some students might say that Forten should have thought about himself and taken advantage of the opportunity to get a good education, especially because educational opportunities for Blacks were very limited in America. Some students might think Forten was noble to stay in America and keep fighting for the colonies' cause.*
- What does this quote tell you about the African-American perspective in answering our overarching question? *Some African Americans were dedicated to the Patriot cause and helped fight against Great Britain to set the colonies free.*
- Do you think that all African Americans felt this way? *Some did but some African Americans might have taken the British side and others might have stayed neutral. Many slaves were not concerned with fighting for the white colonists' freedom, but, rather, for their own freedom from slavery.*

Mention: *Today, we will examine two more sources in order to better understand how African Americans felt about the white colonists' decision to revolt.*

Present RS#25 Petition of 1779 (Adapted) and RS#26 Lord Dunmore's Proclamation (Transcript) to the class. All students will need a copy of each document for the discussion. Hand out RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log.

Say: *You will think and work as a historian on your own. You will be given one of two different documents to closely read and analyze. You will need to use your historian strategies to analyze these documents. You will have time to analyze and complete your Historical Document Log on your own. Remember to include specific information from the text and a concluding statement. Then you will share with another classmate who has analyzed another primary source document. Then we will all discuss what we've learned about the African-American perspective.*

During Reading - Model the historical process by doing a close reading;

Have half the class perform a close reading and complete RS#09/#09M History Lab Document Log for one document, and have the other half of the class work on the other document.

After Reading - Continue to model aloud:

Small Group Interpretation Discussion: Have students pair off in groups so they can share the information from their document with other students who were unable to read it. It may be helpful to have groups of four, so you can have two students explain the same document. Remind students to take turns, speak clearly, listen carefully, and to feel free to ask questions.

Whole Group Interpretation Discussion:

Review the Historical Document Logs using the Petition of 1779 and Lord Dunmore's Proclamation answer keys.

Petition of 1779 by slaves of Fairfield County for the abolition of Slavery in Connecticut (Adapted) - Prime and Prince believed that the colonies should revolt against Great Britain because the cause of liberty was a noble cause. They admired the Patriots for fighting for their liberty. They were fighting for a similar cause in their petition. They wished to gain their freedom from the detestable practice and sin of slavery.

Do you think Prime and Prince's petition was effective in abolishing slavery? *Students' answers may vary, but in reality both houses rejected the petition. This petition was written in Connecticut, which abolished slavery in 1848 before the start of the Civil War. Even one petition by a slave, however, may have gotten people to think about taking action.*

Lord Dunmore's Proclamation (Selected Paragraphs) - Lord Dunmore, the Royal Governor of Virginia, wrote this proclamation to convince colonists to join the British army. He urged all men who were able to carry a weapon to join. He offered freedom to any slave or indentured servant who joined the Loyalist cause. Lord Dunmore proclaimed that anyone who did not support the British in this revolution was committing treason and was a traitor to their country, Great Britain. Lord Dunmore did not agree with the colonists' revolt and was building an army against them.

- How do you think the Patriots responded to Lord Dunmore's Proclamation? *Many slaveholders were upset because their slaves were running away to join the Loyalist army. George Washington, a slave owner himself, and members of the Second Continental Congress were hesitant to make a similar offer, but eventually needed more soldiers. Washington and Congress conceded and allowed African Americans to join in exchange for their freedom too.*

Give students the following completed answer keys for the documents they did not analyze for use in the final assessment.

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Wrap-Up Discussion: Post the documents on bulletin board with "thumbs" — thumbs up for the James Forten Quote and Petition of 1779, and thumbs down for Lord Dunmore's Proclamation.

Discuss the African-American perspectives and the ways in which the interpretations relate to each other. Look for commonalities and differences. Confirm historical facts and clarify the reasons behind these interpretations.

- Lord Dunmore does not want the colonies to revolt, whereas Prince and Prime do. They both have different motives for their decisions, but seek to further their own causes. Lord Dunmore offers slaves their freedom, which is ironic, since he was a slaveholder himself, so they can fight in his army and prevent the colonies from breaking away. Prince and Prime want the slaves freed to have a better life and to tie their quest for freedom to the colonies' quest for liberty from Great Britain.

Briefly engage the students in a concluding conversation about the progress they've made so far in answering the overarching question: Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?

Say: *Now that we have analyzed the white male, white female, Native-American, and African-American perspectives, you should have a solid understanding of the multiple perspectives involved in the decision to revolt against Great Britain.*

Collect Historical Document Logs.

Day Six: Debate

Students will synthesize multiple perspectives in order to develop and support an argument to answer the overarching question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?"

Materials:

- RS#44 Revolution History Lab PowerPoint 6
- History Lab Bulletin Board
- RS#04 Strategies Historians Use to Analyze Historical Documents (displayed in room)
- RS#28 Historical Debate Rubric

For Students:

- History Lab notebook
- RS#28 Historical Debate Rubric (one copy per student or group)
- Writing paper (one piece per student)
- Chart paper (one piece per group, usually 2 pieces total)
- Markers

Motivation - Initiate the History Lab: Address the overarching question. Have students synthesize the information gained during the History Lab to address the overarching question.

Begin: Historians, the time has come to take all of our evidence to answer our big question, "Should the colonists have revolted against Great Britain?" Let's take a look at our primary source documents and the perspectives that each one represents.

Call on students to briefly summarize each primary source and perspective.

Before Writing - Frame the History Lab:

Assess students' understanding of the historical content and the process used by historians.

State: As a historian, you are now going to demonstrate the new learning you have gained this week. We will hold a debate to answer our overarching question, "Should the colonists revolt against Great Britain?" Considering all the perspectives we have analyzed and explored this week, take a minute to reflect on each one to form your own opinion. Whether you say yes or no, write down your three strongest points or pieces of evidence that support your thinking. You should look over your historical document logs to find specific evidence from the many perspectives we have examined.

During Writing: Model the historical process by doing a close reading.

Give students 5-10 minutes to complete this task.

After Writing - Continue to model aloud:

Continue: Now is the time to get ready for our historical debate. Historians often disagree about past events, even when presented with the same historical documents. You will get into teams with the other historians who share your interpretation.

Distribute the rubric and review it together.

Say: You should be sure to address your topic and support your opinion with facts. Try to persuade the other students to understand your point of view by making a clear and convincing argument. Each team member will participate in the debate, whether speaking or working with the team to come up with the arguments for your side.

We are following the agenda below the rubric. First you will record your ideas on chart paper to make an electrifying opening statement. You need to really grab your audience and convince them that your position is truth. The Pros will open first followed by the Cons. Neither side is allowed to interrupt the other. Then, you will have time to prepare a rebuttal. A rebuttal is your chance to respond to opinions or evidence the opposing side is stating. It would be a good idea to assign some of the students in your group to be secretaries and record statements that the opposing side is making so you can refute them. After the rebuttals, each team will have a chance to form its closing argument. In the closing arguments, you will summarize your points. Emphasize your most persuasive points and be convincing to your audience. This is also a chance for you to refute the rebuttal, which could be fun!

Divide the students into two groups, based on a show of hands, one for those who are in favor of the colonists revolting (the Pros), and the other for those who do not think the colonists should revolt (the Cons). Monitor students working.

Ready, set, debate!

Summary - Assessment (optional)

Conclude: *Well, historians, this week we have learned how to analyze primary source documents in order to answer a question. That certainly was a very heated debate. Have any of your minds been changed?* Most students will say no, but even people constantly disagree but as citizens of this country we have the opportunity to participate in public debates, vote, write letters to the newspaper, or contact their representatives.

We learned that you don't just stop after reading one person's opinion. You need to look at a variety of perspectives to get the big picture before you form your opinion. And even when you do form your opinion, you need to stay in conversation with other people and respectfully listen to what other people have to say.

References

Books

- Berkin, Carol. *Revolutionary Mothers: Women in the Struggle for America's Independence*. New York: Vintage Books, 2006.
- Kaplan, Sidney and Emma Nogrady Kaplan. *The Black Presence in the Era of the American Revolution*, revised ed. Amherst, MA: University of Massachusetts, 1989.
- Nash, Gary B.. *The Unknown American Revolution: The Unruly Birth of Democracy and the Struggle to Create America*. New York: Penguin Books, 2005.
- Raphael, Ray. *A People's History of the American Revolution: How Common People Shaped the Fight for Independence*. A New Press People's History, ed. Howard Zinn. New York: New Press, 2001.

Online Resources

- Adams, Abigail. "Letter from Abigail Adams to John Adams , 31 March - 5 April 1776." Adams Family Papers an Electronic Archive. Massachusetts Historical Society. Available from www.masshist.org/digitaladams/aea/cfm/doc.cfm?id=L17760331aa. Accessed 7 August 2012.
- "Battle of Bunkers Hill." AMERICANREVOLUTION.ORG. Available from <http://www.americanrevolution.org/bunksm.html>. Accessed 29 June 2011.
- Brant, Joseph. "The Disturbances in America Give Great Trouble to All Our Nations: Mohawk Joseph Brant Comes to London to See the King, 1776." History Matters: The U.S. Survey Course on the Web. Many Pasts. Available from <http://historymatters.gmu.edu/d/8071>. Accessed 29 June 2011.
- Chalmers, James. *Plain Truth*. Open Library. Available from http://openlibrary.org/works/OL15254378W/Plain_truth_addressed_to_the_inhabitants_of_America_containing_remarks_on_a_late_pamphlet_intituled_Common_sense. [sic] Accessed 28 June 2011.
- "Deborah Champion: American Patriot." History of American Women. 2 April 2009. Available from <http://www.womenhistoryblog.com/2009/04/deborah-champion.html>. Accessed 9 August 2012.
- "The Delaware Indians." Legends of Kansas: History, Tales, and Destinations in the land of Ahs. Available from <http://www.legendsofkansas.com/delawareindians.html>. Accessed 30 June 2012.
- "The Edenton 'Tea Party'." Learn NC. University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Available from <http://www.learnnc.org/lp/editions/nchist-revolution/4234>. Accessed 9 August 2012.
- "George III, King of Great Britain &c." Library of Congress. Available from <http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/cph.3a45431/>. Accessed 12 August 2012.
- "George Washington, First President of the United States." Library of Congress. Available from <http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/cph.3a09915/>. Accessed 9 August 2012.
- "James Forten." Gilder Lehrman history online. Available from <http://www.digitalhistory.uh.edu/historyonline/abolitionists3.html>. Accessed 12 December 2012.
- "Lord Dunmore's Proclamation." Black Loyalists: Our History, Our People. Canada's Digital Collection Program. Available from <http://www.blackloyalist.com/canadiandigitalcollection/documents/official/dunmore.htm>. Accessed 10 August 2012.
- Paine, Thomas. *Common Sense*. Project Gutenberg. Available from <http://www.gutenberg.org/files/147/147-h/147-h.htm>. Accessed 9 August 2012.
- "Petition of 1779 by Slaves of Fairfield County for the Abolition of Slavery in Connecticut." World History Archives. The History of Slavery in the United States. Available from <http://www.hartford-hwp.com/archives/45a/021.html>. Accessed 8 August 2012.
- "A Society of Patriotic Ladies, at Edenton in North Carolina." Library of Congress. Available from <http://www.loc.gov/pictures/resource/ppmsca.19468/>. Accessed 9 August 2012.
- "Temple's Diary: A Tale of Benjamin Franklin's Family in the Days Leading up to the American Revolution." 23 June 1775. Independence Hall Association, 1999. Available from http://www.ushistory.org/franklin/temple/part3_062375.htm. Accessed 29 June 2011.
- "Treaty with the Delawares (1778) (Transcript)." Ohio History Central. Available from <http://www.ohiohistorycentral.org/entry.php?rec=441>. Accessed 30 June 2011.
- Vanderlyn, John. "The Death of Jane McCrea." Digital image. The Athenaeum. Available from <http://www.the-athenaeum.org/art/full.php?ID=15812>. 29 June 2011.
- Zweig, Wendy. "Debate Rubric." The Big Rainforest Debate: A Webquest by Wendy Zweig. Available from <http://www2.lhric.org/ertc/Wendy/Wzrubric.htm>. Accessed 9 August 2012.